Creative and expressive arts in practicum supervision: perceptions and experiences of counselor educators

Oksoon Lee

Follow this and additional works at: https://huskiecommons.lib.niu.edu/allgraduate-thesesdissertations

Recommended Citation
https://huskiecommons.lib.niu.edu/allgraduate-thesesdissertations/2003

This Dissertation/Thesis is brought to you for free and open access by the Graduate Research & Artistry at Huskie Commons. It has been accepted for inclusion in Graduate Research Theses & Dissertations by an authorized administrator of Huskie Commons. For more information, please contact jschumacher@niu.edu.
ABSTRACT

CREATIVE AND EXPRESSIVE ARTS IN PRACTICUM SUPERVISION: PERCEPTIONS AND EXPERIENCES OF COUNSELOR EDUCATORS

Oksoon Lee, Ph.D.
Department of Counseling, Adult and Higher Education
Northern Illinois University, 2018
Scott A. Wickman, Director

Counseling practicums are vital in counselor education and a significant transitional period from a student to a counselor. Practicum provides for the application of theory and counseling skills that students have learned during the course work. It is also memorable moment to meet a real client for the first time. Practicum supervisees have to prove their counseling skills and capacities as professional counselors. However, in this stage, practicum supervisees experience high level of anxiety, self-doubt and low self-efficacy that keeps them from being fully present with and therapeutically responding to their clients. Creative/expressive arts have been utilized in counselor education as well as counseling to reduce those barriers and optimize supervisees’ professional growth by providing creative non-verbal methods to build safe and trusting supervisory relationships, increase self-awareness, and reduce fear and resistance.

This qualitative research explored how counselor educators have experienced and perceived using creative/expressive arts in practicum supervision. Seven participants were recruited through reputational and snowball sampling. Six participants held a Ph.D. in counselor education or closely related fields. All participants had counseling related licensures and practicum teaching and/or practicum supervision experience using creative/expressive arts for at least three years as well as publications and/or presentations about creative/expressive art
supervision. The participants engaged in 60-90-minute interviews and reviewed all transcripts and findings to verify the accuracy and trustworthiness. N-Vivo 11 was used to analyze the data. Findings revealed four categories of themes: creative intervention, the decision-making process, the supervisory process, and professional growth. The study offers insights into why and how counselor educators and clinical supervisors utilized creative/expressive arts to optimize their practicum supervisees’ professional growth. Implications for counselor educators, clinical supervisors, counselors-in-training, and counseling programs are offered. Future directions for research are also discussed.
CREATIVE AND EXPRESSIVE ARTS IN PRACTICUM SUPERVISION:
PERCEPTIONS AND EXPERIENCES OF COUNSELOR EDUCATORS

BY

OKSOON LEE
©2018 Oksoon Lee

A DISSERTATION SUBMITTED TO THE GRADUATE SCHOOL
IN PARTIAL FULFILLMENT OF THE REQUIREMENTS
FOR THE DEGREE
DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY

DEPARTMENT OF COUNSELING, ADULT AND HIGHER EDUCATION

Dissertation Director:
Scott A. Wickman
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

My nine-year doctoral journey was like an adventurous fantasy movie making people laugh and cry all the time. In the movie, people cannot guess anything. My doctoral journey has been pretty tough, but it helped me grow personally and professionally in the entire process. None of this would have been possible without my committee, my family and friends, great faculty who raised me as a counselor educator and peers who learned and grew together at NIU.

First, I would like to thank my committee members: Dr. Scott A. Wickman, Dr. Toni R. Tollerud, and Dr. Cynthia Campbell. To my dissertation chair Dr. Wickman. You constantly encouraged me and challenged me to grow. I know you spent so much time reading my dissertation and giving me feedback. You worked for me even during weekends. You always opened the door and welcomed me. You taught me without giving an immediate answer. It was powerful, and I love it. I would like to use your strategies for my future students and supervisees. Thanks for your patience Scott!

To Dr. Tollerud, thank you so much for helping me even after retirement. As a woman, I admire you. As a counselor educator, I admire you more. I learned a lot from your class, feedback, supervision, and relationship. I am honored to have had you on my committee. You are strong, but kind, generous, and a human of humans. I have never said that, but you will be my mentor in my mind for a long time; you are my role model as a woman and as a counselor educator.
To Dr. Cynthia Campbell, thank you for teaching me all you know about methodology. You gently encouraged me to be aware of my biases and helped me be to objective as a researcher. My research findings and analysis are stronger because of your guidance. More importantly, my perspectives of working with students are stronger because of your guidance.

To my previous advisor, Dr. Charles E. Myers, thank you so much for your endless support. Honestly, it was shocking when I heard that you were leaving NIU during my dissertation journey, but you were always there with me in spirit during the whole process – no matter where you were. I still remember the day we met for the first time in front of the Graham Hall. You came out to welcome me with a big smile. I thank you from that day to now.

To Ms. Gail Jacky, thank you so much for your endless support by reading writing line by line, page to page every Friday afternoon. You truly understood how challenging writing dissertation with a foreign language was and encouraged me to finish it. You really taught me how to write without fear. The NIU University Writing Center has become a memorable place in my life and I will miss the time working with you every week. I am lucky to have met you in my life. I feel like you are my friend now.

To my mother, I cannot imagine how you felt when I was leaving for America with a young daughter right after my late-husband’s funeral. You knew it would be a long and lonely journey. Also, you knew I would finally make it. You were right. I stood up and overcame all the barriers, and I am here. You taught me how to be strong and endure all the hurdles of life.

To my daughter, my BFF, Suji. Thank you so much for being my precious daughter. You were the only reason I had to live when your daddy suddenly passed away due to heart attack during my doctoral program. When I could not find any reason to breathe, you always said, “Mom, please finish your dissertation and graduate, then we can go to South Korea to see
grandma, your mother. She is waiting for you.” Thanks for reminding me of my purpose and direction.

Lastly, to my seven participants, thank you so much for openly sharing your personal and professional stories. I could not have completed this study without you. All of you willingly participated in supporting a young researcher and contributing to the field of counselor education although you all have extremely complicated schedules. I deeply appreciate all of you. I learned a lot from you about how to be a good researcher and a good counselor educator through the conversations and relationships.
DEDICATION

This dissertation is dedicated to my mother, Gapsun Lee.

She gave me birth, raised me for 45 years, and has waited for me for nine years

praying every day while I have been in the U.S. for the doctoral journey.

I love you mom. This is for you!
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>LIST OF TABLES</td>
<td>xiv</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LIST OF APPENDICES</td>
<td>xv</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. INTERODUCTION</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Background</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CACREP Requirements</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vulnerability of Practicum Counselors</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Practicum Supervision</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Expressive Arts in Supervision</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Statement of the Problem</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rationale for Using Creative/Expressive Arts</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Purpose of the Study</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Research Questions</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Definitions of Key Terms</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Summary</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. LITERATURE REVIEW</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Clinical Supervision</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Roles of Supervisor</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quality of Supervision</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter</td>
<td>Page</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------</td>
<td>------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Supervisory Relationship</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Practicum Supervision</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CACREP Requirements for Counseling Practicum</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student Counselor Development</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Practicum Courses</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CACREP Requirements for Practicum Supervisor</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Creative/Expressive Arts in Clinical Practice</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What is Creative/Expressive Art?</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neuroscience in Counseling and Counselor Education</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Creative/Expressive Arts in Counseling</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Using Creative/Expressive Arts in Clinical Practice</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Creative/Expressive Art in Supervision</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Why Creative/Expressive Arts in Supervision?</td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Arts Activities in Supervision</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Play Therapy Techniques in Supervision</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mandala Drawing in Supervision</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mindfulness</td>
<td>53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bibliotherapy in Supervision</td>
<td>54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reflective Journaling in Supervision</td>
<td>55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Psychodrama in Supervision</td>
<td>56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Music &amp; Movement in Supervision</td>
<td>56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter</td>
<td>Page</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------</td>
<td>------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Summary</td>
<td>57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. METHODOLOGY</td>
<td>59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rationale for Using Grounded Theory</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Participants</td>
<td>62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CACREP Requirements for Practicum Supervisor</td>
<td>62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Criteria of Recruitment</td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sampling Methods</td>
<td>64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Data Collection Procedures</td>
<td>65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interview Guide</td>
<td>66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Trustworthiness</td>
<td>69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Data Saturation</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Data Analysis</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Coding Process</td>
<td>71</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N-Vivo Software</td>
<td>71</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Analytical Memos</td>
<td>72</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Member Checks</td>
<td>72</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. RESULTS</td>
<td>73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Participants</td>
<td>74</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Participant Biographies</td>
<td>76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alex</td>
<td>77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ann</td>
<td>77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter</td>
<td>Page</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------</td>
<td>------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lisa</td>
<td>78</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mike</td>
<td>78</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sarah</td>
<td>79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emily</td>
<td>79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jenny</td>
<td>79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Categories of Themes</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Category #1: Creative Interventions</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Visual Arts</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Music</td>
<td>81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Journal Writing</td>
<td>82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Play and Sand Tray</td>
<td>82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Category #2: Decision-Making Process</td>
<td>83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Integrative Supervision Models/Theories</td>
<td>84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ethical Considerations</td>
<td>85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Designing Practicum Class with Creative/Expressive Arts</td>
<td>86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Changes over Semester</td>
<td>86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Suggestions for Using Creative/Expressive Arts in Practicum Supervision</td>
<td>88</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Category #3: Supervisory Process</td>
<td>94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Supervisory Relationships from Practicum Memories</td>
<td>94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Practicum Supervisors’ Roles</td>
<td>96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher Role</td>
<td>96</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Chapter          Page

Counselor Role ........................................................................................................................................... 98
Gatekeeper Role ........................................................................................................................................... 99
Establishing a Trusting Relationship and Safe Environment ................................................................. 100
Category #4: Professional Growth ........................................................................................................... 105
Developing Self-Awareness for Growth ....................................................................................................... 105
Self-Care and Professional Growth ........................................................................................................... 108
Perceived Students’ Experience of Growth ................................................................................................. 108
Growing in Group: Trust the Process ........................................................................................................ 109
Embrace Different Cultures: Beyond Culture and Language .................................................................... 110
Supervisors’ Learning Experience and Growth ........................................................................................ 111
Summary ...................................................................................................................................................... 111

5. DISCUSSION ............................................................................................................................................. 114
Creative Interventions ............................................................................................................................... 115
Visual Arts ................................................................................................................................................... 117
Imagery ......................................................................................................................................................... 118
Music ............................................................................................................................................................ 119
Reflective Journal Writing .......................................................................................................................... 120
Sand Tray and Play Therapy Approach ..................................................................................................... 121
Decision-Making Process ............................................................................................................................ 123
Unique Supervisee Needs ............................................................................................................................ 124
Changes over Semester ............................................................................................................................... 126
Chapter 1: Implications .................................................................................................................. 150

Counselor Educators ................................................................................................................. 150

Give Supervisees Options ....................................................................................................... 151

Ask Yourself Why ..................................................................................................................... 151

Feeling Safe to Express ........................................................................................................... 152

Be Flexible and Use Limited Time Productively ..................................................................... 152

Every Supervisee Is Multicultural ............................................................................................ 153

Be Creative in Using Resources ............................................................................................... 153

Gatekeeper vs. Supervisor ....................................................................................................... 154

Clinical Supervisors .................................................................................................................. 155

Be Brave Enough to Process .................................................................................................... 155

Not Looking for Artistic Talent ............................................................................................... 155

Practice Interventions on Self Prior to Using with Supervisees ............................................. 156

Self-Reflection on Motivation ................................................................................................. 156

Continuing Professional Growth ............................................................................................. 157

Counselors-In-Training ............................................................................................................. 157

Counselor Education Program ................................................................................................ 158

Future Research Recommendation .......................................................................................... 159

Creative/Expressive Arts for 16-Week Semester Practicum Supervision .................................. 159

Creative/Expressive Arts for Supervisees with Different Cultures .......................................... 160

Creative/Expressive Arts for Self-Supervision ......................................................................... 160
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Creative/expressive Arts Techniques and Supervisees’ Developmental Level</td>
<td>161</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Creative/Expressive Arts for Supervisees with Different Culture and Language</td>
<td>162</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Researcher Reflection</td>
<td>162</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conclusion</td>
<td>165</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>REFERENCES</td>
<td>167</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>APPENDICES</td>
<td>178</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# LIST OF TABLES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4.1. Participant Demographics</td>
<td>75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2. Participant Credentials</td>
<td>76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3. Four Categories of Themes</td>
<td>113</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# LIST OF APPENDICES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Appendix</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A. INFORMED CONSENT FORM</td>
<td>178</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. DEMOGRAPHIC FORM</td>
<td>181</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. INTERVIEW QUESTIONS</td>
<td>183</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D. LETTER OF INFORMATION</td>
<td>186</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E. IRB LETTER</td>
<td>189</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CHAPTER 1
INTRODUCTION

If someone who wants to be a counselor asks for a recommendation of a good university with an excellent counselor education program, what would the answer be? This question is difficult and requires a careful answer. Dye (1994) pointed out that practicum experiences differ greatly in how a program facilitates students’ professional growth. DeLorge Minges (2012) also asserted that clinical settings and experiences vary depending on the university and the counseling program in which students are enrolled. If this is true, how do potential students distinguish quality levels among counselor education programs? There are many criteria from which to choose, but the most important criterion is how well prepared students are for practicum at the end of course work.

Background

Practicum is a clinical experience done under supervision during which students apply counseling knowledge and skills gained from coursework to counseling practice with diverse clients (Bernard & Goodyear, 2009). In many counseling programs, practicum starts after students have completed most of their course work (Neufeldt, 1994). During practicum, a significant amount of student learning and development takes place. Therefore, optimizing counselor development by facilitating counseling students’ professional growth is vital for counselor education programs (Collison, 1994; Pate, 1994).
CACREP Requirements

The Council for Accreditation of Counseling and Related Educational Programs (CACREP) is an independent agency recognized by the Council for Higher Education Accreditation. CACREP accredits master’s and doctoral degree programs in counseling and its specialties that are offered by colleges and universities in the United States and throughout the world.

CACREP Accreditation provides recognition that the content and quality of the program has been evaluated and meets standards set by the profession. The student, as a consumer, can be assured that appropriate knowledge and skill areas are included and that the program is stable, professionally and financially (2016 CACREP Standards).

CACREP stated that practicum is a critical component in counselor education. Practicum is the first opportunity to assess the students’ ability to apply the knowledge and skills obtained from their coursework with clients in clinical settings (www.cacrep.org). 2016 CACREP Standards requires “professional practice, which includes practicum and internship, provides for the application of theory and the development of counseling skills under supervision. These experiences will provide opportunities for students to counsel clients who represent the ethnic and demographic diversity of their community.” (p.13). 2016 CACREP Standards require counseling students to

1. Complete supervised counseling practicum experiences that total a minimum of 100 clock hours over a full academic term that is a minimum of 10 weeks;
2. Complete at least 40 clock hours of direct service with actual clients that contributes to the development of counseling skills;
3. Have weekly interaction with supervisors that averages one hour per week of individual and/or triadic supervision throughout the practicum by (1) a counselor education program faculty member, (2) a student supervisor who is under the
supervision of a counselor education program faculty member, or (3) a site supervisor who is working in consultation on a regular schedule with a counselor education program faculty member in accordance with the supervision agreement; and

4. Participate in an average of one and a half hours per week of group supervision on a regular schedule throughout the practicum. Group supervision must be provided by a counselor education program faculty member or a student supervisor who is under the supervision of a counselor education program faculty member (ACES Institute, n.d.).

Vulnerability of Practicum Counselors

Purswell and Stulmakers (2015) developed the Life-Span Developmental Model, which is a supervision model. Counselor development conceptualizes counseling as a process that continues for a lifetime. Purswell and Stulmakers described three initial stages of novice development and explained how counselors develop from beginning students to advanced students, to novice professionals.

Most beginning practicum students are vulnerable and experience high levels of anxiety, fear, and confusion (Jordan & Kelly, 2011; Yager & Beck, 1981). According to Yager and Beck (1981), the fears of novice counselors mainly come from irrational beliefs concerning the perfect response, academic course work that seems to equate psychological illness with poor counseling skills, uncertainty about necessary skills, and anxiety engendered by the change process.

Jordan and Kelly (2011) examined the worries of counseling students in their initial clinical practicum/internship and analyzed three worry categories: competence, supervision, and preparation. Despite a high level of motivation, practicum students tended to worry about their
lack of knowledge, self-awareness, theories and skills, especially when they realize that they will work with real clients with real hurt and suffering. They become aware of the fact that they no longer are practicing counseling skills in the safety of the classroom, but are actually functioning as beginning counselors, with many expectations and responsibilities placed on them by themselves and by clients and supervisors.

In addition, various critical incidents can have lasting influences on practicum counselors’ perceptions of the therapeutic process, their beliefs about themselves as counselors, and their understanding of counseling as a profession (Heppner & Roehlke, 1984; Howard, Inman, & Altman, 2006; Morrissette, 1996; Sank & Prout, 1978; Skovholt & McCarthy, 1988). Heppner and Roehlke (1984) described representing major categories of critical incidents for beginning counselor supervisees: self-awareness, professional development, competency, and personal issues. Morrissette (1996) also discussed critical incidents that practicum students experience in counselor development, such as emotional over-involvement, sexual attraction in counseling, countertransference, anxiety of competency, conflicts with supervisors and clients, and vicarious traumatization. However, more important are the negative effects of practicum anxiety caused by worries and critical incidents. Therefore, counselor educators need to know how to release practicum anxiety for successful supervision and counseling.

**Practicum Supervision**

Supervision is an intervention provided by a more senior member of a profession to a more junior member of that same profession. This relationship is evaluative, extends over time, and has the simultaneous purpose of enhancing the professional functioning of the more junior
person(s); monitoring the quality of professional services offered to the clients that she, he, or they see; and serving as a gatekeeper for those who are to enter the particular profession (Bernard & Goodyear, 2009). Supervisors have two main responsibilities: to facilitate the professional growth of the supervisee and to take on the role of gatekeeper, protecting current and future clients and supervisees (Bernard & Goodyear, 2009). As a facilitator and gatekeeper in counselor education, supervisors are responsible for creating a safe environment for supervisees to express the powerful emotions they experience in sessions, allowing for greater learning and exploration for the supervisee (Edwards, 2010). Supervisors need to choose interventions to meet the supervisees’ needs (2016 CACREP Standard) and optimize their professional growth. The counseling profession requires specific education and training to equip counselor trainees with necessary knowledge and skills (Howard, Inman, & Altman, 2006).

Expressive Arts in Supervision

Supervision methods include didactic/triadic meetings, feedback and evaluation, group discussion of cases and issues, observation of the supervisor as a model, and peer observation (Bernard & Goodyear, 2009). Expressive/creative arts can be incorporated into any of the above methods and can be a means of promoting supervisee development (Gass & Gillis, 2010; Kees & Leech, 2002; Rubin & Gil, 2008). Expressive arts in supervision is the use of music, stories, movement, poetry or prose, role-play or psychodrama, art, guided imagery, or play to help trainees develop reflective skills (Wilkins, 1995); express thoughts and feelings (Knill, Levine & Levine, 2005; Lahad, 2000); develop new perspectives (Gladding, 2005); increase communication between trainees and supervisors (Fall & Sutton, 2003); create success and
cohesion (Neswald-McCalip, Sather, Strati, & Dineen, 2003); develop self-understanding (Lett, 1995); and foster creative skills (Lahad, 2000). Using expressive arts provides counselor educators greater opportunities for understanding humans, usually clients, beyond what can be verbalized (Purswell & Stulmakers, 2015; Rossi, 2010).

Experiential creative arts techniques in supervision are designed to help supervisees develop meaning, increase learning, and enhance supervision (Deaver & Shiflett, 2011). Expressive arts represent a supervision modality that uses a primarily creative and nonverbal method to facilitate deeper underlying processes. Expressive arts do not involve critical thinking or problem-solving, but they are a way to connect with unconscious or implicit experiences or feelings that someone might otherwise struggle to reach. Therefore, expressive arts can be a means of promoting supervisee development with less fear and resistance (Gass & Gillis, 2010; Kees & Leech, 2002; Purswell & Stulmaker, 2015; Rubin & Gil, 2008). According to Deaver and Shiflett (2011), expressive arts facilitate student learning because art itself is a meaning-making process. Expressive arts increase supervisees’ capacity for reflection in self-awareness, while reducing supervisee stress. Kiesler (1988) considered nonverbal behavior as the language of emotions in relationships. Well-designed and purposeful use of nonverbal interventions including expressive arts, experiential activities and playful interventions within supervision may assist in illuminating the dynamics and processes of the supervisory relationship (Drewes & Mullen, 2008). Therefore, using expressive arts could be a way to help supervisees express themselves more, supervisors understand supervisees better, and increase the effectiveness of applying counseling knowledge and skills through reduced anxiety.
Counselor supervision seeks to foster a greater sense of self-awareness among counselors-in-training (Bernard & Goodyear, 2009; Bratton, Ceballos, & Sheely, 2008). Degges-White and Davis (2017) also demonstrated that the use of expressive arts in counseling is an effective way to create a deeper level of meaning in counselor and client interactions. Wilkins (1995) proposed a creative therapies model of supervision with counselors as a way to explore process, conceptualization, and personalization issues. Bratton et al. (2008) stated that expressive arts in supervision could foster self-awareness, enhance client conceptualization, encourage exploration, and help supervisees clarify their theoretical framework. Expressive art supervision has the potential to help supervisees express thoughts, feelings, and experiences they may not be able to fully verbalize (Bratton, Ray, & Landreth, 2008; Bratton et al., 2008). Supervisees are also able to utilize media and experience processes that can be used with clients of all ages (Bratton et al., 2008). They may learn effective interpersonal communication strategies in their own supervision sessions (Pearson, 2004).

Statement of the Problem

Practicum counselors have unique needs within counselor education and supervision. Practicum counselors inevitably experience high levels of vulnerability through increased anxiety, fear, and confusion due to their uncertainty about their competency (Minges, 2014; Rønnessad & Skovholt, 1993, 2003; Yager & Beck, 1981). Although that part of professional development is common, counselor educators and supervisors must find ways to minimize these fears because highly anxious students are less effective in counseling clients (Yager & Beck, 1981). Moreover, anxious counselors are more likely to be defensive when interacting with
supervisors and clients; that is practicum counselors tend to be defensive to avoid vulnerability with supervisors and have difficulty experiencing empathy with their clients (Yager & Beck, 1981), which might negatively influence supervisory relationships and supervision productivity.

Additionally, beginning therapists tend to present the Impostor Syndrome (Bischoff, 1997; Gibson-Beverly & Schwartz, 2008), originally recognized by Clance and Imes (1978), which describes individuals who are unable to a) internalize accomplishments, b) have a fear of failure, and c) attribute success to external factors rather than internal characteristics (Clance & Imes, 1978; King & Cooley, 1995; Gibson-Beverly & Schwartz, 2008). Many beginning counselors do not view their accomplishments because of their own competence; instead they attribute any counseling success to external factors, such as luck and chance (Gibson-Beverly & Schwartz, 2008). They often express “I was lucky,” “I was in the right place at the right time,” “I really didn’t do as well as it seems,” or “I had a lot of help” when they are successful in sessions (Reis, 2002).

Rationale for Using Creative/Expressive Arts

In recent years, the use of expressive arts in counseling supervision has emerged as a viable means for mitigating fear and anxiety in practicum (Bratton, Ceballos, & Sheely, 2008; Power, 2013). Various creative techniques have been explored in the supervision of counselors and other helping professionals (Schuck, 2011; Neswald-McCalip, Sather, Strati, & Dineen, 2003; Rossi, 2010; Purswell & Stulmaker, 2015; Gass & Gillis, 2010; Kees & Leech, 2002; Rubin & Gil, 2008). As a means of promoting supervisee development, Deaver and Shiflett (2011) asserted that art facilitates learning because art itself is a meaning-making process that
can a) instill the capacity for reflection in supervisees; b) increase supervisee self-awareness, including case conceptualization skills and processing of countertransference; and c) reduce supervisee stress and anxiety.

Gladding (2011) identified the relevance of using creative arts in counseling in that art a) is a way in which people connect their minds and bodies; b) requires action and energy and therefore gets individuals moving; c) creates a visual representation of thoughts, feelings, and goals; d) is creative like counseling; e) may help individuals establish a new sense of self; f) moves the abstract to concrete; g) provides insight; and h) is centered on socialization and cooperation.

The same rationale applies to the supervision process. Just like in the counseling process, the aforementioned activities may help supervisees generate thoughts about a) their experiences, both personal and professional, and b) their clients. Several researchers (Carson & Baker, 2004; Gladding, 1998, 2008, 2011; Ray, Perking, & Odem, 2004; Rogers, 1993) have explored the use of creative arts in counseling, and the use of creative processes in supervision is frequently studied in counselor education and supervision (Bratton, Ceballos, & Sheely, 2008; Deaver & Shiflett, 2011; Dunbar, 2011; Koltz, 2008; McNichols, 2010; O’Brien, 2006/2007; Schuck & Wood, 2011).

In sum, much evidence-based research has demonstrated that using expressive arts is an effective way to help supervisees reduce their anxiety, increase self-reflection, and increase self-awareness, including better understanding of countertransference and case conceptualization. A number of researchers have explored supervisees’ experiences and perceptions of using expressive arts in supervision with positive results (Fall & Sutton, 2003; Purswell & Stulmaker,
however, little research attention has been given to the population of beginning counselors in practicum supervision, when practicum students first apply their counseling knowledge and skills to working with clients in real practice. In the current study, I explored how counselor educators utilized creative/expressive arts to empower their practicum students and optimize their professional growth.

Purpose of the Study

The purpose of this study was to explore counselor educators’ perceptions and experiences using creative/expressive arts in practicum supervision. Specifically, I first examined how supervisors facilitated practicum counselors’ professional growth using creative/expressive arts. Second, I identified their processes of practicum supervision when utilizing creative/expressive arts. Third, I explored potential factors of creative/expressive arts attributed to the facilitation of practicum counselors’ growth by analyzing counselor educators’ experiences. Finally, I investigated supervisors’ perceptions of using creative/expressive arts for practicum students’ personal and professional growth.

Research Questions

To achieve the purpose of this study, one overarching research question and four sub-questions were used. The overarching research question is “What do counselor educators perceive and experience of using creative/expressive arts in practicum supervision?” The sub-questions are as follows:
1. What creative/expressive art techniques do counselor educators use in supervision for practicum students?

2. What is the decision-making process for educators using creative/expressive arts in supervision?

3. How do counselor educators perceive the supervisory process as a result of using creative/expressive arts?

4. How does incorporating creative/expressive arts into supervision affect practicum students’ growth?

This study sought to demonstrate that using expressive arts is an effective way to help supervisees reduce their anxiety, increase self-reflection, and increase self-awareness. Most research about expressive art supervision has explored supervisees’ experiences and perceptions of using expressive arts in clinical supervision with positive results, but they were not specifically about practicum supervision. Also, little research attention has been given to the population of supervisors using creative/expressive arts for practicum supervision. Therefore, this study explored the perceptions and experience of supervisors while using creative/expressive arts in practicum supervision to identify more ways to empower practicum students and enhance their professional growth.

Definitions of Key Terms

The following terms and abbreviations were used throughout the current study.

CACREP-Accredited Programs: A counselor education program meeting CACREP standards.

Council for the Accreditation of Counseling and Related Educational Programs (CACREP): An independent agency recognized by the Council for Higher Education Accreditation to accredit
master’s degree programs in career counseling; college counseling; community counseling; gerontological counseling; marital, couple, and family counseling; mental health counseling; school counseling; student affairs; and doctoral degree programs in counselor education and supervision (CACREP, 2015).

Counseling: According to the ACA 20/20 Vision Statement, counseling is a professional relationship that empowers diverse individuals, families, and groups to accomplish mental health, wellness, education, and career goals.

Counselor Education Programs: A programs training students to identity as professional counselor.

Counselor educator: Counselor education program faculty members who have a) relevant experience, b) professional credentials, and c) counseling supervision training and experience (ACES, 2015). Counselor educators are responsible for developing, implementing, and supervising educational programs and are skilled as teachers and practitioners. They are knowledgeable regarding the ethical, legal, and regulatory aspects of the profession; are skilled in applying that knowledge; and make students and supervisees aware of their responsibilities. Whether in traditional, hybrid, and/or online formats, counselor educators conduct counselor education and training programs in an ethical manner and serve as role models for professional behavior (ACA, 2014). According to the CACREP 2016 standards, any core faculty member in a counselor education program, must have graduated from a CACREP-accredited doctoral program in Counselor Education and Supervision (CACREP, 2015),
Counselor: Trained professionals who have graduated from counselor education programs such as CACREP-accredited or equivalent programs practicing in a mental health service delivery setting such as an agency or non-profit organization (Doroff, 2012).

Creative/expressive arts: Arts including the visual arts, movement, drama, music, writing and other creative processes to foster deep personal growth and community development (International Expressive Arts Therapy Association, 2012). In this study, creative and expressive were combined because expressive arts are also referred to as creative arts or the integrated arts. In clinical practice, the common modalities that an expressive arts therapist uses are music therapy, art therapy, dance/movement therapy, drama therapy, bibliotherapy, play therapy, and sand tray therapy (Pappas, 2014).

Creativity: The quality of being innovative; the ability to create; the ability to make new things or think in a new way (Power, 2013).

Graduates of CACREP-accredited programs are prepared for careers in mental health, human services, education, private practice, government, military, business, and industry. Entry-level program graduates are prepared as counseling practitioners and for respective credentials (e.g., licensure, certification) in their specialty area. Doctoral-level graduates are prepared for counselor education, supervision, and practice (CACREP, 2015).

Practicum student: A master’s student in practicum at the end of course work of a counseling program.

Practicum: A supervised clinical experience that provides for the application of theory and the development of counseling skills under supervision. These experiences provide opportunities for
students to counsel clients who represent the ethnic and demographic diversity of their community. Practicum is completed prior to internship (CACREP, 2015).

**Supervision:** Intervention by a senior member of a profession with junior members or students of that same profession to enhance supervisees’ functioning, monitor service quality, and serve as a gatekeeper for the profession (Bernard & Goodyear, 2009).

**Supervisor:** A senior counseling professional responsible for monitoring interventions and development of a junior counselor or student (Bernard & Goodyear, 2009).

**Summary**

In conclusion, practicum counselors face a transforming moment in professional development from student to counselor. During practicum, students are emotionally and professionally vulnerable. Research has found entry-level professionals show high levels of anxiety and fear, low self-competency, and experience the Impostor Syndrome. CACREP (2016) requires counselor educators to recognize supervisees’ unique needs and utilize appropriate supervision strategies to meet those needs. In recent years, various expressive arts have been utilized in counselor education and supervision to reduce supervisee anxiety and fear, increase self-awareness and self-reflection, and encourage supervisee self-expression. The current study investigated how counselor educators utilized creative/expressive arts to empower vulnerable practicum students and facilitate their professional growth. This study also explored current supervisors’ experiences, views, and suggestions for using creative/expressive arts for practicum supervision.
CHAPTER 2
LITERATURE REVIEW

This chapter explores the professional literature on clinical supervision as well as creative/expressive arts, creative/expressive arts in therapy, and creative/expressive arts in counselor supervision. Therefore, literature on creative/expressive art supervision was explored. This chapter includes clinical supervision, practicum supervision, creative/expressive arts in clinical practice, and creative/expressive arts in supervision.

Clinical Supervision

Clinical supervision has been most frequently defined as an intervention by a senior member of a profession with junior members or students of that same profession to enhance the supervisees’ functioning, monitor service quality, and serve as a gatekeeper for the profession (Bernard & Goodyear, 2009). Clinical supervision has been referred to as both fundamental intervention and instrumental in counselor education across all of the mental health professions (Bernard & Goodyear, 2014; Shudlman, 2005). Falender and Shafranske (2004) also defined supervision as “a distinct professional activity in which education and training aimed at developing science-informed practice are facilitated through a collaborative interpersonal process. It involves observation, evaluation, feedback, and facilitation of supervisee self-assessment, and the acquisition of knowledge and skills by instruction, modeling, and mutual problem solving” (p. 3). Bernard and Goodyear (2014) described supervision as different from
teaching, counseling, and consultation, although supervisors can take on the role of teacher, counselor, and/or consultant at some point in supervision.

In the CACREP (2015) standards, supervision is defined as “a tutorial and mentoring form of instruction in which a supervisor monitors his/her supervisees’ activities in practicum and internship and facilitates the associated learning and skill development experiences. The supervisor monitors and evaluates the clinical work of supervisees while monitoring the quality of services offered to clients” (p. 62). Although definitions of supervision vary, many researchers have agreed that clinical supervision is one of the most significant parts of professional activities and a means for supervisees to develop professional skills. Goodyear and Barnard (2009) noted the importance of supervision by stating that “practice alone is an insufficient means by which to attain competence: Unless it is accompanied by the systematic feedback and guided reflection that supervision provides, supervisees may gain no more than the illusion that they are developing professional expertise” (p. 4). To clarify the definition, Goodyear and Barnard (2009) suggested that supervision has two central purposes: a) to foster the supervisee’s professional development using a supportive and educational function and b) to ensure client welfare with a gatekeeping function.

**Roles of Supervisor**

As Bernard and Goodyear (2009) stated, the primary purpose of supervision is to facilitate the professional growth of the supervisee and to protect clients from harmful counselors. Therefore, supervisors have a responsibility to help their supervisees develop the interpersonal characteristics necessary for working with clients as well as the professional skills
required by current practice norms, such as note-writing, ethical diagnosis, and reporting of harm to self or others (Section F.1.a.; American Counseling Association, 2014). The supervisor also has a responsibility to ensure that the clients of the supervisee are not being harmed and are being helped to some degree (Bernard & Goodyear, 2009).

To optimize a supervisee’s professional growth, a supervisor’s role is crucial, although supervisees’ active participation is necessary for a successful supervision (Falender & Shafranske, 2012). Supervisors are expected to function in a variety of roles depending on the needs of the supervisee. Unlike in academic education in which the learning objectives and activities are usually predetermined by a professor, supervisors first need to know supervisees’ training needs and then collaborate with them throughout the process.

Freeman (1996) described the supervisors’ three primary roles as teacher, challenger, and supporter. Goodyear and Bernard (2014) identified the three major roles, depending the supervisee’s needs, as teacher, counselor, or consultant. In the teacher role, the supervisor functions as the expert who provides answers or instructs the counseling student in such areas as learning techniques, applying interventions, and conceptualizing. In the role of counselor, the supervisor facilitates their self-growth and explores the personal reactions of the supervisees. The focus of supervision interventions from this role needs, however, to be limited to helping the supervisees function more effectively as professionals. Finally, in the consultant role, the supervisor provides options and alternatives rather than answers and the interaction is more informal. Instead of instructing and directing the practicum student, the supervisor collaborates with the supervisee in areas such as case conceptualization and treatment planning (Goodyear & Banard, 2014; Pearson, 2004; Stenack & Dye, 1982).
Purswell and Stulmaker (2015) emphasized that the supervisor’s role as a facilitator facilitates learning through strengthening the supervisees’ ability to reflect on the therapeutic process, increasing technical growth. Therefore, supervisees should feel free to explore and examine potential feelings and thoughts regarding clients. This openness within the context of a secure supervisory relationship promotes the best possible care for clients, which is the role of gatekeeper.

In addition, a primary obligation of counseling supervisors is to monitor the services provided by supervisees. Counseling supervisors monitor clients’ welfare and supervisees’ performance and professional development. To fulfill these obligations, supervisors meet regularly with supervisees to review the supervisees’ work and help them become prepared to serve a range of diverse clients (ACA, 2014).

Quality of Supervision

Quality supervision occurs when supervisors empathize with their supervisees, attend to issues supervisees bring up, and provide insight into supervisees’ clients (Shanfield, Mohl, Matthews, & Hetherly, 1992). Falender and Shafranske (2004) found that the factors involved in provision of high-quality supervision include conflict resolution, disclosure, mentoring, culture, gender, and format. Carifio and Hess (1987) identified empathy, respect, genuineness, concreteness, and self-disclosure as well as self-knowledge, tolerance, and superior ability were personal characteristics of ideal supervisors.

Unlike the myth that the most effective supervisors present the characteristics of a master counselor, McCarthy, Debell, Kanuha, and McLeod (1988) assert that the ideal supervisor
clearly separates supervision from counseling and uses a different skill set for supervisees’ training. However, Stout (1987) noted that the best supervisors use therapeutic qualities such as empathy and genuineness in the supervision process. Several researchers have demonstrated that qualities conducive to the successful use of supervision cannot be separated from qualities necessary to become an effective counselor (Berger & Buchholz, 1993; Pearson, 2004; Rodenhauser, Rudisill, & Painter, 1989).

CACREP (2015) describes two necessary supervisor abilities. First, the supervisor will adhere to appropriate professional standards such as accreditation, certification, and licensure regulations in establishing the frequency and modality of supervision sessions. Specifically, the supervisor a) meets with the supervisee on a regular basis; b) conducts supervision sessions in a professional setting; c) meets face-to-face with the supervisee(s) for individual, triadic, and/or group supervision; d) uses technology that clearly approximates face-to-face synchronous contact, as permitted by relevant standards; and e) adheres to appropriate standards in ways that meet the needs of the supervisee.

Second, the supervisor provides a safe, supportive, and structured supervision climate. For this the supervisor a) plans for supervision so sessions (individual, triadic, and group) are structured, purposeful, and goal-oriented; b) gives attention to both the personal and professional learning curves of the supervisees; and c) modifies his/her style of and approach to supervision based on his/her assessment of client welfare, supervisees’ characteristics, supervisees’ immediate needs, supervisees’ developmental level, supervisees’ supervision goals, and environmental demands as well as the supervision context.
According to Falender and Shafranske (2014), effective supervision is defined as practice that encourages supervisee development and autonomy, facilitates the supervisory relationship, protects the client, and enhances both client and supervisee outcomes. They suggested the components of effective supervisor practices: demonstrate respect for the supervisee(s) and client(s); collaboratively assess supervisees’ competence with supervisees’ self-assessment and supervisor’s feedback; and develop goals and tasks to achieve these. They should form a supervisory alliance; identify strains to the supervisory relationship and work to repair them; and clarify and ensure understanding of supervisees’ roles and supervisor’s expectations. They should also assess, reflect on, and enhance specific supervisee competences; collaboratively construct a supervision contract providing informed consent regarding expectations and supervisor and supervisee roles and responsibilities; monitor and protect the client as well as be a gatekeeper with transparency; and share assessment of competencies with the supervisee.

Gatekeeping refers to the supervisor’s responsibility to a) ensure the suitability of individuals entering the profession; b) infuse awareness of the role diversity plays in clinical and supervision practice, including consideration of the multicultural identities of client, supervisee, and supervisor; c) reflect on worldviews, attitudes, and biases, and infuse these in conceptualization, assessment, and intervention; d) encourage and support supervisee reflection on clinical practice and the process of supervision; e) engage the supervisee in skill development using interactive and experiential methods (e.g., role play, modeling); f) attend to personal factors, unusual emotional reactivity, and countertransference and engage in management of these to inform the clinical process; g) provide ongoing accurate positive and corrective feedback anchored in competencies; and h) observe directly through live or video and use observation
regularly to provide behavioral, anchored feedback on competencies and identified supervisee goals (Falender & Shafranske, 2014).

Supervisory Relationship

Counseling supervisors clearly define and maintain ethical professional, personal, and social relationships with their supervisees. Supervisors consider the risks and benefits of extending current supervisory relationships in any form beyond conventional parameters. In extending these boundaries, supervisors take appropriate professional precautions to ensure that judgment is not impaired and that no harm follows (ACA, 2014). Furthermore, the supervisory relationship is intensely related to the effects of supervision, at least from the supervisees’ perspective (Falender & Shafranske, 2014; Inman & Ladany, 2008) because supervision and strong supervisory relationships allow supervisees to verbalize and explore goals, case conceptualizations, and client relationships (Stark, Frels, & Garza, 2011).

Reliable supervisory relationships provide an environment for thinking, feeling, and self-reflecting without judgment or fear of penalty. Supervisors are responsible for creating a safe environment for supervisees to examine the powerful emotions they experience in sessions, allowing for greater learning and exploration for the supervisees (Edwards, 2010). Supervisors set the tone for the amount of acceptance and freedom that supervisees are given to help them engage during supervision. Supervisors allow their supervisees to express challenges that occur in sessions and offer them support regarding these issues to help supervisees form the most therapeutic relationships possible with their clients (c et al., 1992).
Research has demonstrated that a positive and productive relationships are critical to successful supervision, just as a positive and productive relationship is critical to successful counseling. (Ramos-Sanchez et al., 2002; Rønnestad & Skovholt, 1993; Worthen & McNeill, 1996). Kilminster and Jolly (2000) reviewed the literature on effective supervision in practice settings to identify what is known about effective supervision and concluded that the supervision relationship can be considered the single most important factor for the effectiveness of supervision, more important than the supervisory methods used. They noted that “effective supervisors give their supervisees: responsibilities for patient care; opportunities to carry out procedures; opportunities to review patients; involvement in patient care; direction and constructive feedback” (p. 833). A strong working alliance within the supervisory relationship is crucial to the success of the training experience and client welfare (Bernard & Goodyear, 2013; Falender & Shafranske, 2008; Gnilka, Chang, & Dew, 2012). Role conflicts, skill deficits, multicultural challenges, sexual attraction, gender-based conflict, and problematic supervisee behaviors, emotions, and attitudes can all threaten the supervisory relationship (Ladany, Friedlander, & Nelson, 2005).

The ACA’s (2014) code of ethic determines professional relationships and boundaries between supervisors and supervisees or students.

Counselor supervisors, trainers, and educators aspire to foster meaningful and respectful professional relationships and to maintain appropriate boundaries with supervisees and students in both face-to-face and electronic formats. They have theoretical and pedagogical foundations for their work; have knowledge of supervision models; and aim to be fair, accurate, and honest in their assessments of counselors, students, and supervisees … [furthermore] supervisors are prohibited from engaging in supervisory relationships with individuals with whom they have an inability to remain objective. (pp. 12-13).
To foster the supervisory working alliances, ACES asks supervisors to facilitate an initial discussion with a supervisee about the supervision process as follows:

i. The supervisor establishes the beginning of a supervisory working alliance that is collaborative and egalitarian to assist in lessening supervisee anxiety about the supervision process.

ii. The supervisor describes his/her role as supervisor, including teacher, counselor, consultant, mentor, and evaluator.

iii. The supervisor describes the structure, process, and content of all relevant formats of supervision sessions (e.g., individual, triadic, peer, group supervision).

iv. The supervisor and supervisee discuss the supervisee’s past experiences with supervision as well as preferred supervision styles and supervision interventions.

v. The supervisor initiates a conversation about multicultural considerations and how they may affect both counseling and supervision relationships, indicating that such multicultural considerations will be an expected part of supervision conversations. (p. 5)

Practicum Supervision

Counseling as a helping profession requires specific education and training to equip trainees with the necessary knowledge and skills and eventually to provide them with a counselor identity (Levitt & Jacques, 2005). Therefore, they are required not only to acquire theoretical knowledge but also to integrate it into practice (Kurtyilmaz, 2015). Professional practice, which includes practicum and internship, provides for the application of theory and the development of
counseling skills under supervision. These experiences provide opportunities for students to counsel clients who represent the ethnic and demographic diversity of their communities. Specifically, the practicum experience is a critical component in counselor education training in that practicum is the first opportunity to assess the supervisees’ ability to apply the knowledge and skills obtained from course work with clients in one-to-one interactions (CACREP, 2015). Typically, these interactions are recorded on audiotape, and afterwards, students receive feedback from their course supervisors and peers through individual and group class meetings. The practice of skills in school and clinical settings is considered a necessary condition to develop professional competencies (Bernard & Goodyear, 1998).

CACREP Requirements for Counseling Practicum

In CACREP-accredited-programs, before or at the beginning of the first term of enrollment in the academic unit, the program provides a new student orientation during which a student handbook is disseminated and discussed, students’ ethical and professional obligations and personal growth expectations as counselors-in-training are explained, and eligibility for licensure/certification is reviewed (CACREP, 2015).

According to the CACREP (2015) requirements, practicum students are required as follows:

1. Students complete supervised counseling practicum experiences that total a minimum of 100 clock hours over a full academic term that is a minimum of 10 weeks.
2. Practicum students complete at least 40 clock hours of direct service with actual clients that contributes to the development of counseling skills.
3. Practicum students have weekly interaction with supervisors that averages one hour per week of individual and/or triadic supervision throughout the practicum by 1) a counselor education program faculty member, 2) a student supervisor who is under the supervision of a counselor education program faculty member, or 3) a site supervisor who is working in consultation on a regular schedule with a counselor education program faculty member in accordance with the supervision agreement.

4. Practicum students participate in an average of 1½ hours per week of group supervision on a regular schedule throughout the practicum. Group supervision must be provided by a counselor education program faculty member or a student supervisor who is under the supervision of a counselor education program faculty member.

**Student Counselor Development**

Research has consistently shown that trainees’ development level affects their expectations for the style and focus of their supervision. In particular, research has consistently found that beginning trainees express the need for greater amounts of support, structure, and encouragement, whereas advanced trainees have more interest in focusing on personal issues that affect their work and on higher order skills (Goodyear & Bernard, 1998; Holloway, 1992; Stoltenberg, McNeill, & Crethar, 1994; Worthington, 1987). However, as Bernard and Goodyear (1992) suggest, anxiety is pervasive among both supervisors and supervisees. They report that there is no reason to avoid anxiety during practicum because moderate levels of anxiety probably improve counselor performance. Instead they contend that ignored anxiety can negatively influence a counselor’s speech rates, the accuracy of his or her perceptions, and the supervisors’
ability to provide appropriate effective feedback. Bernard and Goodyear (2014) also noted that anxiety can lead the supervisee to be too critical of his or her performance in the hope that the supervisor will give only positive feedback. If supervisors can find effective ways to reduce anxiety early in the process, their supervision will be more productive.

As Kurtyilmaz (2015) found, although practicum provides a context for professional growth, it also leads to anxiety and other feelings of incompetence that can impede supervisees’ professional development. The results showed they felt confused, anxious, excited, curious, and fearful when they imagined or thought about the process they would go through over the course of their practicum. Their most frequently stated feeling was anxiety resulting from the unexpectedness of the counseling process in general and their lack of experience. Kurtyilmaz concluded that they became anxious and worried because of the ambiguous nature of counseling.

Jordan and Kelly (2004) qualitatively analyzed 15 relatively distinct areas of worry among beginning counselors. The results indicated that they were largely worried about their competence and effectiveness as counselors. Levitt and Jacques (2005) found that counselors-in-training are challenged by the ambiguity inherent in skill acquisition and development processes. Ambiguity has been defined as being open to more than one interpretation (Pickett et al, 2000); however, to be a counselor, counselors-in-training are required to function well with abstract ideas and under ambiguous circumstances, which requires development of ambiguity tolerance.

Skovholt and Ronnesstad (2003) identified therapist development throughout the professional life span and defined six stages of counselor development from their 1995 widespread qualitative study of 100 therapists with 40 years of experience. The six stages included phase 1: Lay Helper, phase 2: beginning student, phase 3: advanced student, phase 4:
novice professional, phase 5: experienced professional, and phase 6: senior professional. Skovholt and Ronnesstad found that inevitably the counselors faced challenges at every phase and that how the counselor handles the challenge determines whether the counselor proceeds into the “Developmental Track,” a period of “Moratorium,” or the “Stagnation Track” (Skovholt & Rønnestad, 2001, p. 51).

Orlinsky et al. (2005) conducted an international quantitative study of 5,000 therapists and identified similar development processes. Skovholt and Rønnestad (1995) noted that continuous professional reflection is crucial for the essential development process. Three essential aspects of professional reflection include a) ongoing professional and personal experience, b) a searching process with others within an open and supportive environment, and c) active reflection about one’s experiences. Most of their fears and anxiety were explained in terms of professional practice issues such as being professional, managing the counseling process, etc. Evaluation anxiety was revealed as another source of the trainees’ negative feelings, as they were preoccupied with being good counselors.

Kurtyilmaz (2015) proposed that counselor educators and supervisors consider trainees’ feelings of inadequacy as well as the reasons and sources of these feelings during the education and training process to provide more qualified counselor trainee education and more effective counseling services. For this, counselor trainees should be provided with support for coping with ambiguities in the process.
Practicum Courses

Neufeldt (2007) suggested a 15-week course outline consisting of a weekly class conducted by the course instructor, followed by an individual or group supervision session. In his outline, the classes include teaching and student case presentations. The instructors can assign appropriate texts or articles to read for class discussions and add learning exercises for class or individual/group supervision. Specifically, Neufeldt (2007) recommended the use of a basic skills book as well as a single-theory book in practicum course.

Regarding logistical variables, practicum classes typically met on campus once a week for three hours or less (87%). Classes tended to have 10 or fewer enrolled students (91%), were usually led by one supervisor (75%), and were most often letter graded (54%) as opposed to being marked pass/fail or (un)satisfactory. Most supervisors required trainees to read textbooks in their practicum class (62%) and also required trainees to read scientific journal articles (69%). However, trainees were generally not required to write papers (Prieto, 1998).

Prieto (1998) conducted an exploratory analysis of post-microskills practicum class supervision at CACREP-accredited counselor training programs across the nation. The results indicated that supervisors tended to use an interconnected and relationship-oriented approach to their trainees in practicum classes regardless of the level of practicum class being taught. In the research, he concluded that a supportive group environment and facilitative supervisory approach are primary aspects of successful practicum class supervision.

Regarding the benefits of practicum class supervision, although some supervisors considered both the individual and the group formats of supervision to be equally helpful to their trainees (32%), the largest number of supervisors (42%) unequivocally identified the individual
format of supervision as being the most helpful to trainees. Most supervisors (80%) believed that case presentation activities were the most helpful component of practicum class. The case presentation technique seems to be the primary method used to train supervisees in practicum class and was considered by the majority of supervisors to be the most helpful activity for trainees. The training components of the case presentation activity typically emphasized include offering feedback and support to trainees on their clinical work, building supervisees’ case conceptualization skills, and normalizing supervisees’ sense of inadequacy or insecurity as developing clinicians (Prieto, 1998)

Neufeldt (2007) noted that many researchers agreed with the need for some structure during early training, although he cautioned that too much structure in the initial practicum results supervisees’ passive learning. He suggested as follows:

The first quarter’s experiences are planned so that new skills are developed in class each week and deliberately practiced in role-play sessions with other trainees. Skills included those needed to set up appointments, begin and end sessions, respond empathically to client concerns, set appropriate boundaries, and respond effectively to common emergency situations. In the middle of the first term, trainees conduct intake interviews and meet with their first community clients. In this way they move from structured, predictable experiences provided by real clients. (p. 11)

CACREP Requirements for Practicum Supervisor

During practicum, counseling students may interact with both types of supervisors: university and site. For university supervisors, the 2009 CACREP (2009) Standards indicate that supervisors can be faculty members or doctoral students. Three criteria must be met for faculty members to be supervisors: a) hold a doctoral degree; b) hold a license, certification, or be able to “demonstrate competence in counseling”; and c) be trained in counseling supervision (p. 14).
The criteria for doctoral students include a) holding a master’s degree, b) being trained in supervision, and c) being supervised by faculty members. Site supervisors may be from various professions related to counseling, including licensed professional counselors, school counselors, psychiatrists, psychologists, social workers, marriage and family therapists, and psychiatric nurses (Guo & Wang, 2009).

Creative/Expressive Arts in Clinical Practice

What is Creative/Expressive Art?

Creative/expressive arts represent a creative modality that incorporates a combination of toys and/or art materials and involves participants utilizing the materials either silently or combined with verbalization and ends in processing of the experience (Purswell & Stulmaker, 2015). These techniques include, but are not limited to, drawing (Oaklander, 1988), painting, puppet shows (Bratton & Ray, 1999), clay (Bratton, Ceballos, & Meany-Walen, 2012), role-playing, psychodrama (Oaklander, 1988), mindfulness (Bohecker, Vereen, Wells, & Wathen, 2016), and sand tray (Armstrong, 2008).

The National Coalition of Creative Arts Therapies Associations (NCCATA, 2016) explains creative art therapies and creative art therapists. Creative arts therapists are human service professionals who use distinct arts-based methods and creative processes to ameliorate disability and illness and to optimize health and wellness. Treatment outcomes include, for example, improving communication and expression and increasing physical, emotional, cognitive, and/or social functioning. The International Expressive Arts Therapy Association (2012) identified that expressive arts can combine the visual arts, movement, drama, music,
writing and other creative processes to foster deep personal growth and community development; therefore, expressive therapies are sometimes referred to as integrative approaches when purposively used in combination in treatment (Malchiodi, 2005).

Creative/expressive arts can be defined as purposely selected activities – such as movement, sound, painting, sculpting, music, drawing, writing, improvisation (Rogers, 1993), imagery, symbol, storytelling, ritual, dance, poetry, and drama (Atkins & Williams, 2007) – that bring into being important ideas or feelings. These types of creative and expressive activities shape, form, hold, and reflect human experiences as well as deepen personal understanding and meaning. (Power, 2013).

Malchiodi (2007) identified many similarities between the creative process and the process of therapy in that the creative process involved in the making of art is healing and life enhancing. Both creativity and art therapy are about solving problems such as finding new solutions to old ways of being, thinking, feeling, and interacting. Similar to the therapeutic process, the creative process also provides an opportunity to explore and experiment with new ideas and ways of being. Both processes are acts of modification, alteration, improvisation, and transformation. In counseling, these characteristics are essential to creating new understanding, insight, and awareness. Malchiodi (2007) identified that “the power of art to expand self-understanding, to offer insight not available through other means and to extend people’s ability to communicate. Furthermore, practicum students can reduce their fear of expressing themselves through the arts (Schaefer, 2003; Ziff & Beamish, 2004).
Creativity in the counseling process allows clinicians to individualize treatment and consider the client’s contextual values during decision making (APA, 2006). Counselor educators and supervisors need to consider a different approach to research-informed practice by integrating left- and right-brain processing in supervisee and client care (Field, 2014).

Approximately 60% of communication is nonverbal (Burgoon, 1985), which is a right hemisphere function (Benowitz, Bear, Rosenthal, Mesulam, Zaidel, & Sperry, 1983). The regions of the right hemisphere, including the front-temporal regions, are capable of sustaining a sense of self-awareness (Keenan, Rubio, Racioppi, Johnson, and Barnacz, 2015). The right side of the brain is associated with unconscious social and emotional learning and includes intuition, empathy, creativity, and flexibility (Field, 2015). Creativity has also been associated with the right hemisphere (Grabner, Fink, & Neubauer, 2007) and occurs when counselors are attuned to implicit memories. Creativity occurs when counselors trust their unconscious intuition, where novel ideas are generated, based on environmental cues. Creativity is typically an emergent and unconscious process unfolding in the immediacy of the counseling room.

However, the purely left hemisphere approach of rigidly following a treatment manual is not sufficient for effective counseling practice (Field, 2014). A purely left hemisphere counseling approach may be overly rigid and problematic since counselor rigidity has been found to impair the counselor-client relationship (Ackerman & Hilsenroth, 2001; Field, 2015). Taking a purely left hemisphere approach to counseling negates the importance of unconscious intuition and clinical experience in counselor effectiveness. It is entirely possible that many clinical decisions are based more on the right hemisphere than the left hemisphere processes. The importance of
the right hemisphere processing extends to the counseling relationship, which is considered to have a central role in client outcomes. Neuroscience supports the integration of both the left hemisphere and the right hemisphere in interactions between counselor and client. The counseling relationship is informed by linguistic content and auditory input, which is a left hemisphere function. In addition to visual-facial input, it is also important for counselors and supervisors to recognize tactile input, proprioceptive input such as the body movement in space, nonverbal gestures, and body language – the right hemisphere function (Field, 2014).

Clearly, all of these right hemisphere functions are crucial to the development of a strong counseling relationship and can be facilitated by using creative/expressive arts. Furthermore, counselors cannot establish an effective counseling relationship by merely attending to verbal content by using only the left hemisphere, thus a strong counseling relationship requires the integration of both the left and right hemisphere processes.

**Creative/Express Arts in Counseling**

Malchiodi, (2007) defined art therapy as Art + Therapy = Powerful Healing. She believes that using expressive arts can help clients explore and express themselves authentically through art. Through this process, clients can find relief from overwhelming emotions, crises, or trauma; discover insights about themselves; increase their sense of well-being; enrich their daily lives through creative expression; or experience personal transformation. Creative arts therapists work at adult day treatment centers, community mental health centers, community residences and halfway houses, disaster relief centers, drug and alcohol programs, early intervention programs, general hospitals, home health agencies, hospices, nursing homes, outpatient clinics, psychiatric
units and hospitals, rehabilitative facilities, senior centers, schools, wellness centers, and so on (NCCATA, 2016).

Snyder (1997) also asserted expressive art therapy attempts to reach clients with various problems through artistic expression of what lies within and to fulfill the human need for self-expression in a society that is becoming increasingly mechanized. Expressive art therapy contributes to restoring the cognitive/intellectual, emotional/affect, and creative/inspiration vacuums in today’s stress-driven, technological, impersonal, and often unsafe world. As Kramer (1993) stated, for many clients – including children, adults, and elderly, expressive art therapy is an engaging and effective way for them to become more aware of themselves. Kramer noted that creating art contains more personal meaning and emotional effects because art offers an arena for replaying the inner conflicts and changes that occur while undergoing psychotherapy and counseling treatment.

Jung (1964) said that individuals need to establish the basis for a dialogue with the inner self by using the symbols and images of the unconscious mind. Through myths, symbols, and images, it is possible to grasp these secrets from within the information that silently influences our lives. Expressive art therapy can reveal the truths that lie hidden deep in the realms of the psyche. The varieties of expressive art previously discussed are designed to help clients recognize the voices from the inside, so they can clearly find their way and successfully negotiate through the hazards and alternate routes along their separate pathways. These activities serve as a guide to the world within, that deep well of the unconscious, where clues exist to provide appropriate guidance to productive living if one can only learn to listen. By listening, and listening well, one can heal the soul through creativity.
Creative/expressive art therapy is an engaging and effective way for many clients to become more aware of themselves. Creating art contains more personal meaning and emotional effects because art offers an arena for replaying the inner conflicts and changes that occur while undergoing psychotherapy and counseling treatment (Kramer, 1993).

Sommers-Flanagan (2007) interviewed Natalie Rogers, the daughter of Carl Rogers, and confirmed that person-centered expressive art therapy is an alternative to traditional verbal counseling approaches and may be especially helpful for clients stuck in linear, rigid, and analytic ways of thinking and experiencing the world. Counseling educator Samuel Gladding notes that counseling at its best capitalizes on creativity to help individuals express themselves personally and uniquely. In counseling, the use of art, music, movement, and other forms of expression encourages playfulness, divergent thinking, flexibility, humor, risk taking, independence, and openness (Malchiodi, 2007).

Like art therapists, creative counselors and psychotherapists believe that increasing an individual’s capacity for creative thinking and behavior through drawing, painting, construction, or using one’s imagination helps reduce emotional distress and conflict and enhances understand of oneself and others. Ultimately, these creative behaviors may contribute to good mental health, helping people of all ages become more adaptive, resilient, and productive when confronted with life’s stresses (Malchiodi, 2007). Helping people understand their art expressions can certainly be part of art therapy, but the process of making art is equally important (Malchiodi, 2007). Buchalter (2009) summarized the goals of art therapy interventions. It includes “creative communication, expression of feelings, concerns, hopes, conflicts and issues, socialization, problem solving, and enhancement of thinking and reasoning skills” (p. 11).
Using Creative/Expressive Arts in Clinical Practice

Creative arts therapies can make the difference between resistance and relationship in that creative arts therapists create nonthreatening group and individual arts experiences for the exploration of feelings and therapeutic issues, such as self-esteem or personal insight (NCCATA, 2016). Creative/expressive art therapies can make a difference for people with mental health needs, Alzheimer’s disease, chronic illness, head injuries, substance abuse problems, physical disabilities, and developmental disabilities. The therapeutic factors of creative/expressive arts can be explained as follows (NCCATA, 2016):

- Alzheimer’s Disease: Creative arts therapies can make the difference between demoralization and dignity. Creative arts therapists select arts experiences from the person’s past to trigger short- and long-term memory, decrease agitation, and enhance reality orientation.

- Chronic Illness: Creative arts therapies can make the difference between chronic pain and comfort. Creative arts therapists plan arts experiences to distract people from pain and facilitate needed relaxation.

- Head Injuries: Creative arts therapies can make the difference between isolation and interaction. Creative arts therapists organize groups using arts experiences to encourage self-expression, communication, and socialization and to facilitate cognitive retraining.

- Substance Abuse Problems: Creative arts therapies can make the difference between denial and determination. Creative arts therapists use arts-based techniques to confront the client’s barriers to the recovery process.
- Physical Disabilities: Creative arts therapies can make the difference between frustration and fulfillment. Creative arts therapists design arts experiences to promote rehabilitative goals and to increase motivation.

- Developmental Disabilities: Creative arts therapies can make the difference between passivity and productivity. Creative arts therapists structure sessions that teach cognitive, motor, and daily living skills through the arts and provide the opportunity to experience the success of the arts.

Research has demonstrated the effects and benefits of using expressive arts in counseling and therapy. In clinical practice, the expressive arts that practitioners commonly use are music therapy, art therapy, dance/movement therapy, drama therapy, bibliotherapy, play therapy, and sand tray therapy (Pappas, 2014). Visser and Plessis (2015) demonstrated that the expressive art group intervention is valuable as an alternative therapeutic strategy in a low resource setting for female adolescents who have experienced sexual abuse. Specifically, the group dynamics, expressive art activities, and reflective group discussions contributed to the therapeutic value of the intervention.

Kristi et al. (2015) explored the process of using expressive arts and child centered play therapy techniques in group therapy with adolescent females at-risk. In this study, they utilized a phenomenological approach and grounded theory to identify findings consistent with research on the use of expressive arts techniques integrated with play therapy in the group setting. The main themes revealed as follows: a) initial feelings of insecurity; b) exploration of characteristics of selves and families; c) increased expression of feelings; d) sense of accomplishment and pride; e) stress relief; f) increased self-awareness; g) increased group cohesion; and h) awareness of
behavioral changes outside of group. More important is that the adolescents exhibited an awareness of a transference of skills learned in the group in outside relationships as a result of expressive arts techniques integrated with play therapy intervention.

Green, Myrick, and Crenshaw (2013) provided a comprehensive literature review of the most current research in adolescent attachment as well as clinical implications for play therapists who recognize the significance of the therapeutic dyad when working with adolescents. Additionally, Donald (2003) and Green (2012) conducted case studies involving the integration of expressive art therapy interventions, such as sand tray to strengthen the adolescent’s overall schema of attachment to secure. Schadler and De Domenico (2012) conducted a case study of a client with a history of chronic mental illness to the use of expressive arts for people with severe mental illness. In this study, Schadler and De Domenico identified that optimal treatments for clients with mental illness strike a balance between medical and psychological therapies and using expressive arts can facilitate the environmental, psychobiological, and psychological processes connected with mental health problems.

Nims (2007) integrated expressive art techniques and a counseling theory and demonstrated the process in three case studies. The study described the solution-focused process and presented a framework for integrating the expressive play therapy techniques of art, sand tray, and puppets into the solution-focused model. In the case, they demonstrated that the sand tray technique provided a multidimensional treatment model that is helpful for individuals to increase conscious awareness, address therapeutic issues, and guide the treatment plan.

Cockle (1994) described the historical use and interpretation of art in child therapy by conducting a case study with a six-year-old boy. In the process of healing, Cockle examined the
use of the self-portrait technique accompanying narratives and demonstrated that positive change in self-concept occurred over time within a therapeutic client-centered environment. Green, Fazio-Griffith, and Parson (2015) utilized an integrative play therapy approach to treat children with psychosis. They concluded with a case study depicting the psychological challenges a typical child with psychosis encounters and the associated treatment options available to play therapy practitioners from an integrative standpoint.

Children affected by psychosis often endure unresolved mental health and psychosocial disturbances that impede social, academic, and behavioral functioning (Algon, Yi, Calkins, Kohler, & Borgmann-Winter, 2012). Algon et al. provided clinicians with a discussion of play therapy and empirically informed techniques to improve treatment outcomes for children diagnosed with psychosis. Additionally, an integrative play therapy approach was highlighted, comprising a) family interventions (McFarlane, Dixon, Lukens, & Lucksted, 2003), b) psychosocial approaches (Green & Drewes, 2013; Stewart & Green, 2015), and c) school-based support (Flanagan, Allen, & Henry, 2010).

Tyndall-Lind, Landreth, and Giordano (2001) examined the effectiveness of intensive sibling group play therapy with child witnesses of domestic violence in improving self-concept, reducing internalizing and externalizing behavior problems, and reducing overall behavior problems. The results showed that children in the experimental group exhibited a significant reduction in total behavior problems, externalizing and internalizing behavior problems, aggression, anxiety, and depression, and a significant improvement in self-esteem. Intensive sibling group play therapy was also found to be as equally effective as intensive individual play therapy with child witnesses of domestic violence.
Sporild and Bonsaksen (2014) pointed out that although group therapy has been widely discussed in terms of factors that work, most of the previous work in this field is related to verbal psychotherapy. Sporild and Bonsaksen described and discussed the expressive art therapy group at an eating disorders unit in Norway. Particularly, they empathized therapeutic factors in groups linking specific elements of a case example.

Creative/Expressive Art in Supervision

According to CACREP (2015), the supervisor should use a variety of supervisory interventions as follows:

1. The supervisor uses methods of direct observation (e.g., recordings of counseling sessions, live observations, live supervision).
2. The supervisor uses interventions that address a range of supervision foci, including counseling performance skills, cognitive counseling skills, case conceptualization, self-awareness, and professional behaviors.
3. The supervisor selects interventions intentionally based on an assessment of the supervisee’s developmental level, confidence, self-efficacy, and learning style; the clinical and supervision contexts; and the needs of the client.
4. The supervisor chooses interventions that will help the supervisee work toward his/her learning goals.
Why Creative/Expressive Arts in Supervision?

Traditionally, clinical supervision has not focused on creativity (Hecker & Kottler, 2002), and the academic arena also has not always been conducive or welcoming to creativity (Carson & Becker, 2004). Rather conventional counseling supervision has been focused on models of reasoning and logic and guiding the supervisee to focus on specific counseling techniques and interventions and the rationale behind the use of them (Lahad, 2000). In recent decades, however, much evidence-based research has demonstrated the effectiveness of using creative/expressive arts in clinical supervision (Brown, Meyerowitz-Katz, & Ryde, 2007; Graham et al., 2014; Lett, 1993; Robinson, 1992). Lett (1993) utilized art-making techniques in clinical supervision and interviewed supervisees for a phenomenological analysis. Lett identified that art-making is critical in facilitating therapeutic understanding about supervisees’ clients. Robinson (1992) also explored the benefits of using art in supervision by reviewing literature and through a survey of supervisees. Brown, Meyerowitz-Katz, and Ryde (2007) stated that the art-making process is helpful for understanding supervisees’ feelings, particularly countertransference. Moreover, Brown et al. found that art-making effectively enhanced not only the supervisees’ understanding of their clients but also of themselves by exploring supervisees’ difficult feelings.

Expressive arts group supervision is constructivist in epistemology and in design. It is humanistic and strives to facilitate individual exploration of self and others that leads to new perspectives on self and others and on the issues and relationships of counseling practice. It allows for emotional connection and is a holistic approach to counselor trainee supervision (Rossi, 2010). Calisch (1994) discussed the need to address transference and countertransference
in supervision of therapists in training and stated that supervisees’ use of art sheds light on these aspects of the therapeutic relationship; however, she did not include any specific guidelines for the use of art in supervision.

Expressive arts group supervision can provide a way for trainees to use metaphor, images, fantasy, and symbols as means to conceptualize their clients, themselves, and the counseling and supervision processes (Lahad, 2000). In this way, they can create concrete expressions of their inner and outer worlds and their perceptions of their clients’ worlds (Lahad, 2000). Expressive arts group supervision can use music, stories, movement, poetry or writing, role-play or psychodrama, art, guided imagery, or play. Newsome et al. (2005) propose the use of the arts in counselor trainee supervision when the supervisee feels stuck.

Graham et al. (2014) recommend supervisors consider the use of creativity within the context of the developmental level of the supervisee, the nature of the supervisory alliance, and their own skill level in the use of these approaches. According to Bernard and Goodyear (2013), creativity invites intimacy and depth in the therapeutic relationship. It is essential for supervisors to understand and utilize these approaches with care, as they may intensify an already reflective and growth-oriented process (Carson & Becker, 2004). Furthermore, there is the potential for role complexity and conflict (e.g., dual relationships) when supervisors take on more counseling-oriented goals with their supervisees.

Graham et al. (2014) noted that counselor supervision is fundamental to the development of ethical and competent counselors. They argued that there is no one-size-fits-all model in working with supervisees with unique views and experiences, and any one approach cannot always be the most effective one for supervision of developing counselors. Donald, Culbreth,
and Carter (2015) reviewed the literature and summarized what is currently known. They recommended clinical supervisors need to make the best choices when selecting supervision interventions to meet supervisees’ personal and professional needs.

The use of creative approaches to counseling supervision acts as a catalyst to encouraging supervisees to use creative approaches in their work with clients (Carson & Becker, 2004). The use of expressive arts in counseling supervision provides supervisees with an opportunity to have deeper levels of connection, self-expression, and creativity and to develop counseling skills that will aid clients (Carson & Becker, 2004; Neswald-McCalip, Sather, Strati, & Dineen, 2003; Newsome, Henderson, & Veach, 2005). Purswell and Stulmaker (2015) noted that supervision is a critical aspect of counselor training and expressive arts techniques can be a useful tool for the clinical supervisor. To increase usefulness of expressive arts in supervision, they suggested that supervisors need to consider the developmental stage of the supervisee to make intentional decisions about the choice of expressive art techniques in clinical supervision.

Expressive arts in supervision can be used to meet the goals of supervision and facilitate the supervisees’ growth and development. Specifically, expressive arts in play therapy supervision can be utilized to facilitate communication, awareness, empathy, and relationship dynamics (Purswell & Stulmaker, 2015). Newsome et al. (2005) emphasized that counselor educators and supervisors can enhance the group supervision process by intentionally selecting expressive arts activities designed to help supervisees develop personal awareness and increase group understanding and cohesion. Expressive arts can be an effective tool for reflecting on the counseling process with clients and themselves. The reflective process is a significant part of

Creative/expressive arts can make supervision more enjoyable and beneficial for supervisees when actively engaging in art tasks in supervision. Bowman (2003) conducted a quantitative study on the efficacy of art tasks in supervision of counselors-in-training. Bowman suggested supervisors should discuss art tasks that supervisees have done in supervision. Supervisees’ enjoyment of the art tasks linked to the group discussion and findings showed that supervisees enjoyed the feedback and insights from group discussion about art tasks. Bowman also found out that art tasks in supervision increased supervisees’ self-understanding. Moreover, using art tasks in supervision was a model for new skills in that the supervisees could learn how to use art in their counseling sessions with clients.

Fish (2008) made an important contribution to art therapy supervision by doing the first formative evaluation research of art-based supervision. From the survey of supervisees, Fish found that art supervision helped supervisees better understand their clinical issues and maintained their self-care, although the research was limited by the small number of participants and there was no control group for statistical comparison.

Supervisors are responsible for creating a safe environment for supervisees to examine the powerful emotions they experience in sessions, allowing for greater learning and exploration for the supervisee (Edwards, 2010). Supervision facilitates learning through strengthening supervisees’ ability to reflect on the therapeutic process, increasing their technical growth. Therefore, supervisees should feel free to explore and examine potential feelings and thoughts
regarding clients. This openness promotes the best possible care for clients and expands the supervisees’ repertoire within the context of a secure supervisory relationship.

Furthermore, Purswell and Stulmaker (2015) suggested that supervisors need to consider the developmental stage of the supervisees to make intentional decisions about the choice of expressive arts techniques. Supervisors allow their supervisees to talk about challenges that occur in sessions and offer them support regarding these issues to help supervisees form the most therapeutic relationships possible with their clients (Shanfield, Mohl, & Hetherly, 1992).

Through a case study using three creative approaches, Graham et al. (2014) concluded that all three creative supervision approaches – bibliotherapy, psychodrama, sand tray – promote a fresh perspective on the supervisees’ development through role-play, storytelling, or metaphor. They identified that these creative processes lay the foundation and provide a framework for less threatening approaches to supervision compared to more traditional evaluative approaches. They provide a venue for deep reflection and growth. In addition, these approaches are freeing and decrease the supervisees’ defensiveness. As a result, all three supervision approaches facilitate supervisees’ self-awareness, openness to feedback, flexibility, and positive change.

**Arts Activities in Supervision**

Deaver and Shiflett (2011) asserted art-based techniques in clinical supervision are couched within a constructivist educational and supervision framework. A rationale for artmaking by supervisees within supervision settings is provided, followed by a discussion of various art-based supervision techniques targeted at instilling the capacity for reflection in supervisees and at increasing supervisees’ self-awareness, including case conceptualization skills
and processing of countertransference. Art techniques effective in reducing supervisee stress are also introduced. A discussion of the ethical concerns intrinsic in this sort of work as well as some caveats regarding the introduction of art activities in supervision with non-artist supervisees conclude the article.

Art materials and activities often provide the supervisor with opportunities to encourage students’ self-expression, awareness, and growth (Jackson, Muro, Lee, & DeO "Brandas, 2008). Intentionally choosing art activities designed to promote personal growth and enhance group cohesion makes the implementation of expressive arts purposeful, thoughtful, and designed to optimize student learning. Ireland and Weissman (1999) and Guiffrida and colleagues (2007) asserted that purposively selected drawing activities in the context of supervision can facilitate supervisees’ self-understanding and self-awareness, which leads to increased understanding of transference and the countertransference phenomena.

Lett’s (1995) study of five recently graduated psychologists in a weekly supervision class using experiential and expressive interventions led to a greater understanding of the phenomenological process of creative supervision. In addition to facilitation of self-understanding and awareness, the use of the drawing technique positively influenced their client-counselor relationship and their understanding of themselves (Fulfillment, 2010).

Amundson (1988) developed a structured approach for his supervisees to use in developing metaphoric case drawings; this approach included reflection in response to the images, leading to insights about cases. He asserted that although some supervisees were apprehensive about drawing, case drawings in group supervision seemed useful in case conceptualization, as noted in the supervisees’ descriptions of the benefits. Since Amundson’s
initial exploration of the use of case drawings in supervision, Ishiyama (1988) modified Amundson’s approach through standardizing the method and developed the four steps procedure called the “visual case processing method” (p. 154): 1) reflection on a case and responding with words to a series of prompts; 2) generating imagery and metaphors; 3) drawing the case; and 4) presenting the case in group supervision.

Ishiyama (1988) tested his metaphoric drawing approach with 19 undergraduate counseling students who also received verbal supervision; he identified that drawing interventions were more helpful than the verbal supervision in several ways. The students felt more comfortable with arts-based expression than the verbal supervision and perceived their supervision as having more value. More importantly, reflections on the process indicate there was a flow between the visual images that were drawn and the verbal descriptions that follow. This process led trainees to a greater understanding of their clients and themselves. They thought that the drawing helped them to achieve their counseling goals and to conceptualize their client more profoundly. The use of the drawing technique positively added to their client-counselor relationship and to their understanding of themselves.

Stone and Amundson (1989) conducted a mixed-methods multiple baseline study with seven clinical psychology graduate students to identify the efficacy of metaphoric case drawings for case conceptualization versus traditional verbal processing in a crisis intervention agency setting. The results revealed that the case drawing method was more effective than verbal case processing in increasing graduate students’ understanding of all five of the measured aspects of crisis counseling. Through the findings, Stone and Amundson concluded that metaphoric case drawings are a concise visual framework to integrate supervisees’ thoughts, feelings, and
experiences. Stone and Amundson (1989) examined the use of drawing in counselor trainee supervision and found that trainees in metaphoric drawing supervision presented more emotionally charged cases, met less often for supervision, and scored higher on greater understanding of client issues, client counselor relationships, and counselor development. They also identified that the students receiving supervision that included drawing perceived their supervision as having more value.

Durkin, Perach, Ramseyer, and Sontag (1989) proposed a model for art therapy supervision that involved both supervisor and supervisee engaging in artmaking and journal writing and periodically sharing both art and journal entries. They believed their model of art therapy supervision to be effective in generating self-reflection and asserted that it facilitated interpersonal richness into supervisory relationships, cut through to the core of many issues very quickly, and permitted access to three modes of communication: visual, verbal, and written.

Kielo (1991) conducted a qualitative inquiry of 11 art therapists’ post-session artmaking to address countertransference. She analyzed participant interviews, from which emerged five themes about the function of post-session artmaking by art therapists:

1. Developing empathy with the client
2. Clarifying the therapist’s feelings
3. Exploring the preconscious and unconscious
4. Differentiating the therapist’s feelings from the client’s
5. Exploring the therapeutic relationship

The literature strongly supports personal artmaking as an avenue toward wellness, self-awareness, and insight (Allen, 1995; McNiff, 1989). Artmaking in supervision has been framed
as a constructivist endeavor, one that requires active participation, invites self-reflection, and has the capacity to promote deep insights and self-awareness. Although these benefits are important for professional development, such experiential activities have the potential to create unintended and affect-laden responses, including threatening/disorienting feelings resulting from unintended self-disclosure and uncovering buried trauma (Deaver & Shiflett, 2011; Griffith & Frieden, 2000).

Williams (2000) considered a specific collage technique very effective in his supervision with nursing trainees working in potentially sensitive environments such as palliative care and mental health. In the approach Williams provided magazines from which supervisees could choose images and words to represent situations symbolically (rather than literally). The supervisor then facilitated guided reflection through a series of exploratory questions aimed at increasing the trainees’ self-awareness and learning. Williams pointed out an important aspect of using art in such contexts: The finished art piece became the focus of intense discussion in supervision and thus enhanced open communication between the supervisor and supervisee.

Fish (2008) conducted a mixed-methods study of 19 students’ perceptions of art-based supervision. In each supervision class, students made arts and discussed artwork that had been made in and outside of class. The last day of each semester, students completed a questionnaire and wrote about their art-based supervision experience. After three semesters, responses were aggregated and analyzed. Most of the students either agreed or strongly agreed that artmaking and discussion of artwork was a great tool of clinical supervision, although some expected more didactic discussion-based supervision.
Play Therapy Techniques in Supervision

Play therapy techniques can also be considered as a creative/expressive method to use in supervision. Borders and Leddick (1987) introduced six categories for supervisor intervention: learning goals, learning style, experience, developmental level, supervisor’s theoretical orientation, and supervisor’s goals for supervisees and for supervision. Practical play-based experiential techniques were applied to each category and discussed in detail to facilitate application. Borders and Leddick suggested that use of these techniques can expand the didactic framework of supervision and, thereby, enhance the supervisory and therapeutic processes.

As play therapy has been rapidly growing in recent decades, the need for professional supervision that is effective and meets the needs of novice play therapists has also been increasing (APT, 2013; Donald, Culbreth, & Carter, 2015). Mullen, Luke, and Drewes (2007) demonstrated that the use of play therapy techniques within supervision can enhance the supervisory process as well as play therapy with clients. Mullen et al. suggested that just as children use toys rather than words to express themselves in play therapy, supervisees can use play therapy techniques when words fail to express their experience or understanding of their clients.

Purswell and Stulmaker (2015) noted that using a sand tray, a technique of play therapy, can help supervisees focus on exploring their personal beliefs about counseling. Using sand tray in supervision, a supervisor might ask a supervisee to create a sand tray illustrating her feelings toward a certain client and then process the sand tray the supervisee made. Supervisors can discuss ways in which supervisees can use similar activities to express their feelings on their own or with the support of a colleague. Such a conversation could help supervisees make the
transition from supervisee to independent practitioner with the tools to self-supervise or find the collegial support needed.

The psyche (inner self) leads as the builder creates a story in the sand tray, and the builder is given access to express personal, familial, ancestral, archetypal, and spiritual experiences. The objects placed in the sand tray become a symbolic projection that resituates the client’s transference toward the objects in the tray rather than to the witnessing clinician (De Domenico, 2002, 2008; Graham et al., 2014; McNally, 2003; Rae, 1998).

The modality of sand tray in supervision allows supervisees to freely express and explore personal and professional growth as counselors. Stark, Frels, and Garza (2011) demonstrated that the modality of sand tray in supervision allows supervisees to freely express and explore personal and professional growth as counselors. Sand tray supervision is offered for a supervisee to process the world of the client, the group, the family, the world of the therapeutic issue, the world of the therapy, and the world of counselor. Supervisees are invited to present the case in the sand. The supervisor’s task is to observe the process with the supervisee. Stages of development for the counselor (builder) are assessed for skill building and plans for training. The supervisor has a window to observe how the builder perceives the dynamics as well as conceptualization of the presented case.

Dean (2001) demonstrated the process and benefits of incorporating sand tray consultation during supervision. Dean described sand tray therapy consultation as an intervention adjunctive to verbal therapy that can become a method integrated into the supervision process. Through her case study, Dean concluded that the sand tray consultation intervention offered several benefits to supervisees. Specifically, the process of observing reduced anxiety, created
distance for the supervisee to more accurately assess couple dynamics, and slowed down the therapy session, allowing time for supervisee reflection. As a result of this collaborative technique, supervisees experienced greater confidence, were less self-critical, and demonstrated a willingness to verbalize feelings of inadequacy during supervision.

**Mandala Drawing in Supervision**

Jackson, Muro, Lee, and DeOrnellas (2008) demonstrated the effect of mandala drawing in counselor supervision. They identified that the mandala activity is a private process of self-confrontation and self-expression that students can individually use when not in supervision. Jackson et al. suggested supervisors should use mandala drawings to help supervisees recognize personal and interpersonal dynamics existing for themselves and their clients. Through their case studies, Jackson et al. concluded that using mandalas in counselor supervision allows students to shift their attention from external preoccupations and concerns and connect to their own inner space (Barber, 2005; Nucho, 1987). Through the mandala, students discover where their energies are blocked, where their resistance lies, and in what roles and patterns they are stuck. By drawing mandalas, students can also discover and nourish the inner wisdom within them. Engaging in the activity encourages students’ inner genius to awaken, communicate, and express itself directly. Mandalas can help students construct powerful images to share with others. Through the mandala drawing, students can also share their inner realities with peers and supervisors in honest and open ways. Much evidence-based research has demonstrated that creating mandalas is an effective stress reducer (Curry & Kasser, 2005; Slegelis, 1987). In the study, Slegelis randomized participants into two conditions such as drawing within a square and drawing within
a circle and counted the numbers of angles and curved shapes within the squares versus the
circles. Slegelis found that drawn angular forms indicate frustration and anger, whereas curving
shapes and lines suggest a peaceful mind state. These results, congruent with Jung’s theory
regarding the healing nature of mandalas, suggest that drawing within the circle had a calming
effect on participants. Jackson, Muro, Lee, and DeOrnellas (2008) introduced mandala making in
a supervision group and discovered that their supervisees were calmed through the activity and
that mandala drawing was useful for increasing supervisee self-awareness and clarifying case
material.

**Mindfulness**

Bohecker, Vereen, Wells, and Wathen (2016) explored the lived experiences of 20
counselors-in-training (CITs) in a mindfulness experiential small group. In the research using
grounded theory, Bohecker et al. described a 5-dimensional model for navigating ambiguity and
identified that mindfulness training provides counselors in-training self-reflection skills and a
greater ability to manage cognitive complexity. Daniel, Borders, and Willse (2015) explored
whether supervisor and supervisee self-ratings of mindfulness predicted perceptions of the
supervisory relationship and session dynamics. The result showed that only supervisor self-
ratings of mindfulness predicted their own ratings of the supervisory relationship and session
dynamics. Fulton and Cashwell (2015) identified that mindfulness-based awareness and
compassion can be predictors of empathy and anxiety from 152 master’s-level counseling
interns. Results indicated that awareness and compassion differentially contributed to explaining
the variance in counselor empathy and anxiety. Graham, Scholl, Smith-Adcock, and Wittmann
(2014) applied creative approaches to a single case and demonstrated the effectiveness of bibliotherapy, psychodrama, and sand tray in the supervisory process.

**Bibliotherapy in Supervision**

Graham and Pehrsson (2009) introduced relationally based creative supervision interventions used by counselors and psychotherapists in their practices to deepen self-awareness and their connections with others. Specifically, Graham and Pehrsson (2009) offered a guide for bibliosupervision, a creative intervention that can be used when supervising counseling students. Bibliosupervision assists students in developing trust with the supervisor as well as trust in their own abilities as emerging counselors. This supervisory process promotes the exploration of themes that might otherwise be intimidating for or inaccessible to students. Graham and Pehrsson (2009) concluded that bibliosupervision, which draws from the theoretical and therapeutic constructs of bibliotherapy, deals with identification, catharsis, and insight for students learning and practicing counseling skills.

Graham (2014) developed a bibliosupervision model called the Graham model of bibliosupervision (GMB). In GMB, supervisors use fictional children’s literature to support the developmental processes of the supervisee by identifying, analyzing, or relating to the characters and storyline. Within the supervisory setting, this approach provides safety for the supervisee to engage in a dialogue about the story and thus to express emotions, thoughts, concerns, and issues that might be uncomfortable to talk about with supervisor. Graham et al. (2014) described the three-step process of using bibliosupervision:
1. **Identification:** Supervisees connect with characters and themes in the literature that link to counselor development.

2. **Catharsis:** Supervisees are able to process and understand emotions, thoughts, feelings, and behaviors as they relate to counselor development by their connection to the literature. Supervisees are able to verbally process their growth experiences in a supervisory setting that is safe and nurturing through the use of this technique.

3. **Insight:** Following catharsis, the supervisor and supervisee have constructive dialogue that aids the supervisee in self-awareness and growth that is consistent with counselor development and training (p. 417).

**Reflective Journaling in Supervision**

Strickel and Waltman (1994) contended that reflective journaling is an integral component of counseling practicum. They suggested that training in the reflective process, a formal component of many teacher education programs, needs to occur also in counselor training programs, particularly in the practicum experience. In the 1994 study, they introduced how a counselor can use reflection to provide a theoretical base for the articulation, analysis, and critique of a person’s evolving professional development.

Each practicum counselor will keep a journal, writing in it a minimum of one page per entry. The counselor will use the entries to work out the confusion, frustration, questions as well as the insights, hypotheses, possible interventions, and feelings of accomplishment that s/he is experiencing in dealing with a particular client. These entries should be very informal and should be written as soon as possible after the session, in order to get immediate impressions. (p. 5)

Others have also suggested reflective writing can be therapeutic. Lahad (2010) suggested writing is a way to communicate with oneself and with others. Free writing is an excellent tool to be used in supervision and to enable expression of feelings, processing delicate issues and
development of self-awareness. Cohen (1995) also suggested free writing for self-therapy considering a way to learn about our own masks and to look what is under them. Deaver and McAuliffe (2009) found that visual journaling facilitated all of the participants to get insight about themselves and their clients. Deaver and McAuliffe (2009) demonstrated the effectiveness of visual journaling techniques in reducing stress associated with the internship in study of counseling and art therapy interns’ experiences. Ganim and Fox (1999) developed techniques for transforming negative, stress-related imagery into more positive form. In the process, the journal keeper, having accessed some negative feeling or tension and having created an image of it, reflects on the journal entry and subsequently responds by transforming it into a different, positive image.

**Psychodrama in Supervision**

Psychodrama in supervision is also beneficial for supervisees to express and understand themselves. Hinkle (2008) applied a model for using psychodrama to address issues of parallel process during group supervision. Through a case vignette of the model, Hinkle provided information on how to utilize the specific concepts and techniques of psychodrama in relation to group supervision.

**Music & Movement in Supervision**

Power (2013) agreed that “messages being sent through music that are part of popular culture that may promote health or pathology” (Gladding, 2011, p. 38) and utilized music in group supervision of counselors-in-training. In the study, participants shared at least two pieces of music that they felt represented either the work they were doing with a specific client or a client’s current situation. This activity is designed to bring about cohesion between situations being addressed as well as assisted them in relating to their clients through a medium they regularly experienced in daily life.
Summary

This chapter explored the professional literature on clinical supervision, creative/expressive arts, creative/expressive arts in therapy and creative/expressive arts in counselor supervision. Clinical supervision is an intervention by a senior member of a profession with junior members or students of that same profession to enhance the supervisees’ functioning, monitor service quality, and serve as a gatekeeper for the profession. To optimize a supervisee’s professional growth, a supervisor’s role is crucial, although supervisees’ active participation is necessary for a successful supervision. The three major roles that supervisors flexibly take on, depending on the supervisee’s needs, are teacher, counselor, or consultant. Researchers agree that effective supervision encourages supervisee development and autonomy, facilitates the supervisory relationship, protects the client, and enhances both client and supervisee outcomes (Bernard & Goodyear, 2013; Falender & Shafranske, 2008; Gnilka, Chang, & Dew, 2012). Furthermore, a strong working alliance within the supervisory relationship is crucial to the success of the training experience and client welfare.

In the field of counselor education, practicum is one of most significant parts of curriculum that train students as a professional counselor. The practicum experience is a critical component in counselor education training in that practicum is the first opportunity to assess the student’s ability to apply the knowledge and skills obtained from course work with real clients in counseling session (CACREP, 2015). They are required to develop and prove their counseling skills by the end of the semester. Having a real client for the first time is exciting, but also can be anxious due to uncertainty, lack of competence, and fear of being evaluated by his/her instructor and clients.
In recent decades, however, much evidence-based research has demonstrated the effectiveness of using creative/expressive arts in clinical supervision (Brown, Meyerowitz-Katz, & Ryde, 2007; Graham et al., 2014; Lett, 1993; Robinson, 1992; Lahad, 2000; Lett, 1993). Expressive arts in supervision can be used to meet the goals of supervision and facilitate supervisees’ growth and development. Also, expressive arts group supervision can provide a way for trainees to use metaphor, images, fantasy, and symbols as means to conceptualize their clients, themselves, and the counseling and supervision processes. Many researchers have conducted studies about creative/expressive art supervision models, theories, and strategies. However, majority of past research about expressive art supervision focused on students’ reactions toward methods or techniques they experienced. As stated in the previous chapter, the current study addressed these limitations by exploring supervisors’ experiences and perceptions of using creative/expressive arts in practicum supervision and draw out the best practices of using creative/expressive arts in practicum supervision.
The purpose of this study is to explore counselor educators’ experiences and perceptions of using creative/expressive arts in practicum supervision. To achieve this, first, I examined how counselor educators facilitate practicum counselors’ professional growth using creative/expressive arts. Second, I identified the supervisors’ processes of practicum supervision when utilizing creative/expressive arts. Third, I explored potential factors of creative/expressive arts attributed to the facilitation of practicum students’ growth by analyzing supervisors’ experiences. Finally, I investigated supervisors’ perceptions of using creative/expressive arts for practicum students’ personal and professional growth.

To examine supervisor’s perceptions and experiences of using creative/expressive arts, I created one overarching research question and four sub-questions. The overarching research question is “What do counselor educators perceive and experience of using creative/expressive arts in practicum supervision?” The sub-questions are as follows:

1. What creative/expressive art techniques do counselor educators use in supervision for practicum students?
2. What is the decision-making process for counselor educators using creative/expressive arts in supervision?
3. How do counselor educators perceive the supervisory process as a result of using creative/expressive arts?

4. How does incorporating creative/expressive arts into supervision affect practicum students’ growth?

Rationale for Using Grounded Theory

For this study, I utilized grounded theory. Traditionally designated qualitative research designs include biographical, phenomenological, case study, ethnographic, and grounded theory (Denzin & Lincoln, 1994). Furthermore, qualitative approaches can be categorized into a) interactive methods where the researcher and the participant interact quite closely at times such as in ethnography, phenomenology, grounded theory, critical theory, case study, narrative inquiry, and survey studies and b) non-interactive approaches in which there is no interaction between the researcher and the participants or person of interest, including content analysis, historical research, and case study (Schreiber & Asner-Self, 2010).

In this study, grounded theory was adopted as a research paradigm to draw a comprehensive understanding of supervisors’ experiences and perceptions of using creative/expressive arts with practicum students. As defined by Strauss and Corbin (1990), “the grounded theory approach is a qualitative research method which uses a systematic set of procedures to develop an inductively derived grounded theory about a phenomenon” (p. 24). Charmaz (2006) defines grounded theory as a way to learn about the worlds we study and a method for developing theories to understand the reality of the world. Strauss and Corbin (1990) stated that grounded theory offers insight, enhances understanding, and provides a meaningful guide to action derived from data systematically gathered and analyzed through the research
process. Also, theories derived from data such as grounded theory are more likely to resemble reality than theories derived from putting together a series of concepts based on experience or solely on conjecture, which is how some think things ought to work.

Grounded theory intends to generate or discover a theory or abstract phenomenon that relates to a particular situation where little is known, and the theory provides a structured analytic procedure for collecting, analyzing, and coding data, allowing for a verification of emerging theory (Attridge, 2007). Grounded theory requires a theory to come out of the data but does not view data collection, analysis, and theory formulation as disconnected. Instead the process is considered reciprocal and interrelated, with the approach incorporating explicit procedures to guide the process. Research questions are open and general rather than formed as specific hypotheses, and emergent theory should account for a phenomenon that is relevant and problematic for those involved (Attridge, 2007; Becker, 1993).

The grounded theory method was adopted to balance the sensitivity of participants’ lived experiences with a scientific inquiry to aid in furthering conversation of this phenomenon. The primary aim of the current study was to study creative/expressive arts in practicum supervision. “Like any container into which different content can be poured, researchers can use basic Grounded theory guidelines such as coding, memo-writing, and sampling for theory development, and comparative methods are, in many ways, neutral” (Charmaz, 2006, p. 9). Because grounded theory captures the reality of the field of creative/expressive art supervision, I utilized this paradigm to gather data regarding supervisors’ experiences and perceptions of using creative/expressive arts in supervising practicum students.
Participants

To achieve the purpose of this study, I interviewed seven supervisors with experiences in using creative/expressive arts for practicum supervision in CACREP-accredited programs and analyzed their shared experiences and perceptions of using creative/expressive arts for practicum students’ optimal growth.

Several potential benefits to participation were identified:

- Contribute to the understanding of counselor education, specifically how practicum supervision is conducted.
- Help identify effective ways to use creative/expressive arts for practicum students who have unique needs.
- Reflect on their own experiences as a counselor educator and their perceptions of using creative/expressive arts in practicum supervision, thus expanding self-awareness.

CACREP Requirements for Practicum Supervisor

The Council for Accreditation of Counseling and Related Educational Programs (CACREP, 2015) provides requirements for supervisors in CACREP-accredited programs. During practicum, supervisees may interact with both university and site supervisors. The 2016 CACREP Standards indicate that university supervisors can be faculty members or doctoral students. Three criteria must be met for faculty members to be supervisors: a) hold a doctoral degree, b) hold a license, certification, or be able to “demonstrate competence in counseling,” and c) be trained in counseling supervision (p. 14). The criteria for doctoral students include a)
hold a master’s degree, b) be trained in supervision, and c) be supervised by faculty members. Site supervisors may be from various professions related to counseling, including licensed professional counselors, school counselors, psychiatrists, psychologists, social workers, marriage and family therapists, and psychiatric nurses (Guo & Wang, 2009). However, the current research focused on university supervisors and, thus, followed those requirements for identifying and recruiting the participants.

Criteria of Recruitment

Multiple-criteria were established to identify experts in the field of creative/expressive art supervision. The researcher developed the criteria to gather rich and reliable data based on CACREP requirements for practicum supervisor. Supervisors who participated in this study met the following criteria:

1. Have a recognized terminal degree in counselor education or a highly related field.
2. Have at least three years of experience teaching in counseling programs or a highly related field.
3. Have provided active professional clinical supervision using creative/expressive arts, creative methods, or playful interventions in practicum supervision for at least two years.
4. Have accomplished at least one of the following:
   a. Published one or more peer-reviewed article in a national journal on using creative/expressive arts, creative methods, or playful interventions in clinical supervision
b. Given national or regional presentation about using creative/expressive arts, creative methods, or playful interventions in clinical supervision.

The interviews took about 60-90 minutes and were conducted either in-person or through Skype, Adobe Connection, or phone depending on the location and availability of each participant. Only one of the participants was interviewed in person, four of them were on Skype, one was on the phone, and one met via Adobe Connection meeting.

Sampling Methods

Before engaging in this study, I submitted a research application to Northern Illinois University’s Institutional Review Board (IRB). Following IRB approval, I contacted prospective supervisors with expertise and knowledge in using creative/expressive arts in clinical supervision of practicum counselors.

I employed reputational and snowball sampling methods to recruit potential expert participants. As Schreiber and Asner-Self (2011) explain, “Reputational case sampling is when the person is chosen or a recommendation is made based on some criteria” (p. 96). In snowball sampling, after researchers find participants who meet selection criteria, then the researcher asks them to refer other potential participants who also meet the criteria and would be willing to participate in the study (Hays & Singh, 2012; Schreiber & Asner-Self, 2011). The purpose of this method is to gather more participants by utilizing existing professional networks and contacts. Used in conjunction, reputational and snowball sampling methods provided me a rich population of participants. Although many supervisors showed their interest in this study, some of them did not meet the criteria.
I utilized professional networks of counselors, counselor educators, and counselor education programs to find participants. These counseling-related organizations included the Association for Counselors and Educators & Supervision (ACES), the American Counseling Association (ACA), the American Art Therapy Association (AATA), and the Association for Play Therapy (APT). I first invited counselor educators with extensive knowledge and experience in using creative/expressive arts for practicum supervision to participate in the study via email. This request provided the outline of the selection criteria, invited them to participate in the research, and requested that names and contact information of additional potential research participants be sent to me. Once potential participants were identified, they were invited to participate through phone or email correspondence.

Data Collection Procedures

This study employed grounded theory, which is an approach for qualitative research to draw a general theory of a process or interaction rooted in the perspectives of the participants (Creswell, 2009; Martin & Turner, 1986). Grounded theory includes four components: constant data comparison, emerging categories, memo writing, and theoretical sampling of different sources and groups (Creswell, 2009; Wang, 2008).

Data collection for the current study was conducted through an interview process. The researcher emailed prospective expert participants an informational invitation letter, a demographic form to complete, a consent form, and a copy of the IRB consent for research. Before the interview, participants were given an informed consent form and an explanation that the interview would be audio recorded.
Interviews were conducted either in-person or utilizing technology such as Skype or other forms of online synchronous communication depending on the location of participants. Open-ended interview protocols were used to guide discussions. All interviews were recorded using a digital audio recorder. Following the interview, each interview was transcribed into a Word document by the researcher and a transcribing service. Interview transcripts were analyzed using N-Vivo software. Early analysis of the initial interviews was used to determine if follow-up interviews would be necessary.

**Interview Guide**

To address this proposed study’s primary goal, interview questions were developed to generate feedback on using creative/expressive arts in counseling practicum supervision for supervisees’ professional growth including commonly used expressive art techniques, effects on practicum students’ growth, the decision-making process, and supervisory process.

The interview questions and related research questions are as follows:

1. How did you get into creative/expressive art supervision? (RQ2 & RQ3)
2. What is your supervision model? (RQ2 & RQ3)
3. What creative/expressive arts do you typically use in counseling practicum? (RQ1)
4. Over the course of a semester, do your techniques change? If so, how do they change? And why? (RQ1 & RQ2)
5. What are some considerations when using creative/expressive arts in practicum supervision? (RQ2)
6. What is your goal for using creative/expressive arts in practicum? (RQ2 & RQ3)
7. How do you think practicum students experience creative/expressive arts in supervision? (RQ3 & RQ4)

8. What forms of supervision (e.g., individual, triadic, and group) do you plan to optimize the effectiveness of using creative/expressive arts in practicum supervision? Why? (RQ2 & RQ3)

9. What creative/expressive art techniques do you think have the best student results in practicum supervision? (RQ4)

10. When you think about supervising practicum students using creative/expressive arts, what is an example that stands out to you as something that worked well? What did that look like? (RQ4)

11. Can you think of an example when creative/expressive arts did not work as well as hoped? What did that look like? Have you faced any other challenges? (RQ4)

12. What did you learn from this experience? (RQ2 & RQ3)

I used most or all of the interview questions for each participant and created follow up questions as needed to gather more data (see Appendix C). To guide the interview more effectively, an interview protocol was developed based on the interview questions and utilized during the data collection. The interview protocol was as follows:

Hi, how are you? I am Oksoon, Lee, a doctoral candidate in the Counselor Education and Supervision program at Northern Illinois University. Thank you so much for your time and your interest in my research. I would like to ask you the following questions:

1. How did you get into creative/expressive art supervision?
2. What is your supervision model besides using creative/expressive art techniques?
   How to incorporate your supervision model into creative/expressive art supervision?
   Did it fit well?

3. What creative/expressive arts do you typically use in counseling practicum? Why?
   What are your favorite ones? Anything else?

4. Over the course of a semester do your techniques change? If so, how do they change?
   And why?

5. What are some considerations when using creative/expressive arts in practicum supervision?

6. What is your goal for practicum by using creative/expressive arts? Anything else?

7. How do you think practicum students experience creative/expressive arts in supervision?

8. What forms of supervision (e.g., individual, triadic, and group) do you use to optimize the effectiveness of using creative/expressive arts in practicum supervision?
   Why?

9. What creative/expressive art techniques do you think have the best student results in practicum supervision? Anything else?

10. When you think about supervising practicum students using creative/expressive arts, what is an example that stands out to you as something that worked well? What did that look like?
11. Can you think of an example when creative/expressive arts didn’t work as well as hoped? What did that look like? Have you faced any other challenges? Anything else?

12. What did you learn from this experience? Anything else?

13. Finally, what would like to say to counselor educators, who newly try creative/expressive arts for practicum students? Is there anything else you would like to add?

Again, thank you so much for your time and active responses. Your interview will greatly contribute to developing the creative/expressive practicum supervision method.

Trustworthiness

Trustworthiness was achieved by outlining and reporting the steps of the data collection and analysis, and triangulation and by writing data collection and analysis. Additionally, member checks were offered for participants to review transcripts for accuracy. The committee monitored the steps of data collection and analysis and provided feedback and suggestions for changes as necessary.

Trustworthiness was ensured by implementing interviews in a trusted and comfortable place and at times convenient for the participants. The researcher attempted to create a comfortable atmosphere and checked in with participants during interviews to ask how they were feeling about the time, context, and interview questions.
Data Saturation

To enhance credibility, the interviews were conducted until saturation was reached. Saturation was reached after seven interviews were completed. Additional participants were not sought because commonly-shared perspectives and experiences emerged. Data came from the interview transcripts, the supervisors’ information forms, and the researcher notes. All data were protected and stored within a password protected file on my personal laptop with a security passcode. The steps of data analysis are described in the following sections.

Data Analysis

Through the data collection procedures, I created transcripts of interviews. According to Miles, Huberman, and Saldana (2014), reflection through memos can assist researchers in identifying and addressing their own biases about the phenomenon being studied and their reactions to participants’ statements. I wrote memos through the data collection and analysis processes. As a qualitative researcher, my role was “to make sense out of this plethora of information” (Schreiber & Asner-self, 2011, p. 271). McCracken (1988) stated that the object of data analysis is to determine the categories, relationships, and assumptions that inform each respondent’s view of the world and topic at hand. For this, as Schreiber and Asner-Self (2011) suggested, I repeatedly looked at words, phrases, observed behaviors, and documents to identify meaningful discoveries, implications, and conclusions.

For the data analysis process, I adopted the triad steps suggested by Wolcott (1994). He introduced description, analysis, and interpretation as strategies to transform data, identifying them as three primary components of qualitative research. Description is a process of presenting
the participants’ accounts close to the original data. Analysis extended the data beyond
descriptive accounts by identifying key factors and key relationships in the descriptive data. This
process highlighted overarching themes and patterns in the data. In this process, “the researcher
transcends factual data and cautious analysis and begins to probe into what is to be made of
them” (Wolcott, 1994, p. 36).

Coding Process

To code and analyze the data, I utilized open-coding and NVivo. For the first level of
analysis, an open-coding method was used. Lawrence-Lightfoot and Davis (1997) recommended
that the interpretive and analytic process should begin immediately and thread its way through
data collection until it becomes the central activity of synthesizing, sorting, and organizing data.
In the open-coding, I reviewed each participant’s interview transcript and highlighted meaningful
parts to identify key factors and themes.

N-Vivo Software

For the second level of analysis, I utilized NVivo software, which is useful for
developing a bottom up approach, whereby categories are drawn from the content of the data
(Strauss, 1987). NVivo developed codes for categories of cross-cases as well as single cases.
Simultaneously drawing all sorts of data from transcripts, pictures, video-recorded materials, and
textual resources enabled me to visualize codes and categories, examine relationships between
data and participants, and thus developed a second level analysis through these functions.
Analytical Memos

For the reliability and validity of the study, I utilized reflective memos, so-called research journals, and member checking. As Hayes and Singh (2011) identified, the reflective journal included thoughts about how the research process was impacting me as the researcher. The research journal allowed me to reflect and address my own biases, my successes and challenges through the research process, and my hunches about potential patterns and themes (Barth, 2015).

Member Checks

Member checks, which is a respondent validation, were systematically used to solicit feedback about the data and conclusions from the people I was studying (Maxwell, 2013). In this study, member checking was completed twice. First, I provided each participant the transcript of the interview to ensure I had accurately represented what they discussed in the interview. The second check was completed when I looked for patterns and themes within each case and across cases. I sent my analyses to the participants to gather their feedback. The second check allowed the participants to see how their perceptions and experiences fit within the whole group.
CHAPTER 4
RESULTS

The purpose of this study was to explore supervisors’ experiences and perceptions of using creative/expressive arts in practicum supervision. Specifically, I (a) examined how supervisors facilitate practicum counselors’ professional growth using creative/expressive arts, (b) identified their processes of practicum supervision when utilizing creative/expressive arts, (c) explored potential factors of creative/expressive arts attributed to the facilitation of practicum counselors’ growth by analyzing supervisors’ experiences, and (d) investigated supervisors’ perceptions of using creative/expressive arts for practicum counselors’ personal and professional growth.

One overarching research question guided this study: “What do counselor educators perceive and experience of using creative/expressive arts in practicum supervision?” Four sub-questions supported this question:

1. What creative/expressive art techniques do supervisors use in supervision for practicum students?

2. What is the decision-making process for educators using creative/expressive arts in supervision?

3. How do supervisors perceive the supervisory process as a result of using creative/expressive arts?

4. How does incorporating creative/expressive arts into supervision affect practicum students’ growth?
To achieve the purpose of this study, I conducted interviews with the seven supervisors with knowledge and experience using creative/expressive arts in practicum supervision. Interview questions (see Appendix C) also were created to gather key information necessary and relevant to using creative/expressive arts in supervision for practicum students. Exploring participants’ perceptions and experiences of using creative/expressive arts in practicum supervision may help other supervisors, clinical supervisors, counselors, school counselors, educators, and other stakeholders to develop and implement methods, approaches, modules, and integrative strategies. Therefore, the ultimate goal of this study was to inform supervisors about best educational practices using creative/expressive arts to enhance counseling practicum students’ personal and professional growth.

This chapter explores findings that developed through analysis of data based on the research questions. The purpose of this chapter is to share themes established through the experiences and perspectives shared by supervisors who participated in this study. The following themes emerged: creative/expressive art techniques, decision-making process, supervisory process, and influence on students’ growth. This chapter concludes with a summary of findings.

Participants

Seven counseling practicum supervisors participated in this study. Six have a Ph.D. in counselor education or another highly related field with three years or more of teaching experience. One additional participant does not have teaching experience but has used creative/expressive arts in counseling and clinical supervision for eight years and was included with committee approval. All participants have licensure and can provide clinical supervision.
Table 4.1 displays the participants’ gender, age range, race/ethnic background, number of years teaching in counselor education and supervision, number of years using creative/expressive arts in practicum supervision, state in which they were currently working, degree/major, and licensure. Five of seven participants identified as female, and two identified as male. Four were in the 35 to 44 years in age category, one was in the 45 to 54 category, and one was more than 65. Regarding race/ethnicity, four identified as Caucasian, and two identified as Hispanic, and one identified as Asian.

Table 4.1

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Participant</th>
<th>Gender</th>
<th>Age Range</th>
<th>Race/Ethnic background</th>
<th># of years teaching in counseling</th>
<th># of years using C/E arts in Practicum Supervision</th>
<th>State(s) where currently working</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Alex</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>35-44</td>
<td>Hispanic</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>West South Central</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ann</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>45-54</td>
<td>Caucasian</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>East South Central</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lisa</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>65+</td>
<td>Hispanic</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>South Atlantic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mike</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>35-44</td>
<td>Caucasian</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>East North Central</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sarah</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>35-44</td>
<td>Asian</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>Middle Atlantic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emily</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>35-44</td>
<td>Caucasian</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>South Atlantic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jenny</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>35-44</td>
<td>Caucasian</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>8 (in counseling)</td>
<td>Pacific</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

As Table 4.1 shows, the range of experience teaching in counseling programs varied from 5 to 35 years. Two participants had 21 and 35 years, whereas the rest ranged from 5 to 7 years. In
addition, the range of experience using creative/expressive arts in practicum supervision also varied from 4 to 30, with the highest being 15 and 30, and the rest ranging from 4 to 8.

Participants represent cross multiple regions of the United States: West South Central, East South Central, South Atlantic, East North Central, Middle Atlantic, South Atlantic, and Pacific.

Participant Biographies

This section presents individual information on participants interviewed for the study. Before interviews were conducted, participants completed a demographic form to provide gender, age, race/ethnic background, years of teaching experience in counseling education, years of using creative/expressive arts in practicum supervision, and the state or states in which they were working. In addition, they provided credential information on terminal degree and major, licensure, publications, and presentations. Table 4.2 displays their credential information.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Participant</th>
<th>Highest Degree</th>
<th>Field of Degree</th>
<th>Licensure</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Alex</td>
<td>Ph.D.</td>
<td>Counseling</td>
<td>LPC-S, RPT-S, CHST</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ann</td>
<td>Ph. D</td>
<td>Counselor</td>
<td>LPCC, NCC, RPT-S</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lisa</td>
<td>Ph.D.</td>
<td>Marriage and Family Counseling</td>
<td>RPT-S, ATR, LMFT</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table continued on next page
Table cont. from previous page

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Degree</th>
<th>Field</th>
<th>Certifications</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mike</td>
<td>Ph.D.</td>
<td>Counselor Education and</td>
<td>LCPC, CCMHC, NCC, ACS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Supervision</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sarah</td>
<td>Ph.D.</td>
<td>Counseling</td>
<td>RPT-S, LPC, ACS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emily</td>
<td>Ph.D.</td>
<td>Counseling</td>
<td>LPC-S, NCC, RPT, NBCT</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jenny</td>
<td>MA.</td>
<td>Counseling Psychology</td>
<td>LMFT</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Alex

Alex has a Ph.D. in counseling and is a Licensed Professional Counselor-Supervisor (LPC-S), a Registered Play Therapist – Supervisor (RPT-S), and a Certified Humanistic Sandtray Therapist (CHST). Alex has been an assistant professor at a CACREP-accredited counseling program in West South Central, using creative/expressive arts in practicum supervision for seven years. Alex has presented on creative/expressive arts and supervision at four professional conferences.

Ann

Ann has a Ph.D. in counselor education and has been a professor for 21 years in counselor education and supervision programs in East South Central. She has used creative/expressive arts for practicum supervision for 15 years and has been part of a CACREP-accredited counseling program for 16 years. She identified as a Licensed Professional Clinical Counselor (LPCC), a National Certified Counselor (NCC), and a Registered Play Therapist – Supervisor (RPT-S) and has published journals about using creative/expressive arts in
supervision in professional journals. Ann has presented more than four times on topics related to creative/expressive arts supervision at professional conferences.

Lisa

Lisa has a Ph.D. in marriage and family counseling and has been a counselor educator in counselor education and supervision for 35 years in counselor education, and 10 out of the 35 years, she has taught at a CACREP-accredited program. She had used creative/expressive arts for practicum supervision for 30 years. Lisa is a Registered Play Therapist – Supervisor (RPT-S), a Registered Art Therapist (ATR), and a Licensed Marriage and Family Therapist (LMFT). Lisa has published articles in a professional journal and books about creative/expressive arts supervision. Lisa has presented on topics related to creative/expressive arts supervision more than a hundred times. Lisa is currently counseling, researching, and training in South Atlantic.

Mike

Mike has a Ph.D. in counselor education and supervision and is a Licensed Clinical Professional Counselor (LCPC), a Certified Clinical Mental Health Counselor (CCMHC), a National Certified Counselor (NCC), and an Approved Clinical Supervisor (ACS). Mike has been teaching in a counselor education and supervision program as well as a clinical mental health counseling program for five years in East North Central. Mike has used creative/expressive arts in practicum supervision for four years.
Sarah

Sarah has a Ph.D. in counseling and has been teaching in counselor education. She has used creative/expressive arts for practicum supervision for six years in Middle Atlantic, with two years in a CACREP-accredited program. She is a Licensed Professional Counselor (LPC), an Approved Clinical Supervisor (ACS), and a Registered Play Therapist-Supervisor (RPT-S). Sarah has presented on topics related to creative/expressive arts in supervision more than 10 times at professional conferences.

Emily

Emily has a Ph.D. in counseling and has been teaching for five years in a CACREP-accredited counseling program in South Atlantic, using creative/expressive arts for practicum supervision. She is a Licensed Professional Counselor-Supervisor (LPC-S), a National Certified Counselor (NCC), a Registered Play Therapist (RPT), a National Board Certified Teacher (NBCT). Emily has published an article about creative/expressive arts supervision in a professional journal and has presented on topics related to creative/expressive arts more than three times at professional conferences.

Jenny

Jenny has an M.A. in Counseling Psychology. She has no teaching experience but has used creative/expressive arts in counseling and supervision for eight years in the division of Pacific. She is a Licensed Marital and Family Therapist (LMFT).
Categories of Themes

Four categories of themes emerged from the findings: creative intervention, decision-making process, supervisory process, and professional growth.

Category #1: Creative Interventions
What creative/expressive art techniques do supervisors use in supervision for practicum students?

Participants in this study utilized various types of creative/expressive arts with their practicum students: drawing, painting, visual arts, music, journaling, drama, guided imagery, sand tray, puppet, and play genogram, using small toy figures to represent different family members. They also mentioned numerous other kinds of creative/expressive arts supervisors can use to optimize students’ personal and professional growth.

Visual Arts

Ann, Lisa, Emily, and Mike shared how they encouraged students to draw their feelings and experiences with clients to help them learn about clients and become aware of those relationships. Through creative/expressive art practices, students not only gained useful counseling skills but also developed self-awareness by drawing feelings and thoughts about themselves. Ann said: “I want them to draw what their experience was because it’s not just them learning about themselves; they also have to be more aware of clients and really working on empathy and those basic counseling skills.”

Emily also explained how to encourage students to express what they want a person/thing to be. “It’s interesting to me to watch how prescriptive they still want things to be. I’ll have them
draw pictures of what their week was like. I’ll have them do a beginning of the week or end of
the week.”

Mike noted the power of metaphor for describing students’ professional growth and
shared an example of using drawing activity as a group:

They draw a metaphor for where they are at their stage of development in their
professional career -- how they see themselves -- in the beginning of the semester and at
the end of the semester. We compare the symbolic meanings and themes, not only
individually, but I pull collectively other themes from the group.

When Lisa thinks practicum students’ verbal expression is not enough to understand, she
encourages students to “draw a picture of that person or draw a picture of themselves when
they’re sitting in the room that is colored to show when they see don’t see that person.”

Jenny helps students visualize what they think, feel, value, and want by creating collages
about themselves, their clients, and their families. She encourages students to use magazines,
newspapers, and found materials to create images to explore their experiences.

Music

Alex encourages students to bring in music that inspires them or expresses their
perceptions to promote self-care. “This semester students brought in a song that brought them
inspiration, which was cool because then we’d play the songs and then we talked about how
there are going to be rough days.”

Mike uses music videos for practicum students.

The music video has certain themes about struggle, about change, about hopelessness,
about seeking out help. It’s meant to kind of tap into that and access some of those
aspects of the students’ clinical work. I want it to be purposeful but also flexible and
ambiguous enough that it can take students in many different directions. I’m looking for
something that’s readily accessible to those types of themes emerging.
Journal Writing

Ann noted journaling is the easiest and quickest way for students to describe sessions and process the feelings and thoughts they had during key moments. “Students feel much more comfortable at first writing down their thoughts and feelings before sharing them verbally. Anything to get them to feel more comfortable expressing themselves.”

Lisa has students combine journaling and drawing/coloring: “You’re writing down thoughts and phrases that come into your mind, making a note of how your body felt, and it’s different after that client walked out the door.”

Play and Sand Tray

Using sand tray figurines, Alex’s students pick a figure that represents how they feel at the moment: “I’ll ask them to talk as if they were that figure.” Sara utilizes sand tray when students start to see clients, so they can explore their clients’ world and think about where they are in their world.

I ask them to just imagine their client’s world based on the sessions that they had. Sometimes I ask supervisees to pick their figure and then ask, “Where do you think you are in terms of your client’s world?” They like that. They have a little bit deeper understanding of the client’s life when I do that.

Lisa has students make up a story about their own or their clients’ experience. “I might ask somebody to make up a story that has a beginning, a middle and an end. The story might either be about themselves in relationship to this client, or the issue they think the client has.”

Alex uses puppets as a form of triadic supervision. He encourages one student to take the role of client and another student to take the counselor role by using puppets. In this way,
students can experience their clients’ point of view, while another student can practice counseling skills. Alex explained that he uses this practice. Alex shared one activity to encourage students to see themselves by asking his students to imagine they are a common object. He explained that he does this activity occasionally, or sometimes every week, in practicum class.

He uses the following questions:

- Imagine you are a common object.
- What object are you?
- Describe yourself? (I am a _____. I have a _____. I look like ______.)
- What would your life be like?
- How would you be used?
- How would you feel as the object?
- In what ways does this connect with you now as a person?

Ann also uses reflective questions to encourage practicum students to explore and express themselves. She challenges them to think about their reactions to the clients as well as their perceptions of their effectiveness in working with the clients.

### Category #2: Decision-Making Process

What is the decision-making process for educators using creative/expressive arts in supervision?

When choosing creative/expressive arts, participants seriously considered practicum students’ unique needs, their own supervision models and theories, and ethics. All participants stressed supervisors should be able to fully utilize the power of creative/expressive arts for supervisees’ professional growth. Additionally, all chose various supervision techniques as related to differing class structures at the semester’s beginning, middle, and end.
Participants believed a combination of supervision models/theories were an important part of their decision-making process in using creative/expressive arts. Ann shared:

I definitely like looking at the developmental model [in terms of] where students are as they grow from practicum forward. I tend to be more humanistic and have a strong systemic family therapy background. We could look at it as Gestalt. Gestalt is very much about creating. We learn through experience. You become more self-aware through having experiences. Visual art, journaling, creative, expressive arts is very experiential. It makes sense then to incorporate that.

Lisa also shared her “reflective and collaborative” supervision model. She contended that students should examine what they believe and value before starting to work with clients. To achieve this process, Sarah utilizes the discrimination model.

I believe that by the time they come to practicum, they have already a lot of skills. We review the skills. We review the code of ethics. I think expressive arts work best with that purpose, because oftentimes they don’t know they are focusing more on their own needs rather than client’s needs.

Similar to Sarah, Emily also employs the discrimination model. Although Emily is “a big fan of Rogerian,” she also utilizes cognitive approaches, such as reframing, to encourage students to perceive a current situation in a different way, so they might figure out better solution.

For supervision, I often go with a discrimination model – I find flexibility there. A student may come in one week presenting one way, just like our clients do. The next week, they may come in and present very differently with a different issue, or with no issues, or with the issue under control. At the same time, I like a cognitive approach. I like re-framing. If this is how it is and we can’t change this, then what’s another perspective?
Mike also mainly uses the discrimination model as his base supervision framework for understanding where to go with students. He explained the model is flexible and can integrate “different types of modalities or interventions.”

For example, if I use a metaphor, I have them do a metaphor technique of maybe their path, how they envision their path toward becoming a counselor. I keep in mind the discrimination model to draw out and guide the activity. I think it fits just because, at least in the discrimination model, it’s very flexible and so you can integrate different types of modalities or interventions.

Jenny uses the respectful model to guide her practicum supervision. “If you take respectful as an acronym, it’s race, ethnicity, socioeconomic, preference, sexual preference. It’s a multicultural kind of model that you think about when working with students, and so the big takeaway for that is to not make assumptions.”

Ethical Considerations

Ann sets an ethical boundary related to the discrimination model’s counselor role and checks readiness to share through creative/expressive arts techniques.

I want to make sure I do no harm to students. I do not want to become their counselor. Sometimes that’s kind of a little blurry. [I want to be sure] they don’t feel like they have to share something that they’re not ready for and that I’m not manipulating the situation for my personal benefit. Using expressive arts can be a way for them to address their blind spots or their personal issues.

Like Ann, Alex considers students’ readiness and respects their choices, even when that means not sharing. He does not go deep when using creative/expressive art at the beginning of a semester because he knows students do not know each other well. He tells students they have the right to say “pass” if they are not ready or do not want to share.
Jenny also emphasized being an ethical supervisor and noted she does not know students well at the beginning of the semester. Instead student work guides her: “One person’s creative expression might say something to me that maybe I need to check in with. I try not to make assumptions because I don’t know.”

Designing Practicum Class with Creative/Expressive Arts

Changes over Semester: Participants reported they choose different art techniques and different way to utilize them over the semester. Alex said, “When they have their initial figure, I’m a lot more cautious and careful as to how much is revealed because I know students don’t know me that well. I look at least control to most control. Something students can control will potentially feel safer, so I’ll try that earlier in the semester, rather than later.” Alex explained:

At the beginning of the semester, we would have a couple more, because we’re building structure. After that, we have to cover some things, and typically there are those the weeks I’m not able to do any creative approaches. After midterm, when everyone was like, “I’m so tired of working and doing this other,” I was kind of like, “Let’s bring in a song that you identify with that gives you inspiration . . . then we’d play the songs, and talk about how there are going to be rough days. It’s kind of a self-care hour.

Sarah also chooses fun and playful techniques at the beginning of the semester to help students express themselves and get to know each other, but once students start to see clients, Sarah mainly uses sand tray.

The beginning is usually the coat-of-arms activity to help them see their strengths. They’re just having fun and actually are revealing a lot. I use sand tray a lot and they take a turn. Most trays show the client’s world. At the end, what do I do? I don’t have much time left at the end of the semester to do expressive arts but some of the assignments in my practicum are to run a mock group, and a student will pick a population and I will pick a topic. If they become a group member, they come and do role playing.
Practicum Class Structure: Alex has three sessions of triadic supervision and then whole group supervision class on the same day. He believes this time frame helps him see what is happening with each student, so there is no need to check-in again in the large group. Ann shared her typical practicum class starts with checking in to see everyone is doing well and if they need something from the class. “Then I will also have my own agenda, some things that I want to do or cover. But I may find that maybe they had a really rough week or maybe they had a client that triggered some things in them.” Sarah also explained how she begins the first practicum class. “I ask them to draw something. The first question is where is your sanctuary/your favorite place? The second question is what are you good at?”

Emily typically starts her classes by checking in with everyone. “Sometimes I’ll take my miniatures, dump them on the table, and have everybody choose one object representative of how their week was, how they’re feeling today, [and] how they’re feeling about the semester. That gives me a good gauge. I’ll also have them draw pictures of what their week was like.”

Alex tries to bring something new to every class, like playing a brand new instrument.

I think of me doing something brand new for the first time and how potentially it might feel, if I was doing something brand new. Even thinking about it in terms of not only just the counseling profession, but any time we try something brand-new, being prepared to have that same feeling that your students might potentially have that experience as well. It seems like he’s trying to be empathic with supervisees here.

Lisa has a plan for trying new things: “I pour over new books to see what people are doing. I then try to fit those into supervision. I like the use of narrative therapies.” Alex stressed the importance of flexibility when using creative/expressive arts in practicum class: “Flexibility is a major key in the expressive arts approach. Having multiple avenues. You might have a sand tray available, but you also have your paper markers and pens available or puppetry.”
Suggestions for Using Creative/Expressive Arts in Practicum Supervision

All participants provided suggestions for supervisors who want to use creative/expressive arts in practicum supervision. Participants suggested choosing easily accessible materials and stressed the need to give students options. All agreed feeling safe enough to express is crucial in using creative/expressive arts in practicum supervision. For this amount of safety to occur, establishing a relationship before using creative/expressive arts is important. Participants also noted the importance of students understanding creative/expressive arts in practicum supervision does not require artistic talent and there is no right or wrong way to express themselves. Participants cautioned students should also be allowed to have a right to pass if they do not want to share or are not ready to show themselves.

Supervisors who try new techniques first need to try those techniques themselves. Participants stressed that supervisors should not use students to experiment with techniques and suggested supervisors using expressive/creative arts in supervision ask themselves “why am I doing this?” Participants also stressed the importance of flexibility and considering supervisees’ cultural aspects and diversity. They urged supervisors be sensitive and pay attention to process when using creative/expressive arts in practicum supervision rather than results, the artwork.

Alex explained supervisors have many topics to cover in a limited time and should try to be efficient with resources. For example, he noted the ease of doing “visual art or guided imagery because those things are very easily accessible rather than maybe doing clay work or sculpting because I’d have to get that prepared beforehand.”

Jenny gives students options and encourages them to choose art materials because every student has different preferences that change over time.
Somebody who loves clay might not play with music, and somebody who loves music might not want to do sand tray, so it’s important to have options, especially with students. They change their mind a lot. I give them the option, like we can, I’ll say, “I’d like to try something today, these are your choices. You can use clay, sand, music, and then I’ll let my client choose or my supervisee.

Alex chooses material most familiar for students to create a safety-network, especially at the beginning of the semester. When using creative/expressive arts in supervision, he emphasized helping students feel safe to express their ideas is more important than focusing on the material itself.

My word of caution anytime I’m working with students or even talking to other people who use expressive arts is making sure you have that safety net before creating any of these approaches; without it, they feel threatened and disrespected. Make sure you have the relationship before doing something outside of the box. It can be very intimidating, or it can scare them.

Mike emphasized knowing students and building rapport with supervisees as important to using creative/expressive arts successfully in supervision.

You can gauge the room by just knowing the types of students and the personality styles. Some may be, in the beginning, defensive; some may be very analytical, very cognitive, and maybe resistant to it, so maybe I’d want to wait a couple weeks, build more rapport, maybe introduce more maybe affective-based, emotionally based questioning to kind of normalize that to the group.

Jenny noted establishing a safe and non-judgmental environment is crucial in using creative/expressive arts. She described a class in which she “did a class sand tray and everybody picked out a figure that represented them, and one of the students got her feelings hurt because she felt like she didn’t understand what the directions were and picked something that was not really her and it scared her because she was afraid that there was judgement.”

Mike emphasized the importance of the supervisory relationship in working with practicum students using creative expressive arts.
It depends on the conditions you’ve already put into place in the very beginning, such as creating ground rules, providing a disclosure statement, and clarifying the expectations of supervision. It can facilitate the relationship and grow a stronger bond. Once you’re able to have a strong relationship, then you can be more risk taking with trying out new creative supervision techniques, because your students trust you more.

Jenny talked about being a role model as a professional requires balancing being vulnerable and reliable to students. “I think that safety is a big deal both personally for students and also to model how to work with clients. I try to have a balance between being vulnerable to them, making mistakes and modeling that, and also being reliable and credible as an instructor.”

Alex reassures students he is not looking for artistic talent in creative/expressive art supervision.

I’ll often do puppet work that requires the supervisee to be a little silly. I’m not going to do that right off the bat. I’m going to need a safety network and I know I’m going to need a relationship to do that. I might start off with something that’s easily controlled, which is usually a drawing, and ask the students not to draw perfection because I’m not really looking for the artistic drawing.

Sarah also admitted that word is ok here that she tells students, “I’m the worst artist actually. I can’t even draw a stick figure.” Similarly, Alex uses himself as an example of a horrible artist: “I can’t draw anything, but I still try. The idea is not that you create the perfect drawing, it’s that you try to express what it is, and you’ll get a chance to talk about it.”

Lisa reported students initially think there is a right or wrong way and try to do the “right things” they believe their supervisors want.

They’re already anxious going into it. I’ve even had people with sand tray who say, ‘I’m not really sure if this is what you want.’ Or, ‘I wasn’t sure what you were asking me to do, so I just did this.’ Communicating that ‘whatever they do is fine,’ that’s probably one of the biggest hurdles there is about this whole process.
Alex shared how he chooses creative/expressive art materials for his practicum students. He declared that his strategy is to move from the most controlled to least controlled materials, as Lowenfeld (1957) suggested.

I’ll typically start with a drawing, because that seems to be more controlled. I have a good slide on, when I teach expressive arts, of most controlled approaches to least controlled. That wasn’t something I made up, I think it’s [Viktor] Lowenfeld, and it just shows, using a pencil and paper is more controlled than moving to a marker or a crayon, or than your felts.

Alex, Ann, Sarah, and Jenny concurred about trying a new technique for themselves before using it with supervisees, so they could experience the process first and be familiar with the approach. They all believed supervisors can figure out the most effective way to use new approaches with practicum students by testing it on themselves first, which is also reflected in practicum students trying an approach before using it with clients. Jenny stated, “I think they need to experience it for themselves before they teach it.”

Alex emphasizes not using students or clients for practice. He always tells his students “do the thing yourself first.” He cautioned they should never say, “I’m going to do the Rosebush technique, when you’ve never done the Rosebush as a client. Knowing what the approach has brought out for you hopefully will let you know what it might bring out in a client.” Similar to Alex, Ann encourages her practicum students to do a strategy personally and learn the approach before using it rather than “oh I learned about this technique. This seems interesting. I just want to try it out.”

Alex stresses that supervisors need to be careful to not go too deeply at the beginning as students open up through their art works and to allow them to pass without fear.

When I do the initial one and they have their initial figure, I’m a lot more cautious and careful as to how much is revealed, how much is opened up because I know that the
students don’t know me that well, it’s the beginning of the semester. Every time I do one of these, we do them in a group format. I’ll often talk to the group beforehand that you have the right to pass. You’re not going to be counted off or anything, I just want this to be something to try out.

Alex has students describe their plan for working with their clients. He challenges them to explain why they made that choice and encourages them to prepare plan B in case that the client is not ready or does not want to do. He offers an example of “When a student says, ‘Oh I’m planning on doing sand tray,’ I’m like ‘Well, why are you planning on doing it? ‘Have the rationale for it, and then how do you naturally put it into session and be ready to be prepared to do something else if that’s not what the client’s ready for or wants to do.”

Mike has a similar perspective. He thinks about intention and benefits for students when he selects a creative/expressive art technique.

What is the intended impact? I think that’s a parallel with our clinical work, right? Regardless of what type of intervention we employ, we need to have a very clear intention and rationale for why we are deciding to introduce this intervention. How is this going to benefit the group or the client or the students? That’s what I guess guides at the very base level, guides all my decisions. What is the intended outcome and perhaps what might be some unintended consequences.

Mike noted that when supervisors choose a creative/expressive art technique, they need to check if there is an urgent need to meet and if it is valuable enough to use the limited time.

We just need to make sure we cover a lot of administrative stuff or if there’s a crisis that has been occurring from previous weeks at a site that you need to follow up. So just wanting to gauge the room where they’re at, whether it’s worth devoting time to giving the limited amount of time. So those are just some ways I would gauge the room and gauge the group.

Alex identified time limitations. “For practicum, often I’m suffering with a time-crunch. Expressive arts usually take a while, and with classes, depending on the class size, there’s a certain amount of video tapes you need to watch . . . I often find that I’ll do some of each.” In
addition, Alex stresses the importance of flexibility when supervisors choose creative/expressive arts for practicum students. They can prepare extra components just like counselors do.

Having multiple avenues. You might have a sand tray available, but you also have your paper markers and pens available or puppetry. I don’t want to say the word “toolkit,” but the idea that if you talk to a client, they might gravitate towards art, well then you wouldn’t say: “We’re going to do a sand tray.” You would do the approach that they’d like. Sometimes I may even just put some crayons and scissors and paper on the table and say to people, “Now as you sit down and as you notice that there’s paper and scissors, what are your reactions to the paper?” Some people say, “Oh, it looks like we’re going to have fun,” and some people say, “Oh my gosh, I know you’re going to ask us to do something that’s going to make me uncomfortable.” Let’s talk about that, when did you first feel those things and either the fun part that it’s going to be fun or the part about uh-oh they’re going to ask me.

All participants talked about students having different cultural backgrounds and unique personal histories. Lisa stressed supervisors needing to consider students’ cultures and being sensitive to cultural components differing from those of supervisors. Emily also shared her view of multiculturalism and diversity in practicum supervision and counseling:

I think that perspective couples nicely with multiculturalism. We look at a variety of cultures, and we’re just slowly now coming around to understanding how diverse needs really play an impact in the process of being successful. It would be silly to think that we all would express in a similar way.

Sarah always checks herself to determine if she is caring too much, if she is “teaching her, guiding her too much like a mother, but she [the student] realizes that’s not my role. I have to make sure to be more conscious that I’m a counselor educator not the mother.” Sarah notes that the process of an activity is as important as the final product. She suggested supervisors be sensitive, pay attention to the process, and notice various emotions and expressions in their expressive art work, just like in talk therapy.

It’s just process and Play-Doh and crayons. It’s exactly the same as talk expression. Sometimes you see the pain, and you have to be very sensitive to that. Then be ready to
process with supervisees. I think that sensitivity and respect of the product is also important but also attention to the process not only the product.

Sarah provides tips for supervisors to process student art work. She challenged supervisors not to link symbolic expression to real life unless their students do that voluntarily.

I don’t push usually but [I ask if] they can just talk about it at a symbolic level instead of linking expressive arts to the real life of the supervisee. I can just talk about “a bear is here” and then eventually about sand tray. “This little baby is here. It seems like this baby is alone and nobody’s taking care of this baby.” I can just say in symbolic expression “that’s something to do with my supervisee.” I don’t need to say, “Is this your experience?” Sometimes I see the resistant stare. They just want to talk about the baby even though that expression is actually about the supervisee’s experience. If I see the resistance, sometimes I just stick to that symbolic expression.

Category #3: Supervisory Process
How do supervisors perceive the supervisory process as a result of using creative/expressive arts?

Supervisors in this study shared their perceived supervisory processes when using creative/expressive arts. Six themes were derived from the collected data: supervisory relationships from practicum memories, building trust and safety, supervisors’ roles, quality of supervisory relationship and readiness to express, challenge and support, and culture/language in the supervisory process.

Supervisory Relationships from Practicum Memories

Interviewees vividly remembered their own practicum programs and how they felt when seeing their first clients, although they did not remember who their first clients were. These supervisors reported that they felt vulnerable and doubted their qualifications to be a professional counselor. Additionally, all said they worried too much, causing a high level of anxiety. These
memories inform their understanding of their students’ vulnerability and help them empower their supervisee with various kinds of creative/expressive arts in practicum.

As a practicum student, Alex really wanted to do a good job for his clients, although he did not have enough counseling skills.

As a student, I remember being very nervous, anxious, and worried. I wanted to do a good job, but I felt like maybe I didn’t have the skill set. In my experience, my first couple sessions, it’s just a matter of surviving. I did a lot of my practicum at an elementary after-school program. I learned quickly that with kids, you can’t just talk to them and respond back. So, my first experience was learning to figure out creative approaches to interact better with children.

Ann remembered two different supervisory relationships from practicum. Her first supervisor only used talk, without any creative ways or expressive arts, in supervision. She was anxious and discouraged for two semesters, and her self-confidence was low. In her third semester, she had a new supervisor “who fit me better, my personality, and was much more nurturing, much more open, and less critical. It was a process.”

Lisa recalled feeling fear, anxiety, and nervousness and being overwhelmed by lots of responsibility in her practicum. However, she said she the vulnerability she experienced was offset by a supportive peer group.

I remember a small cohort. We were in a family therapy program and I remember how we all talked about how afraid we were to get to that a place in the treatment, but how much we had learned from that. I think I felt a lot of responsibility. I felt fear. I felt that anxiety about whether I was going to remember everything to check off all the boxes.

Emily remembered her practicum supervisor with a Native American background and person-centered approach.

We would sit in a circle. As I look back now I go, “Okay, I see what he was doing then.” At the time I thought, “Is there no structure to this thing?” I’ve got the Anglo WASP,
“We need to be productive here,” and there’s a way to show that you’re productive. I certainly didn’t show that, but I just sat there going, “This is different.” I felt like there was some credibility to what this person was doing. I couldn’t quite figure it out yet, but I felt like, you’d learn eventually to trust the process.

Jenny remembered having a sense of strong sense of universality and cohesion in her practicum memories.

We had a counseling center where we were recorded and did scribing, and so you were really held accountable for your technique and for your theory. It was a huge learning curve, and the responsibility for the client was very heavy at first, and then you figure out where you’re supposed to be, and you love the work. For me, it was a spiritual experience. There’s a lot of individual attention. There’s a lot of community just inherently built into the process.

Practicum Supervisors’ Roles

Regardless of supervision theory, all participants agreed they take on various roles in using creative/expressive arts in practicum supervision depending on supervisees’ needs.

Teacher Role: All interviewees mentioned using the teacher role as supervisors and shared their own way to teach their students. Alex believes supervision is a microcosm of the counseling relationship and a supervisor’s job is to model counseling skills and provide examples in supervision, contending his “job is to do exactly what a counselor would do with my supervisees for them to get the best out of my supervising.”

Lisa teaches students how to use creative/expressive arts as therapeutic tools for clients by demonstrating strategies in supervision. At the same time, she uses creative arts for supervision purposes, she is also introducing tools they can use with their clients because sometimes they get stuck. She brings miniatures, crayons, and markers, noting that students who
are initially resistant or doubtful let down their defenses when they see clay, Play-Doh, or crayons.

Jenny stressed that supervisors should be a role model as a clinician working with clients. She believes that students can learn from them how to balance being vulnerable as a person and reliable as an expert.

I think that safety is a big deal both personally for students and also to model how to work with clients… I try to have a balance between being vulnerable to them and making mistakes and modeling that and also being reliable and credible as an instructor.

Sarah actively teaches students by reviewing, practicing, and role playing until they get enough skills. She also demonstrates how to use creative/expressive arts for clients in practicum class.

I’m using it to help you understand yourself better, but at the same time, I’m introducing some of the tools you can use with your clients because when we start to talk with clients, sometimes you get stuck with talk therapy. Sometimes clients will be resistant, but their defense goes down a lot when they see clay, the Play-Doh or crayons. That way I’m making it a little more educational for my practicum students.

Mike takes on a teacher’s role when using a new creative/expressive art technique in practicum class. He provides instructions on the new skill and a solid understanding of why they are doing that.

they’re not used to this new creative thing that may be a little outside of the box, and I make sure I educate them on what the purpose is, give them instructions, and give them a solid understanding as to why we’re doing it. [I] kind of take a back seat and then gently facilitate and process the outcome.

Jenny shared that her main goal is to teach how to use expressive arts by modeling how students can make activities meaningful for themselves.

I start with a sixteen-week curriculum, and I plan on introducing various interventions throughout that sixteen weeks so that they have more tools to use with their own clients.
creative expression has been such a wonderful tool for my own work with clients that it’s more about modelling back to new counselors.

Ann said about modeling: “Whatever I do, I am aware I am modeling for them. I am modeling openness to the process. I am modeling being grounded, being calm.” Emily explained, “The modeling I will do is maybe how to facilitate a group. I’ll have like the talking stick, that kind of stuff, or I’ll model facilitating a group. ‘Suzanne, that sounds a lot like your client,’ or ‘I think that’s really interesting that in your sand trays, you both have this, this, and this. Maybe you guys can talk about what that… Just facilitating those connections.”

**Counselor Role:** Although participants were aware they cannot counsel their students, they also admitted that they sometimes take a counselor’s role to help practicum students manage their emotional reactions to their counseling sessions, including countertransference. Sarah said:

> It’s going to be a rocky road for them anyway and I can pave the road, but they can go through the rocky road. I think that’s the most important. For internship one and two, I always give plenty of time to check-in with them at the beginning of practicum. How are you doing? Then they all just share a lot. A lot of crying in my class from feeling incompetent as a counselor but also their personal lives are affecting them becoming a good counselor. They process a lot, and I on take a lot of the therapist role in that. Then also, they become very cohesive. As students, they usually bond by the end of the semester.

Alex explained supervision and supervisors’ role by comparing with counseling:

> I often times look at supervision as a microcosm of the counseling relationship. My job is to do exactly what a counselor would do with my supervisees, in order for them to get the best out of my supervising.

Alex added how practicum supervisees challenge each other based on the trusting relationship they develop by the end of semester:

> Typically, toward the end of the semester, the students are more likely to challenge one another. It's kind of cool, because our practicum classes only have six people because CACREP max is six. At that point, most of these students know each other pretty well, they've had a lot of time with one another. It depends, every class is different, but this
class I had this semester, they're a really tight unit, so they really were able to challenge where it felt safe to do so. Safe to be challenged.

Sarah also explained that using creative/expansive arts is significantly useful when it helps students see themselves focusing on their own needs rather than the clients’ needs:

Then for that, the expressive arts really, really help me. I think the expressive arts works best with that purpose because oftentimes they don’t know they’re focusing on more their own needs rather than client’s needs… They care about the clients, but sometimes their needs proceed the client’s needs. Just talking sometimes helps, but I think that expressive arts is a quicker way to bring the awareness to that.

Similarly, Ann pointed impacts of practicum supervisees’ thoughts and feelings on sessions and help them be aware of them:

I want to be very careful that I am not becoming their counselor, but I really want them to become very self-aware. Knowing what's going on, what comes up for them in their thoughts and their feelings and so on. How do the clients impact them? Everybody has ideas about what they think it's going to be like. Then you actually get there and then there's the reality of actually seeing clients.

**Gatekeeper Role:** In addition to the counselor role, participants explained the practicum supervisors’ gatekeeper role. Sarah contended that “we can use expressive arts to reveal the deficits in the students who may not be a good candidate for counselor. Expressive arts provide the ability to evaluate the supervisee’s potential. I think expressive arts has a good potential to be used as a tool to screen.” Sarah added:

I realized that even these supervisees, there might be somebody who can't process the information symbolically and those people are not good candidates for expressive art. If they can't do that, they shouldn't be in this field, but I wasn't thinking that way when I started just started teaching. I was like, "What's going on?" His tray is so fake. If they can't really catch subtlety, nuance, or symbolic expression metaphors, even in talking to his clients then the therapy is not going to be very effective.

Also, Ann explained how to play the gatekeeper’s role in practicum supervision:

That's when I talk to them individually or I have them see me and we talk individually. I refer them to a counselor or make sure they are in counseling themselves. Because we also have that responsibility as counselor-educators of gate keeping.
Jenny said:

I’m a gate keeper. They know I’m not only there to support them but also to make sure that they are working towards their counseling profession. I mean I tell them that I’m there to be supportive and knowledgeable and as a collaborator in their experience. I don’t say that I’m grading them, but I think it’s implied because it’s a master's program.

Establishing a Trustful Relationship and Safe Environment

All participants stressed trustful relationships and safe environments are necessary when using creative/expressive arts in supervision. Alex believed creating a safe environment to help students feel comfortable using expressive arts is the supervisor’s job.

Lisa shared her thoughts about the factors that influence the process of practicum supervision with the creative/expressive arts:

The biggest one would be that individuals would have to feel protected and safe. That they know even if they do something they feel exposes them in some way they don’t like, that they don’t have to share it. That this is more for themselves than for me.

Sarah had also witnessed that creative/expressive arts help her provide a safe and comfortable place for her students.

I feel like I am not a threatening person, but students are still nervous and scared. When I show crayons and markers and Play-Doh, they’re like a kid – we get to play today. In that moment, I can see their defense goes so much down. They’re already feeling safe and comfortable.

Emily hoped that creative arts in supervision provide another dimension of understanding; rather than just verbal and emotional feelings, she says students experience a physical feeling that encourages being in the present and aware. Emily used creative/expressive arts as a buffer in the supervisory process and catalyst for conversations a safe way.

I always think that creative and expressive arts provide a buffer, the catalyst for conversation … I think that provides the environment for that person to say, “I’m putting
this here, and I’m putting it out there. I’ve done what I can do, and so you as my colleagues can choose to respond.” I think the creative and expressive arts provide a safe way for people who care to share. Yeah, I definitely think there’s a connection there.

Jenny provided a safe room using creative/expressive arts for her students to make mistakes and learn from their mistakes.

I wouldn’t let a student be grossly incompetent, but to a certain degree there’s a lot of wiggle room. There’s a lot of room for them to explore and to make mistakes and to recover from mistakes and to find themselves. As a counselor educator, I spend a lot more listening than I thought I would, and I give them time to grow. I think of them as very young, and they’ve got to crawl before they walk.

Mike believed an appropriate level of supervisor self-disclosure can enhance the supervisory relationship. Once he has a strong relationship with supervisees, they can take more risks while using creative/expressive arts for students’ growth, in that supervisor’s self-disclosure “can facilitate the relationship potentially and grow a stronger bond.”

Jenny noted that fostering a deepening supervisory relationship helps students do more and work better with their clients. She contended that “any time you can deepen the relationship here, you’re doing a good thing.” Sarah explained the importance of building supervisory relationships and creating safe supervision. She says she has witnessed that the connection among students and with a supervisor happened more often when using creative/expressive arts than during talk supervision.

[Creative/expressive arts] also help us to connect being playful together and smiling at each other. That happens more often in expressive arts than just talk supervision. It definitely it helps me create a safer environment with the supervisees. I can see their defense goes so much down. They’re already feeling safe and comfortable. When they feel that way, they can be a bit more honest to themselves. They get help from those expressive art to create that environment. Expressive arts are helpers for my supervisees.

Alex stressed the importance of safety nets in using creative/expressive arts in practicum classes by explaining:
If you think about the student coming in, they have to feel, “Hey, this is a safe place for me to try something out, not always get it right, but also be true to my experience.” Without that safety net, you might get a student who might do a creative approach just because they’re trying to show you that they can do this, but it’s not truly them, and then the lesson learned is lost, and authenticity is lost I guess.

Jenny shared how she helps her students gain confidence in practicum class.

My real focus is to really support them. They just need to gain confidence, and I can help them with that by being very relaxed and reassuring them. My own teacher used to call it the fluffy sandwich feedback. You put the thing that was done well on either side, and then in between you put the place where you can grow more.

Ann explained how she encourages her students to take risks and make mistakes. She believes that creating a safe place is crucial for students’ professional growth because

Practicum students are also afraid to make mistakes and they’re afraid to take risks. They really usually want to impress me as a supervisor-instructor, so we talk about that. I try to give them permission. Of course, you have to be ethical, but to be themselves and that this is the time, this is the safe place to make mistakes.

Jenny shared the two goals she has for her practicum students. First, she wants her students to “take risks [and] trust their gut to. They just have to implement it, and they need space and permission to not do it perfectly, but to keep striving.” Her second goal is to continue that process of personal work [they] really need to maintain to be an ethical counselor.

Lisa added that “the biggest goal would be safety. Individuals have to feel protected and safe and know even if they do something they feel exposes them in some way they don’t like, they don’t have to share it, that this is more for themselves than for me.” Mike also emphasized the importance of building strong relationships with students.

To grow a stronger bond, especially depending on maybe the level of self-disclosure on the part of the supervisor. I think once you’re able to have a strong relationship, then you can be more risk taking with trying out new creative supervision techniques, because your students trust you more.
All participants shared their supervisory relationship experiences and perceptions. Alex explained how the supervisory relationship can be changed over the semester.

At the beginning of the semester I am not extend a hot topic; however, toward the end of the semester, students feel safe enough to challenge each other because most of these students know each other pretty well, [and] they’ve had a lot of time with one another. It depends, every class is different, but this class I had this semester, they’re a really tight unit, so they really were able to challenge where it felt safe to do so.

Alex described the benefits of using creative/expressive arts for practicum students to build a safe and comfortable relationship. He said that “using expressive arts allows everyone to get better insight to the other students’ world, which helps formulate strong relationships within the classroom.”

Ann suggests supervisors should provide a lot of guidance and encouragement for vulnerable practicum students by focusing on what they are doing well and doing hard. She emphasizes:

Practicum students tend to get very overwhelmed. I see them as needing lots of guidance and lots of encouragement. Really pointing out those things that they’re doing well and really pointing out that when you see that they’re putting in a lot of effort helps them gain confidence.

Lisa explains how expressive arts lead to rich communication, meaningful experiences, and a sense of spirituality necessary for trustful supervisory relationships in practicum supervision.

Creative/expressive arts can help expressive communication, sharing, and introspection. It can also offer a deep and meaningful experience between two people. … I think supervisees can reflect on themselves, their strengths, and their hopefulness which can lead to a sense of self versus spiritual beliefs and values.

Sarah welcomes students when they want to come to her office to do sand tray, noting that sometimes they come to the office and say, “Hey, doctor. Can I use your sand tray room? I
want to make a tray.” I don’t go with them. I don’t process with them. They come just individually and then they stay in the room and create the tray.”

Mike shared that creative/expressive arts can strengthen the supervisory work and alliance but noted that “it depends on the conditions that you’ve already put into place in the very beginning such as creating ground rules, providing a disclosure statement, [and] clarifying the expectations of supervision.”

Jenny shared what she has learned from using creative/expressive arts, stating that “it helps deepen relationships between counselor and client and counselor and supervisee and counselor and student and student and student, so any time you can deepen the relationship here, you’re doing a good thing.”

Sarah shared that a supervisee had described Sarah’s role as a mother in her sand tray activity, and Sarah realized:

I may teach her, guide her too much like a mother and discipline her, but she [the student] realized that’s not my role. I have to make sure to be more conscious that I’m a therapist not the mother, though that’s a good awareness for her to have by looking at the tray.

In addition to supervisory relationship, peer relationship also emerged:

Sarah believes peer support is important in practicum and after graduation. She shared how practicum students become cohesive throughout the semester. Sarah also asserted that encouraging peer relationships is as important as teaching counseling skills.

They become very cohesive and usually bonded at the end of the semester. Some of them even keep that peer relationship after they graduate and then do peer supervision, peer consultations. Helping them make that support system as a counselor.
Developing Self-Awareness for Growth

Participants acknowledged that they incorporate creative/expressive arts into their supervision for practicum students’ professional and personal growth. Sarah, Alex, Ann, and Mike shared how creative/expressive arts impact their practicum students’ growth. Sarah shared a powerful experience from graduate school during which she witnessed the power of creative/expressive arts. She had expressed her language issues as an international student by making an alien without a mouth. By sharing her experience in the group process, she saw herself differently and made a big change in her mind at the end. She said:

It’s a miniature alien, but I wanted to make a little face to make it a mouth and I was putting on a figure, but I couldn’t make it stick to the figure that I made. I just gave up and decided not to put a mouth. My supervisor was watching it, and then she wanted me to volunteer to process what I was making in front of the group. I started thinking about my experience through that. That was a super powerful moment for me because it was a daily struggle that I never shared with most of the people in the program. The figure really gave me a window show this is my experience inside. At the end, she asked me, “Is there anything you want to do with this figure?” I saw a red marker and said, “I’m just going to draw a mouth on it instead of making a face and trying to stick it on.” I just drew a big smiley face on that figure and then it felt so empowering. Now it has a mouth. Now it’s smiling. That’s going to be my future and finish the processing. That was just really, really empowering. It really helped me process but also express something deep inside. That’s how I was introduced to expressing my thoughts.

Alex stressed that creative/expressive arts helped to meet the practicum goal, which is preparing students to work independently with clients by building self-awareness and trustful relationships with clients. He stated that using creative/expressive arts helps students see themselves and be who they are and provides understanding of what it is like.
to build a relationship where you trust the client, and the clients feel like they can trust you. You learn not just the way to do the approach, but you also learn multiple facets. Throughout the process then, you find out maybe about yourself that you might not have known, which then leads you to be better in the room with your clients. The hope is that it starts sparking this idea of self-discovery throughout. I think our program talks a lot about, not only, when you become a counselor, do you learn this skill. You have to learn how to be you. I think expressive art’s the kick start to that.

Ann shared she allows students to be imperfect. She encourages them to reflect on and learn from their experiences working with clients.

I almost tend to use more expressive arts once they get past practicum. I wonder if it’s because the reason I do that is in practicum, they’re so much needier. I have to make sure that they’re at least not doing any harm to their clients. It just takes the time. You don’t have enough time to do maybe all the things I’d like to do. Increase their awareness of themselves, their client. It gives you more material to work with than just words.

Ann also stressed the importance of self-awareness.

Most people are attracted to this field because of their own personal issues in some way. Not everyone who comes into a counseling program has experienced counseling themselves. Of course, I believe they should, but not everybody does. And not everyone’s going to have a good grasp, or there’s going to be a variety of how well they resolve their personal issues and how aware they are of their blind spots. Using expressive arts can be a way for them to address their blind spots or their personal issues.

Participants reported practicum students grow through Aha-moments. Using creative/expressive arts facilitates students’ insight, reflection, and self-awareness. Participants admitted the process was slow, but they felt students grow personally and professionally. Mike shared how creative/expressive arts can facilitate insight and create self-awareness, so students can have a different perspective when conceptualizing cases.

Creative arts and expressive modalities access parts of the brain that students normally wouldn’t think about. They create different insights and perspectives about whether it’s conceptualizing the case or understanding how the student is being affected by the client as well as if there’s any counter transference or whether they can empathize with their client.
Jenny said students can have numerous insights and eye-opening moments from their creative expression without supervisor interpretation or direction: “I don’t have to tell them anything. I don’t have to interpret their own creative expression. They can get their own insight from that experience and that’s really wonderful work for them.”

Alex identified that students can get insight and develop relationships through creative/expressive arts, which he noted is the key for professional growth. Similarly, Lisa shared her favorite techniques to facilitate student insight and reflection. “Sometimes I have them do drawings; a picture of them and their clients in a room shows me what it looks like when they are with their clients. It gives a lot of insight, and the other piece of it is reflective, so you want the other person to look at it and say.”

Sarah shared that she often uses expressive arts for students to reflect on and be aware of and shared an example from her practicum class:

I ask them to just imagine your client’s world based on the sessions that you had and then we process that. Sometimes I ask the supervisee to pick their figure and to put their figure in a sand tray. I go, “Where do you think you are in terms of client’s world?” They like that. They have a little bit deeper understanding of their client’s life when I do that, expressive art on sand tray.

Sarah shared another example of a student’s awareness of the instructor’s taking on a role as a mother through sand tray. Sarah had grown up in a family in which she did not have a mother. She admitted she felt close to her student who did not have a very supportive mother, but she also realized that she was almost trying to take on a mother role rather than a counselor role to this student. By seeing the figure that student created and where she placed those figures, the student brought an awareness to Sarah.
Self-Care and Professional Growth

Ann stressed that self-care is a crucial part of professional growth and she applies what she teaches to herself:

I don’t want the whole process to wear me out. Whatever I do, I am aware I am modeling for them. . . . I use a lot of this [creative/expressive art] for myself personally and therapeutically to process clients. I love all things creative, all things art. I recharge myself. I love to paint. That’s my kind of thing, and I love to journal.

Ann also shared her own experience from her doctoral program where she used visual arts as a form of self-care. She said it worked for her personal and professional growth.

During my doctoral program, I had a supervisor that used visual art. I loved it. I found it to be very valuable. So much learning and personal growth. That was my one time during the week that it also became a form of self-care. It can be a stress reliever for them [the practicum students] because they don’t have time to recharge. They learn things about themselves. It increases their self-awareness and they learn things about their clients.

Lisa also uses creative/expressive arts for self-care. She asked, “If we really believe that to be healthy, joyful and important, then why not do that in supervision and why not do that for ourselves?” Lisa also shared her own way to use creative expressive arts for self-care, which she contended is valuable enough to model to practicum students.

Perceived Students’ Experience of Growth

Participants shared observations of and student feedback related to creative arts in practicum supervision. Ann described student feedback:

They find it [creative/expressive art] very helpful. It [making arts in practicum class] can be a stress reliever for them because they don’t have time to recharge [during the semester]. It [expressing with creative/expressive arts] can be part of their self-care. They learn things about themselves. It increases their self-awareness, and they learn things about their clients.

Alex shared student responses.
Some students really like [creative/expressive art]. Some students like it less, and I’m trying to gauge why. Some supervisees like things different ways. Students bring in not only what they’re experiencing in the field, but they also bring in pieces of them that they’re experiencing. I feel that helps build a better camaraderie because students feel like they get to really know other students.

Lisa has observed that “people always hesitate a little bit at first. They get worried that they’re going to reveal something they don’t want to. As we get into say the fourth or fifth time doing the activity, they’re actually more eager to actually share with each other.” Sarah noticed some students might be hesitant at first, but once they creative/expressive arts, they enjoy the experience. Mike shared that students

usually find it very helpful because it helps them to critically analyze their clients’ case in maybe a more in depth and intentional manner than they may have not otherwise done. This can also awaken and align them. It also can maybe decrease anxiety a little bit. There’s something soothing in just drawing sometimes or listening to music.

Similarly, Jenny shared that most of her students enjoy doing creative/expressive arts and are inspired to use them for their clients.

**Growing in Group: Trust the Process**

All participants used creative/expressive arts in a group format and/or in triatic supervision as well as individual sessions. They have witnessed practicum students getting feedback and insight from their peers and providing support for each other’s professional growth. Emily shared:

Typically, our class meets as a group, and then for practicum, we really do an excessive amount of supervision, but I think it’s a good. I think it’s not a bad thing. I do group supervision, and then I do triadic with creative/expressive arts. There’s the occasional person who would be an individual. That’s not necessarily my preference. They do receive individual supervision at their site, so all of our students do triadic and group.

Mike explained:
In group supervision, I typically do more creative arts because I think it can be impactful using the group and having them follow up and reflect on the activities with one another. However, with case conceptualization, I can do it in both group and individual or triadic, but I typically do this individually pretty consistently. And in triadic supervision, I use this pretty consistently as well.

Sarah explained how practicum supervisees develop special relationships as a result of group supervision. She said “Then also, they become very cohesive. As a student, they usually bonded at the end of the semester and they don’t . . . A lot of students actually request to keep the class together and then move on.”

Sarah added long term peer relationship and group supervision:

They feel connected because they support each other too. I think that's the ... Some of them even keep that pure relationship after they graduate and then do it at the peer supervision, peer consultations. Helping them make that support system as a counselor. I think that's also very important in practicum in addition to again, teaching skills and watching videos and all that.

**Embrace Different Cultures: Beyond Culture and Language**

Ann stressed that art is universal and noted that creative/expressive arts can be a powerful tool to express oneself regardless of culture and language. She noted that she has had some students from different countries in Africa and contended:

It makes sense to use art because art is universal, right? They come here and it’s culture shock. It's very different for them. There’s also the language barrier. They may struggle with their English, expressing themselves, but they can express themselves through the art.

Lisa also agreed the benefit of using creative/expressive art in diverse counseling and supervision. She said, “I think it [creative/expressive art] works better than relying on language.”

Similarly, Jenny explained using creative/expressive art can help supervisors know more and about supervisees’ cultural related information:

The multicultural kind of model that you think about when working with students and so the big takeaway for that is to not make assumptions, so one person’s creative expression might say something to me that maybe I don't, that I need to check in with. I try not to
make assumptions, because I don't know. . . If the two of you sat down and did a project together or did a sand tray or did a photography session or did a soundtrack. You get more information, you know? You get more data, basically, about your supervisees and your clients or your class when you do expressive art, so it’s kind of a safe thing as well and it normalizes that relationship.

Alex firmly believed that expressive arts can help students who have a second language express themselves better.

My assumption is that it would be helpful, especially working with students who have a second language and might have a hard time coming up with a particular word. My assumption would be that expressive arts often bridges the gap. You’re looking at something or creating something that you then can talk about. Maybe words that are abstract words or not accessible.

Supervisors’ Learning Experience and Growth

Supervisors overseeing practicums experience personal and professional growth through creative/expressive arts with students in their supervision, although they did not expect or plan to. Alex explained:

To be yourself, you have to be willing to be silly sometimes, too. That really helps students realize that you’re relatable and that you are reliable. Students feel like they can come talk to me, and they feel that I’m somebody that has the door always open and a person to talk with. I think that the use of expressive arts in class demonstrates that, because they can learn it and do it.

Similarly, Lisa “learned that creative/expressive arts can help expressive communication, sharing, and introspection. It can also offer a deep and meaningful experience between two people.”

Summary

The purpose of this study was to explore supervisors’ experiences and perceptions of using creative/expressive arts in practicum supervision. The findings revealed four categories of
themes and sub-themes (see Table 4.3). The participants used a variety of techniques, including drawing, painting, visual arts, music, journal writing, drama therapy, guided imagery, sand tray, and puppets. Second, participants seriously considered their practicum students’ unique needs, their own supervision models and theories, and ethics in the decision-making process when using creative/expressive arts in supervision. Third, participants’ supervisory processes when using creative/expressive arts included supervisory relationships from practicum memories, building trust and safety, supervisors’ roles, use of challenges and support, culture/language in the supervisory process, and students’ readiness to express their perceptions. Fourth, supervisors incorporated creative/expressive arts into supervision for practicum students’ professional and personal growth by developing the students’ self-awareness for growth, promoting self-care and professional growth, perceiving students’ perceptions of the creative/expressive experiences, growing in group: trusting the process, and expanding the supervisors’ learning experiences and growth.
Table 4.3

Four Categories of Themes

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Creative Intervention</th>
<th>Decision-Making Process</th>
<th>Supervisory Process</th>
<th>Professional Growth</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Visual Art: drawing, coloring, making, and painting feelings and experiences about clients and themselves</td>
<td>• Integrative Supervision Models/Theories</td>
<td>• Supervisory Relationships from Practicum Memories</td>
<td>• Developing Self-Awareness for Growth</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Music: listening music and watching music videos, and Using lyrics expressing themselves or clients</td>
<td>• Ethical Considerations</td>
<td>• Supervisors’ Roles</td>
<td>• Self-Care and Professional Growth</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Journal Writing</td>
<td>• Changes Needs Over Semester: Art Techniques/ Class structure</td>
<td>• Establishing Trustful Relationship and Safe Environment</td>
<td>• Perceived Students’ Experience of Growth</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Play/Sandtray</td>
<td>• Suggestions for Using Creative/Expressive Arts in Practicum Supervision</td>
<td>• Peer Relationship</td>
<td>• Growing in Group: Trust the Process</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Embrace Different Cultures: Beyond Culture and Language</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>• Supervisors’ Learning Experience and Growth</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CHAPTER 5
DISCUSSION

The purpose of this study was to explore supervisors’ experience and perceptions of using creative/expressive arts in practicum supervision to identify how supervisors utilize creative/expressive arts to empower practicum supervisees and optimize their professional and personal growth. The interviews gathered information to answer the question “What do supervisors perceive as the effects of creative/expressive arts methods in supervising practicum supervisees?” with the following sub-questions:

1. What creative/expressive art techniques do supervisors use in supervision for practicum supervisees?
2. What is the decision-making process for supervisors using creative/expressive arts in supervision?
3. How do supervisors perceive the supervisory process as a result of using creative/expressive arts?
4. How does incorporating creative/expressive arts into supervision affect practicum supervisees’ growth?

Through semi-structured interviews, seven participants described their experiences and perceptions of using creative/expressive arts in practicum supervision. Four categories of themes emerged through this investigation. First, participants employed various creative/expressive techniques, including drawing, painting, visual arts, music, journal writing, drama therapy,
guided imagery, sand tray, and puppets. Second, supervisees seriously considered a variety of supervision models, theories, and ethical considerations in deciding which creative/expressive arts strategies best met supervisees’ unique needs supervisees. The third category, supervisory processes, represents a significant part of practicum supervision and includes supervisory relationships, building trust and safety, supervisors’ roles, use of challenges and support, culture/language in the supervisory process, and supervisees’ readiness to express perceptions. Finally, findings suggested ways that using creative/expressive arts facilitated practicum supervisees’ professional and personal growth: developing self-awareness, promoting self-care, perceived supervisees’ experience, and growing in group supervision by trusting the process, and expanding supervisors’ own learning experience and growth. In Chapter 5, I discuss these findings as well as limitations and recommendations for future research.

Creative Interventions

The first research question sought to discover what creative/expressive art intervention participants utilized in practicum supervision. A basic framework for creating best practices for practicum supervision using creative/expressive arts emerged as a result from of this study. Findings showed that participants used various forms of creative/expressive arts for their practicum supervision based on their experiences as clinical supervisors. Participants used easy, fun, and creative ways to encourage supervisees to express themselves, to help them release their anxiety, and to see their self-growth.

Participants described a variety of creative/expressive art techniques utilized with supervisees in practicum. Findings showed using creative/expressive resources facilitated the
learning process of practicum supervisees and their self-reflection on counseling sessions (Schuck & Wood, 2011). Practicum is a great opportunity for supervisees to grow professionally and personally by applying counseling skills with real clients (CACREP, 2015), but supervisees often hold back from disclosure due to anxiety, self-consciousness (Skovholt & Rønnestad, 2003), and fear of being judged as less skillful (Fitch & Marshall, 2002). Supervisees may think that if they reveal weaknesses to their supervisor, they will fail practicum. In the situations described in this study, the participants used fun and creative art techniques to help their supervisees reduce anxiety and increase vigilance to more freely explore and increase self-awareness without feeling defensive. For instance, as Sarah shared, when her supervisees saw crayons, markers, color papers, scissors, clays, sand and figures, and puppets, at first, they thought these tools were “weird” and might not be appropriate for clinical supervision. However, once they touched those playful materials, they enjoyed all of the items like children would. Through fun activities, supervisees’ anxiety can dissipate, and supervisees can feel more free to be authentic and growth-oriented. Supervisees express themselves though art work not to show themselves off to others but to see and understand themselves better and grow more.

In line with the Association of Counselor Education and Supervision’s (ACES, 2014) best practices, all participants demonstrated a variety of interventions in practicum supervision. ACES recommends that intentionally selecting interventions based on an assessment of supervisee a) developmental level, confidence, self-efficacy, and learning style; b) clinical and supervision contexts; and c) client needs. Therefore, the supervisors use of creative/expressive arts in practicum supervision can improve supervisee counseling performance and skills, case conceptualization, self-awareness, and professional behaviors. Findings found participants using
different art techniques in different ways but all sharing a common purpose: to optimize supervisees’ professional growth in preparation for professional counseling.

All participants described the benefits of using creative/expressive arts for practicum supervision that align with prior research. As Hodges (2011) found, practicum supervisees experience a breadth of emotions, such as enthusiasm, anxiety, anticipation, and uncertainty regardless of how much classroom preparation they have had. Creative/expressive arts allow practicum supervisees to draw vulnerable feelings and clinical and personal experiences using lines, shapes, and colors. Through reflective and expressive works, supervisees can become aware of their strengths and weaknesses, and supervisors can better understand supervisees and their clients through the visual work. Supervisors can see what supervisees perceive and want in supervision as well as where supervisees are developmentally through the metaphors they create. Consistent with Malchiodi’s (2013) and Deaver and Shiflett’s (2011) study, participants believed expressive arts increases supervisees’ self-expression, active participation, imagination, and mind-body connection. This study’s findings identified that various creative/expressive art techniques enhance the capacity for reflection in supervisees and increase the supervisees’ self-awareness, including case conceptualization skills and processing of countertransference and reducing supervisee stress.

**Visual Arts**

Previous research indicated using symbols or pictures in supervision can assist in projecting supervisees’ perceptions of their inner and outer reality (Lahad, 2000; Meyerowitz-Katz & Ryde, 2007). In this study, the participants used visual arts in practicum to encourage
their supervisees to express their inner world in a visual way, which is helpful to see their own needs and issues. Through creative visual arts, the supervisees discover their strengths as a counselor as well as challenges to overcome in line with Degges-White and Davis’s (2010) findings. Participants reported that drawing and coloring helped practicum supervisees better express and see themselves holistically, especially where they are in terms of development as an emerging professional counselor. For instance, Emily used coloring and painting to encourage supervisees to express their feelings about relationships with clients and their week in general. Supervisees who participate in expressive arts activities can compare and contrast symbolic meanings and themes from their drawings and other creative supervisory expressions expressed from the beginning through the end of the semester. Through visual art conducted from the semester’s beginning to end, supervisees can see the changes, such as in their perceptions of cases, relationships with clients, and self-confidence as a counselor. Therefore, using easy, fun, and creative resources in practicum supervision can help supervisees’ self-reflection and self-awareness, which Malchiodi and Riley (1996) described as necessary for professional growth.

**Imagery**

The participants consistently believed using creative/expressive arts during supervision had a great value for practicum supervision. The participants encouraged their supervisees to use their own imagery to investigate their responses to clients. They described the process as developing their professional presence. The current study’s findings are consistent with Fish’s (2008), Moon’s (1992), Robbins’s (1988), and Wadeson’s (2003) research that suggested making images in response to counseling helps supervisees integrate art making into their professional
repertoire as well as better understand their confusion as a beginning counselor-in-training. This study also found the participants utilized arts techniques for supervisees to relax and open their inner world in a safe place.

When supervisees are open in supervision and look inside themselves, they gain insights about strengths as well as barriers that keep them from growing. Jenny used collage. She helped her supervisees visualize what they think, feel, value, and want. She encouraged supervisees to use magazines, newspapers, and found materials to create images to explore experiences. In this case, creating collages about themselves, their clients, and their families was another way to express and reflect their thoughts and feelings. Therefore, creative/expressive arts can be the key to becoming aware of their strengths and challenges and to work on what they need to grow as a professional counselor.

**Music**

Findings indicated music is a useful tool to help supervisees feel relaxed and safe by reducing supervisee’s anxiety. Alex, Jenny, and Mike used music in practicum supervision as a tool to share more than verbally expressed. Alex encouraged supervisees to bring music that inspires them or expresses their perceptions to help them find a way to promote self-care. Jenny also encouraged her supervisees to use songs as a soundtrack of their life stories, and Mike used music videos for practicum supervisees.

Consistent with this study’s participants, Ohrt, Foster, Hutchinson, and Ieva (2009) also described music videos as a tool to enhance empathy among supervisees and concluded that the practice of live music-making in supervisory contexts is beneficial on many levels. As this study...
shows, Harter (2007) identified music has the power of visual art to go beyond meaning that can be expressed by language. Also consistent with this study’s findings, Brown (2002) found that music can also be useful in music relaxation and visualization techniques for practicum supervisee. Brown used music to encourage supervisees to express and analysis of countertransference in counseling and supervision. Therefore, using music in a creative way can be beneficial for practicum supervisees to relax and recharge their physical and emotional energy (Bruscia, 2002). In addition, supervisees can reflect their feelings and thoughts with rhythms and sounds and express their clients’ stories with lyrics or music videos, which is an effective way of generating empathy. When using music, it is important for supervisors to be flexible and sensitive to supervisees’ culture, age, gender, and music preference.

### Reflective Journal Writing

Another creative/expressive resource for practicum supervision is writing. Journal writing reflects supervisees’ inner dynamics, and “continuous professional reflection” is “a central developmental process” as Skovolt and Rønnestad (1995, p. 6) described. The current study’s participants used journal writing as both an in-class activity and out-of-class assignment. Writing is simple and easy to use in practicum class and is a powerful tool to facilitate reflective thinking in practicum supervisees through the journal writing, as consistent with Griffith, and Frieden’s (2000) studies. Especially though visual journaling, practicum supervisees gained insight about their work and about themselves.

For instance, Lisa used journaling and drawing/coloring together to help her supervisees be more expressive about their sessions. Her supervisees could explore and reflect their positive
and negative thoughts and feelings about clients and themselves, supporting Lahad’s (2000) finding that writing enhances supervisee communication with themselves, clients, supervisors, and peers as well as develops self-awareness; Stickel and Trimmer’s (1994) finding that journal writing gives practicum supervisees heightened reflection on their clinical experiences; and Griffith and Frieden (2000)’s finding that writing about clinical experiences helps supervisees think critically and develop keener insights into assumptions and beliefs that can interfere with clinical judgments. The current study’s participants consistently perceived supervisees felt more comfortable expressing painful emotional experiences in writing than they would have in a classroom discussion. Therefore, this study identified writing reflective journals in practicum supervision was reinforcing supervisee learning while facilitating professional and personal growth.

Sand Tray and Play Therapy Approach

The participants reported play therapy techniques with supervisees was an effective way to explore the practicum experience, including anxieties, fears, concerns, roles, relationships, achievements, and growth. Being playful requires a certain amount of freedom and genuineness that does not come when supervisees are focused on pleasing a supervisor or saying the right thing. Instead playfulness is present when supervisees can be truly in the here and now with clients, as modeled in their here-and-now presences with supervisors. Being playful also requires a degree of risk-taking because it brings a greater likelihood of unpredictability.

Alex, Sarah, Lisa, and Ann utilized play therapy and sand tray in practicum supervision, such as picking a figure three times over the semester. Ann also let students create a sand tray
two times during the semester, so they could compare their perceptions, experiences, and professional development. This study identified the less predictable responses that come with playfulness allow for more genuine responses that can be discussed in supervision to increase professional development and enhance professional helping skills.

This link between less predictable play responses in supervision and increased supervisee development is consistent with Ray’s (2004) finding that play also facilitates client growth. The current study’s participants also identified that creating a world through playful approaches, like sand tray, helps supervisees enhance case conceptualization skills while exploring relationships with clients and their role in a client’s world, as Stark, Frels, and Garza (2011) noted. Lisa identified drama therapy as an approach that helps supervisees take on a client’s role by making a simple drama, like role play, consistent with Scholl and Smith-Adcock’s (2007) finding that the intentional use and processing of psychodramatic enactments allows for creative and spontaneous self-expression as well as increased engagement in the supervision process. Drama therapy approaches allow for a great deal of flexibility, an element that can be highly beneficial for supervision. Jones (2007) indicated drama therapists are able to consider a wide range of dramatic processes to help clients explore and process their current issues. In a dramatic context, practicum supervisees may consciously play the role of the client’s transference within dramatic reality to work through and bring awareness to that projection for the client. Similarly, from a supervision standpoint, supervisors may engage in the role of supervisees’ countertransference to focus students on what may be occurring. The overall objective is not to deny or purge these reactions but to play with them and better understand and manage them through dramatic media.
Creative/expressive arts can increase self-awareness for the practicum supervisees and enable greater understanding and insight into their professional development. This study identified practicum supervisors used easy, fun, and creative resources, such as visual art, reflective journal writing, music, and play therapy approaches including sand tray. These creative expressive arts facilitated the practicum supervisees’ self-reflection and professional growth, as prior research has demonstrated the effectiveness of using creative/expressive arts in counseling and counselor education (Ziff & Beamish, 2004). Therefore, it is important for practicum supervisors to actively seek creative and expressive resources they can use in practicum supervision by creating a list of art techniques and utilize them any time.

Decision-Making Process

The second question was to explore what participants considered when they choose creative/expressive arts for practicum supervisees. In using creative/expressive arts in practicum supervision, how supervisors choose techniques is crucial for the effectiveness of supervision. Every decision supervisors make should be intentional and effective for optimal supervisee growth. In the current study, the supervisors considered unique supervisee needs, supervisors’ supervision models and theories, professional ethics, and their own practicum memories when deciding which creative/expressive arts strategies to use as supervision interventions for practicum supervisees.
Unique Supervisee Needs

As ACES’s (2011) best practices model suggests, the participants considered their supervisees’ unique needs when using creative/expressive arts in class. The participants viewed supervisee resistance as a normal response to challenges, growth, and change because resistance is a common phenomenon in counseling as well as in supervision (Bernard & Goodyear, 2004; Carson & Becker, 2004). The supervisors dealt with supervisee resistance in productive ways by using creative/expressive arts interventions that were culturally appropriate strategies to guide, challenge, and encourage. To make wise decisions for the supervisees, the supervisors needed to understand their practicum supervisees’ vulnerability and, consequently, specific needs as this crucial developmental stage progresses. Therefore, the supervisors in this study emphasized choosing different creative/expressive arts to meet their supervisees’ changing needs as the semester progressed. For instance, at the beginning of semester, some participants encouraged their supervisees to think about who and where they are in their professional development. In the middle of the semester, some participants used creative/expressive arts to help their supervisees reflect on their sessions and their relationships with their clients and supervisors. Additionally, some participants gave supervisees time to listen to emotionally charged music, as Alex and Mike did. At the end, some participants used drawing to have their supervisees express and reflect on the entirety of their professional journey to that point.

Specifically, Alex believed practicum supervisees need safety to express themselves as they are and prepare for their first time working with real clients, so he chose the best creative/expressive arts techniques to meet those supervisee needs at that point. For instance, at the beginning of semester, Alex is more careful about how far to go in having his supervisees
express and share themselves through their works. He usually spends time for his supervisees to get to know each other in the initial weeks by building the class structure and focusing on paperwork questions, including logging information.

Similarly, Ann found that beginning practicum supervisees focused on their fear of making mistakes and taking risks, so she chose easy and fun activities at the beginning of semester, such as using visual arts including drawing, making arts, and sand tray. In addition, Ann believed expressive arts is a good way to process and wrap up the semester. When approaching the end of the semester, Ann asked each student to have a small tray and create a world about what they had learned during the semester. Creating sand trays can help the supervisees process and look at how they have grown that semester. Sometimes she had each student make two trays to look toward the future: one about the past and another one looking ahead. Through the work, Ann encouraged practicum students to set goals for their next step by asking reflective questions: Where do you see yourself growing? Where do you want to focus? Where do you see you need to grow more? Where are you now? and Where are you headed?

Lisa believed practicum supervisees need unconditional acceptance by supervisors and to feel comfortable with supervisors and peers. Lisa considers those needs, so she can help practicum supervisees prepare to be open. Lisa always goes back to the idea of presence in her practicum supervision and tried to be there and be emotionally available for supervisees. Jenny considered that practicum supervisees needed to gain confidence by being relaxed and reassured when she prepared creative/expressive arts for practicum supervision.
Changes over Semester

To meet the supervisees’ changing needs throughout the semester, the participants designed practicum class with different creative/expressive art techniques and with different class structures such as individual, triadic, and group formats. As Alex shared, at the beginning of semester practicum supervisors do not go deep in having supervisees explore themselves with creative/expressive arts, while Ann utilized more creative/expressive arts at the beginning of semester. She said, “I seem like I do it more in the beginning, or I have more time. Because I’m so more in the moment, every group of students is different, their needs and so on. It’s hard to plan.”

Practicum supervisors also chose different materials from the beginning toward the end: from the most controllable and familiar materials to the least controllable ones because supervisees feel safer when they can control what they do. Sarah also intentionally chose some fun and playful techniques at the beginning of semester to help the supervisees express themselves and to get to know each other. But once her supervisees started to see their clients, Sarah chose different techniques to allow the supervisees to go deeper like sand tray to express and explore themselves and do role playing to practice counseling skills.

In addition, Alex stressed flexibility as a major key in expressive arts supervision through having multiple avenues such as sand tray, papers and markers, recorded songs, and musical instruments. Alex’s approach is consistent with Borders and Leddick’s (1987) recommendation that supervisors choose specific interventions by synthesizing supervisee components – training goals, learning styles, experiences, and developmental levels – with supervisor factors:
theoretical orientation, supervisee goals, and own learning objectives for the supervisory experience.

**Supervision Models/Theories**

Supervision models and theories are an important component in participants’ decision-making while using creative/expressive arts. The participants framed their interventions in terms of discrimination, developmental, and respectful models as well as Gestalt, person-centered, and cognitive theories. For instance, Ann often chose experiential techniques based on her guidance theory, Gestalt, and she believed practicum supervisees could learn from symbolic experiential activities like visual art, journaling, and creative/expressive arts. Emily is person-centered, and she follows the discrimination model for supervision, which is congruent with her theoretical beliefs and values and supervision model. Emily used a lot of immediacy with the creative/expressive art techniques as well as provided the core conditions to optimize the practicum supervisees’ growth. Emily found that practicum supervisees are not aware of what they are doing, what they are saying, and how they are acting or responding. In addition to Rogerian, she used the discrimination model in practicum supervision, which provides flexibility in determining her role. For instance, a student may come in one week presenting one way, just like clients do, and the next week, they may come in and present very differently with a different issue or with no issues. Emily took on one of the roles from the discrimination model: counselor, teacher, or consultant, depending on supervisees’ immediate needs.

Although the participants sometimes chose similar creative/expressive techniques and strategies, the application (e.g., drawing, what to draw, and how to process the work) was
different based on their supervision models and theoretical orientations. Creative/expressive art
techniques can be used regardless of theory or model but take a different shape, meaning, or
intention based on a supervisor’s framework (Degges-White & Davis, 2017).

Consideration of Ethical Issues

In decision-making process, one of the most significant questions to the participants was
how to ethically use creative/expressive arts. As recommended by the American Counseling
Association (2016), the participants clearly understood the potential risks, benefits, and ethical
considerations of using creative/expressive arts in practicum prior to implementing any
supervisory interventions. The participants recognized ethical considerations exist in all
supervisory relationships, but the potential for ethical issues increases when utilizing expressive
arts in supervision because of the intimate processing that occurs with such modalities (Purswell,
2015). Therefore, the participants seriously considered ethical issues when using
creative/expressive arts in practicum supervision.

The participants made sure they were truly ethical to practicum supervisees by checking
if there was a boundary issue, including dual or multiple relationships (Hodges, 2015), which is
the most common consideration of practicum supervisors using creative/expressive arts. In
practicum supervision, supervisors take on counselor roles if needed as well as teacher and
consultant roles. For instance, Ann used a counselor role only when it related to what was
currently going on with their clients and themselves as counselors-in-training. Even if it was
related, she did not go very deep because she did not want practicum supervisees to feel like they
had to share something they are not ready for. The participants also considered establishing a
safe and permissive environment before attempting to use creative/expressive arts in practicum supervision because expressive arts techniques in supervision encouraged deeper self-exploration. This idea is consistent with what Crocker and Wroblewski (1975) and Mullen, Luke and Drewes (2007) noted in that using expressive art may create an ethically complex relationship between the supervisor and supervisee.

The participants considered practicum supervisees’ readiness and respected their hesitance in expressing themselves when using creative/expressive arts. For instance, Alex encouraged practicum supervisees to say “pass” if they did not want to share because it is not professional or ethical to choose creative/expressive arts based on supervisors’ preference and interest. All participants clearly were aware that supervisors and counselors did not use their supervisees and clients for practice in any situation and always checked themselves not to do this. Mike emphasized that practicum supervisors need to remember the purpose of practicum supervision when using creative/expressive arts.

**Effective Use of Limited Time and Space**

The participants considered what they needed to cover in the supervision class, the time they could use for creative/expressive art, materials they could access, the students’ readiness to express themselves through the arts, and the students’ needs at the moment. Then they decided which techniques might be most effective. In addition, the participants noted class environments are sometimes ideal for using creative/expressive arts, so they cover a myriad of didactic topics in a limited time while also allotting practicum time for the supervisees to express their feelings and thoughts and process the experiences through creative/expressive arts. As Weiser (1993)
noted, art material is different from verbal supervision and therapy. In creative/expressive arts supervision, various kinds of art materials are used to draw, paint, sculpt, and/or create a collage because they are easy to use, transportable, and accommodate a variety of supervision settings (Malchiodi, 2013).

However, the participants reported limitations to using creative/expressive arts in practicum supervision, such as limited time and space and lack of materials. As Alex shared that often practicum supervisors are suffering from a “time-crunch” because expressive arts take a while depending on class size. In addition, supervisees need to watch a certain amount of recorded sessions every week. Furthermore, practicum supervision contains numerous teaching as well as reflective components. Alex explained, “Often it’s hard to slide in a lot of the creative approaches at the practicum level because often needing that supervision that’s more ... the teaching part of supervision, versus the reflective part of supervision.” Nevertheless, the participants overcame these limitations and barriers to use creative/expressive arts by being flexible, creative, and realistic in choosing what to use and how to use them. They always had option B at any situation and focused on optimal supervisee growth no matter what kind of art technique they choose.

**Unforgettable Practicum Memories**

The participants shared how recollections from their own counseling practicum experience, referred to as unforgettable practicum memories, informed their current supervisory process. Although the participants’ backgrounds differed – counseling, play therapy, and couple and family counseling, they shared common memories. The participants recalled feeling
vulnerable, frustrated, and extremely anxious during their own practicum as well as overthinking actions and doubting their qualifications as a counselor, all of which impeded their ability to respond appropriately to clients. All reflected that these unforgettable practicum memories helped them deeply care about and empathize with the practicum supervisees, motivating the participants to empower supervisee growth by using anxiety-decreasing and safety increasing creative/expressive supervisory interventions like drawing, painting, sculpting, collage-making, music, dance, drama, journal writing, and play/sand tray. As an example, in practicum class, Sarah made an alien without a mouth and her supervisor encouraged her to share what she had created. Through the process, Sarah understood that she was feeling isolated in her class and frustrated in speaking English. At the end of the class, she finally drew a big mouth on the alien with a thick red marker, which felt so “empowering.” At that point, Sarah could overcome the negative feelings about herself. Recalling unforgettable practicum memories reminded the supervisors of the lived human emotional experience of practicum and inspired these participants to ensure supervision is a safe place to make and learn from mistakes, which are a normal and important part of professional growth rather than ignoring the emotional component of being a practicum supervisee and focusing on “not doing anything wrong?”

Ann also shared her unforgettable practicum memories. She experienced two different supervisory relationships in practicum. Ann felt intimidated by her first supervisor. Like most supervisees at the beginning of practicum, she felt anxious and discouraged by her low self-efficacy. In addition, she was very shy and very quiet. However, Ann’s second supervisor was nurturing, open, and non-judgmental, which was crucial to optimizing her growth and created safety and playfulness through creative supervision strategies. When she met her second
supervisor, Ann made progress. As a result of her practicum experiences, she realized a student’s professional growth can be different based on the supervisory relationship or the supervisor’s behavior, such as being intimidating vs. nurturing.

This notion is consistent with Tracey and Sherry’s (1993) research that identified supervisors in successful supervision were likely to respond in a friendly manner, while in less successful supervision, supervisors tend to ignore supervisees’ feelings or attempt to minimize supervisees’ responses. The unforgettable practicum memories the participants shared show how safe and trusting supervisory relationships are vital to supervisees’ growth. When using creative/expressive arts, practicum supervisors need to establish safe and trusting relationships between the supervisors and supervisees and among the supervisees. In this study, the participants utilized their own practicum memories to understand the practicum supervisees’ vulnerability and unique needs. They also used creative/expressive arts to build supervisory relationships crucial to expressing the supervisees’ feelings, expectations, strengths, and challenges because they already experienced all of them from their own practicum. In sum, when choosing creative/expressive art techniques, practicum supervisors consider a) practicum supervisees’ unique needs, such as their vulnerability, resistance, readiness, and emotional changes; b) changing needs over the semester with different techniques, different art materials, and different class structure; c) supervision models and theories, d) ethical issues, e) effective use of limited time and space, and f) unforgettable practicum memories.
Supervisory Process

The third question was to discover the supervisory processes the participants perceived and experienced in their practicum supervision. The following interpretations describe the supervisory process when using creative/expressive arts in practicum supervision. Three subthemes emerged: reflective process, practicum supervisor’s role, and trustful relationship and safe environment.

Reflective Process

As a result of using creative/expressive arts, the participants described their experiential and reflective processes in practicum supervision when using creative/expressive arts. One primary finding is self-awareness, which is crucial for professional growth and can be achieved through reflective processing within a trusting relationship in a psychologically safe environment (Bernard & Goodyear, 2009; Deaver & Shiflett, 2011). This idea is consistent with most art-based supervision literature (Bernard & Goodyear, 2009; Boyd & Fales, 1983; Deaver & McAuliffe, 2009; Deaver & Shiflett, 2011). Through using creative/expressive arts, the practicum supervisees could explore their countertransference, such as counselors a) reproducing clients’ artwork to empathize with their experience, b) making a piece that depicts the client, or c) drawing responsively during a session (Fish, 1989, 2008; Lachman-Chapin, 1987; LaMonica & Robbins, 1980; Malchiodi, 1996; Moon, 2000; Wadeson, 2003; Wolf, 1985).

The participants could identify whether their supervisees were aware of who they are (i.e., their strengths and weaknesses) and give them time to explore where their feelings come from and the impact on personal and professional lives. By using various creative/expressive
arts, Sarah helped her practicum supervisees reflect on themselves, what they need, and/or what is going on in their lives. Ann also encouraged practicum students to become very self-aware, although she is very careful about not becoming the students’ counselor. Ann noted the practicum supervisees can grow by knowing what is going on, what comes up for them in their thoughts and their feelings, and how the clients impact practicum supervisees.

Just as the participants utilized creative/expressive arts in their practicum supervision, Rossi (2010) explained the holistic reflective process of expressive arts supervision that occurs in four phases: a) initial reaction, b) arts engagement, c) reflection, and d) transformation. Degges-White and Davis (2010) found that the integration of expressive arts and creativity in supervision provides an opportunity to experience and see visuals of the reflective process during supervision and to enhance the vision. The participants explained that the reflective process in groups can be encouraged and facilitated by peers. In other words, only having more knowledge without reflection and self-awareness cannot move the supervisees to the transformation stage necessary for professional growth. Deaver and Shiflett (2011) concluded that incorporating creative art-based methods into supervision offers valuable benefits for supervisees, such as improving case conceptualization skills, developing self-awareness, facilitating awareness of transference and countertransference, exploring the supervisory relationship, reducing stress, and improving well-being.

Beyond using creative/expressive arts in practicum supervision as an anxiety reliever, practicum supervisors can facilitate the reflective process using Socratic questioning, journal writing, IPR, and reflecting group, as Griffith and Frieden (2000) suggested. To promote active reflection, asking Socratic questions (such as what are the relevant factors to be considered?
Why are these factors relevant? What are the potential costs and benefits of each action taken? What are the theoretical principles that support these conclusions?) may be more effective than providing a good answer. In addition, the IPR questions (Griffith & Frieden, 2000) include how are you feeling about the session at this point, what was the purpose of that intervention, what are you feeling toward your client, how are you feeling about yourself, and what do you wish you had said at that point.

**Practicum Supervisor’s Role**

Various roles have emerged in the supervisory process. Although practicum supervisors use creative/expressive arts with different counseling theories and supervision models, they all take on roles flexibly and intentionally to meet the supervisees’ changing needs: teacher role, counselor role, and consultant role. This finding is consistent with Bernard’s Discrimination Model (2009). The model is situation specific because supervisors respond to the particular supervisee’s needs and focuses such as intervention skills, conceptualization skills, and personalization skills. In addition, practicum supervisors take on a gatekeeper role and a facilitator role to protect clients and promote the reflective process of supervision with creative/expressive arts. This finding parallels prior research by Koltz (2008) that integrated creativity into supervision.

Williams (1995) also identified the role of the supervisor in creative supervision as teacher, evaluator, facilitator, and consultant. However, Chesner and Zografou (2014) added one more role, administrator, in that supervisors ensure a safe and appropriate space, time frequency
of supervision session and manage issues around attendance including frequency and punctuality.

**Teacher Role**

The participants taught basic counseling skills, building a safe and trusting relationship, and using creative/expressive arts effectively. The practicum students learned by observing supervisors, doing art work in practicum supervision, and experiencing their personal and professional growth over the semester. Alex taught students how to prepare sessions for clients using creative/expressive arts by demonstrating it in practicum class. The students understood they should have a rationale when choosing art techniques and have plan B just in case the client does not want to or is not ready to do it because flexibility is a major key in the expressive arts approach. Jenny also taught practicum supervisees about creative/expressive art intervention during the 15-week curriculum, so the supervisees would “have more tools to use with their own clients.” Sarah actively taught students by reviewing, practicing, and role playing until they developed enough skills. She also demonstrated how to use creative/expressive arts for clients in practicum class. Similarly, Moon (2000) defined the supervisor’s role as that of mentor and role model, contending that images created by the art therapy supervisor may support the development of empathy, dialogue, and the supervisory relationship.

**Counselor Role**

The most common role the participants reported was the counselor role. Practicum supervisors gave appropriate emotional support and opportunities for exploring their supervisees’
responses to clients, material, and setting, which Leach and colleagues (2013) define as the facilitator role. Practicum supervisors in this study used various creative/expressive arts to establish safe and trusting relationships with the supervisees and encouraged them to explore their thoughts and feelings about themselves and their clients without fear of being judged. The participants facilitated practicum supervisees’ opportunities to explore and be aware of their strengths and challenges to grow personally and professionally. The current study supports prior research about quality supervision that occurs when supervisors empathize with their supervisees, attend to issues supervisees bring up, and provide insight into supervisees’ clients (Shanfield, Mohl, Matthews, & Hetherly, 1992).

For instance, Ann is very careful that she is not becoming their counselor, but she also noted, “I really want them to become very self-aware. Knowing what’s going on, what comes up for them in their thoughts and their feelings and so on. How the clients impact them. Everybody has ideas about what they think it’s going to be like. Then you actually get there and then there’s the reality of actually seeing clients.” Alex strongly believed that using expressive arts allows the supervisees to gain better insight to the other students’ worlds. This was previously indicated by Purswell (2015), who explained that supervision facilitates learning through strengthening the supervisees’ ability to reflect on the therapeutic process and increase technical growth. Purswell empathized that supervisees should feel free to explore and examine potential feelings and thoughts regarding clients. As the participants noted, this openness promoted the best possible care for clients and expanded the supervisees’ repertoire within the context of a secure supervisory relationship (Purswell, 2015) as clients feel from counselors in sessions.
Consultant Role

The participants used creative/expressive arts when taking on the consultant role by collaborating with the supervisees while reflecting on the issues and exploring options rather than answers, intervening at a strategic rather than teaching level, as Leach and colleagues (2013) explained, to help practicum supervisees see whole picture and direction of their cases.

For instance, Mike used a fun and visual way for practicum supervisees when teaching case conceptualization. He consistently used case conceptualization on the white board with small word sticks of potential issues from cases. He reported it has produced “a good result.” When students feel stuck about their case, he moves around the different indicators of categories of symptoms and family history, medical history, presented problems, and strengths and has them fill in the gaps. In addition to the visual way, Mike used Socratic questions to encourage supervisees to see their cases in different ways. He believed asking appropriate questions is very helpful to guide practicum supervisees toward identifying some themes on the board and then presenting some sort of theoretical lens, some hypothesis, or some hunches as to what is going on. Mike found that his students have this ah-hah moment and it is pretty consistent.

Gatekeeper Role

The practicum supervisors took on a gatekeeper role through the creative/expressive arts. The supervisors as evaluators followed up on interventions discussed in previous sessions; monitored ethical standards and safe practices; gave feedback on areas of strengths and weaknesses in relation to theory, technique, and personal style; and confronted when necessary (Leach et al., 2013). The participants considered the supervisees’ physical and emotional
conditions through their art work and checked if they functioned well as a counselor. They also facilitated the supervisees’ reflective and critical thinking processes about themselves and their clients by inviting them to share their art work and using Socratic questions.

For instance, Ann emphasized the gatekeeper role and made sure the practicum supervisees were functioning well as a counselor every week by taking time to talk with her students in the practicum class. In addition, she invited them to her office and talked individually. She referred them to a counselor if needed one or made sure they were in counseling for themselves. She said it is because practicum supervisors also have a responsibility of gate keeping. Sarah noted expressive arts work can be used to evaluate supervisees’ strengths and weakness, although it is not the only reason to use creative/expressive arts. She explained how practicum supervisors can use expressive arts to identify the deficits in the students who may not be a good candidate for becoming a professional counselor. Sarah believed expressive arts has a good potential to be used as a screening tool and said, “I believe expressive arts has the ability to evaluate the supervisee’s potential.” Jenny admitted she is a gatekeeper as well as a counselor by saying, “They know I’m not only there to support them but also to make sure that they are working towards their counseling profession.”

These findings are consistent with the literature about supervisors’ roles in protecting clients from harmful counselors, both in the supervisees’ immediate counseling relationships and in the supervisees’ future practice (Bernard & Goodyear, 2009; Purswell, 2015). One major goal of a supervisor is facilitating the supervisees’ abilities to foster deep meaningful relationships with their clients and another one is gatekeeping, which is critical role for supervisors because they are often the last professional with frequent exposure to the supervisees’ clinical work.
Practicum supervisors have a responsibility to prevent unqualified individuals from practicing play therapy (Purswell, 2015). Therefore, practicum supervisors can utilize creative and expressive resources by taking various roles, not only a counselor role, but the teacher, consultant, and gatekeeper roles as well.

**Trusting Relationship and Safe Environment**

The last theme of the supervisory process is trust and safety. All participants agreed about the importance of developing a trusting supervisory relationship to provide a safe environment. Alex believed establishing trusting relationships and safe environments is the supervisors’ job. Emily thought the creative and expressive arts provides a safe way for people to share and feel connected each other. Lisa believed that the most crucial factor is safety to get a successful result when using creative/expressive arts in practicum supervision. She said, “I always feel there’s a greater degree of intimacy, of sharing, of closeness when we’re using the creative arts. That individuals have to feel protected and safe.” Sarah used crayons, markers, and Play-Doh to provide practicum supervisees a safe and comfortable place and atmosphere. Emily also used creative/expressive arts as a buffer in the supervisory process and a catalyst for conversations between a supervisor and a supervisee and/or among the supervisees. Jenny witnessed practicum supervisees can make mistakes and learn from them in a safe and trusting context.

Trusting and safe supervisory relationships are necessary for thinking, feeling, and self-reflecting without judgment or fear of penalty, as Edwards (2010) and Purswell (2015) emphasized. When using creative/expressive arts, practicum supervisors are responsible for creating a safe environment for the supervisees to examine the powerful emotions they
experience in sessions with their clients, allowing for greater learning and exploration for the supervisee (Edwards, 2010). This result means that practicum supervisors need to provide safe places with trusting relationships to effectively use creative/expressive arts. At the same time, playful and simple creative/expressive art techniques can be used as a tool to establish a safe and trusting relationship by reducing the practicum supervisees’ anxiety and fear of being evaluated and judged.

As a result of using creative/expressive arts, which is the answer for sub-question #3, the findings of this study revealed three kinds of supervisory processes when using creative/expressive arts. First, through creative/expressive arts, the practicum supervisors experienced reflective processes such as promoting self-awareness as well as exploring feelings and thoughts and their influence, countertransference, and case conceptualization. Second, practicum supervisors took on various roles when using creative/expressive arts such as the teacher role, counselor role, consultant role, and gatekeeper role depending on the supervisees’ needs. The participants stressed creative/expressive arts helped the supervisors to take on these roles effectively. Lastly, trusting relationships and safe environments are necessary to maximize the effectiveness of using creative/expressive arts. At the same time, this the result of using creative/expressive arts because the supervisees feel safe and trusting toward peers and supervisors through doing fun and easy art work together.

**Professional Growth**

The last question is about impact of using creative/expressive art for professional growth. Through creative/expressive arts, the participants experienced that their supervisees grow
personally and professionally by developing self-awareness and learning how to care for
themselves and how to grow together in the group. They also experienced that practicum
supervisees can grow when they overcome and go beyond culture and language by using
creative/expressive arts. During the processes, they learn professionalism by modeling of
practicum supervisors.

Self-Awareness and Reflection for Growth

The results show practicum supervisees can express and reflect on how they feel and
what makes them feel like that and understand themselves through the art work they created. The
participants believed that memorizing specific responses to given problems will never prepare a
counselor for the variety of situations and problems encountered in the field of counseling and
therapy. They suggested that other processes, like reflection with creative/expressive arts, are
needed to help students train for uncertainty. This is consistent with Griffith and Frieden’s
(2000) research.

Sarah’s “alien” is a great example of self-awareness and growth. Sarah’s supervisor
encouraged Sarah to share by providing a safe place and challenging her to explore what she
wanted to change on the alien. As a result, Sarah had an empowering moment. Similarly, as Alex
stressed, safe and trusting relationships are important for supervisees to see themselves as they
are. Just like what Sarah’s supervisor did, Ann also emphasized the importance of self-awareness
and allowed her students to make mistakes, which are good opportunities to see their challenges
and resilience. Ann did not expect her students to be perfect. Alex identified that to grow more,
students can gain insight and develop trusting relationships through creative/expressive arts.
Participants reported that students also perceived creative/expressive arts are useful as a stress reliever, a fun recharger, and a part of self-care. Some supervisees tended to be hesitant at first, but they later admitted that they enjoyed using art stuff.

Through the aha-moments the supervisees experience from their creative/expressive art works, they can see the strengths, weakness, challenges, and barriers keeping them from moving forward and growing professionally and personally. If the supervisees can be aware of their or their clients’ barriers, they can make efforts to overcome them. Reflection is the practice through which counselors continually examine the therapeutic process in increasing levels of complex understanding and evaluation, as the previous literature has indicated (Griffith, & Frieden, 2000; Mullen, Luke, & Drewes, 2007; Purswell, 2015). Reflective thinking involves identifying the facts, formulas, and theories relevant for solving complex and ill-defined problems (King & Kitchener, 1994). For practicum supervisors in particular, the utilization of reflective and experiential processes such as creative/expressive arts to facilitate growth in supervisees is important, so they communicate in nonverbal or metaphorical ways. Experientially familiarizing supervisees with expressive media helps nurture the multiple roles of a counselor by actively engaging supervisees in roles similar to their clients’. Practicum supervisors are able to demonstrate, teach, and refine the abilities of practicum supervisees through the use of expressive arts techniques (Mullen, Luke, & Drewes, 2007; Purswell, 2015). To optimize supervisees’ growth through creative/expressive arts, practicum supervisors need to facilitate supervisees’ self-awareness by encouraging them to explore and process their art work.
Grow Together Through Group Process

All of the participants’ group as well as individual supervision was consistent with CACREP requirements for practicum supervision in counselor education. The participants reported that as the semester progressed, practicum supervision group members constructed special relationships with their supervisee peers characterized by strong bonding. Art in peer support supervision – group or triadic – helped the supervisees feel safe, connected, and together. Supervisory peers, according to the participants, could challenge each other by providing constructive and authentic feedback about what they saw and felt through their art work. Sharing art work with peers helped the supervisees see perceptions and assumptions about themselves and their clients. By noticing similar themes in the art work, the practicum supervisees realized their peers had similar concerns, thus they could work to reduce anxiety. Sarah acknowledged that practicum supervisees become very cohesive and bonded at the end of the semester. Their relationships keep them connected even after they graduate, which is ideal for professionals. Sarah emphasized that having a support system as a counselor is very important in practicum because the students grow together.

This study supports prior research that group supervision and creative/expressive arts strategies not only reduced practicum supervisory time but increased the power of group dynamics (Hayes, Blackman, & Brennan, 2001), such as universality, empathy, peer feedback, reality test, safety, and peer support (Dagley et al., 1986; Goodyear, 1998; Kaul & Bednar, 1978) to enhance supervision effectiveness. As Hillerbrand (1992) found, practicum supervisees could more easily understand each other’s cognitive processes than those of an expert. Similarly, Power (2014) found creative/expressive arts in group supervision could help supervisees move
past rigidity, pressure to be right, and insecurity about authenticity. This research is consistent with the current study’s participants, who reported creative/expressive arts improved the supervisees’ professional growth by increasing self-awareness, reducing anxiety, improving understanding of self and client, and developing case conceptualization skills. Furthermore, when the current study’s participants used creative/expressive arts, group feedback was richer than using only verbal expression in practicum supervision. Therefore, group supervision with creative/expressive arts provided opportunities for supervisee growth through universality, vicarious learning, reflective processing, having different perspectives, group development, and enhanced awareness of different cultures, as is explored in the following theme.

**Embrace Different Cultures: Beyond Culture and Language**

The findings indicated that creative/expressive arts can be useful for diverse practicum supervisees, regardless of culture and language. Participants in this study helped the supervisees from different cultures and languages feel comfortable and connected with others through the fun and easy ways of expressing themselves in art work. One of the participants, who was born in a different country, experienced that creative/expressive arts helped her express herself and understand better about others. Obviously, verbal communication is a big part of counselor education and talk is still crucial in counseling and supervision, although many alternative ways have been developing in the field of counseling and counselor education in recent decades. However, using only verbal communication can be very limiting and challenging for foreign-born counselors and supervisees to express their thoughts and feelings in supervision. As Sarah disclosed, foreign-born supervisees speaking English as second language face many difficulties
in expressing themselves without fear of making mistakes in English and understanding clients and supervisors with different cultural backgrounds, which provokes anxiety. More importantly, these supervisees tended to minimize and underestimate themselves as having low self-efficacy as a result of constantly feeling frustrated while functioning as a professional. The participants reported that when using creative/expressive arts in practicum supervision, the supervisees were free from their age, gender, culture, and language. This is consistent with what ACES (2011) also states about diversity and advocacy considerations. According to ACES, supervisors should recognize that all supervision is multicultural and diverse and infuse multicultural considerations into their approach to supervision, including practicum. In an initial practicum, the participants introduced issues of culture, diversity, power, and privilege within the supervisory and counseling relationships, indicating these are important issues to be aware of and openly discuss, as ACES suggests.

Alex experienced that expressive arts helped supervisees who have English as their second language succeed in his practicum supervision. Ann believed art is universal. She witnessed that her supervisees from different counties experienced culture shock and struggled to express themselves in English but found they could express themselves through the creative/expressive arts. Furthermore, Lisa stressed that creative/expressive art “works better than relying on language,” while Jenny explained that using creative/expressive art such as doing a sand tray, a photography session, or creating a soundtrack can help practicum supervisors know more about the supervisees’ culture and help the supervisees feel safe to express as they are.

The results of the current study reflect Bernard and Goodyear’s (2009) research on the importance of discussing the many components of multiculturalism within supervision.
Considering racial and ethnic minority trainees’ unique needs (McNeill, Hom, & Perez, 1995), using creative/expressive arts can be a creative and realistic way to empower supervisees to express themselves freely and to promote their professional growth.

As this study confirmed, through creative/expressive arts, the supervisees could laugh, play, shout, and act joyful like a child no matter where they come from and what kind of language they speak. Over time, they can feel who they are, see who they are, and understand and accept who they are. This experience helps practicum supervisees grow professionally and personally. They do not need to have the same cultural background or speak the same language in art supervision; instead they can appreciate their differences and see themselves and others in a different way.

Modeling Professionalism

The participants identified that practicum supervisees can learn professionalism through the modeling supervisors do while using creative/expressive arts in supervision. Jenny stressed that supervisors should model what clinicians do and how to work with clients. She contended supervisees can learn how to balance being vulnerable as a person and reliable as an expert from supervisors. Through creative/expressive arts, supervisors can disclose their personal side and also can be a professional role model by demonstrating how to utilize art techniques for clients.

Modeling and observing is another way to promote professional growth. By experiencing the supervisory process, supervisees can learn what professionalism is and how to be professional as well as how to use creative/expressive arts in sessions with their clients. As a role model or mentor, supervisors can demonstrate how to choose art techniques, how to introduce them, and how to encourage supervisees to express and process the works. Also, supervisors
should model relationships between counselors and clients as well as how to create a safe
environment for those interactions when using creative/expressive arts.

Limitations

The limitations of this study include researcher biases, lack of diversity and a sample of
convenience.

Researcher Biases

My biases as a researcher, supervisee, and previous play therapist in South Korea may be
a limitation of this study. My cultural, academic, and clinical background, values, and beliefs
have influenced my perspectives. During each stage of research, my biases were monitored and
limited to confirm that my perspective would ensure trustworthiness and generalizability. While
working on the proposal for this research, I reflected on my perspectives and attitudes as an
individual and as a researcher to exclude personal influence. Before conducting the interviews,
the interview questions were thoroughly reviewed by the researcher and committee members to
eliminate leading or biased questions. During the interviews, open-ended questions and an
interview guide were used to maintain structure among the different participants. Furthermore,
the participants had an opportunity to review their data prior to analysis. Despite efforts to avoid
biased influences, underlying or unknown personal biases may have affected the findings.

To maintain objectivity in this research, I wrote reflective memos to separate my feelings
from the participants’ responses. In addition, I asked the participants to clarify my understanding
of what they said during the interviews. I also sent them the transcripts for member checking twice:
first to verify the interview data and second to solicit responses to the analysis. Finally, I frequently had my committee review the themes to avoid any biases I may have attributed to the findings.

**Lack of Diversity**

The lack of diversity in the participants is the second limitation in this study in terms of gender, race, and age. Five of the seven participants self-identified as female. Four of the seven identified themselves as Caucasian, two of them were Hispanic, and only one participant was Asian. There were no African Americans or Native Americans. In terms of their age ranges, five of seven are 35-44, one was 45-54, and another one was 65 or older. Therefore, it is not possible to compare experiences and perceptions of Caucasian practicum supervisors and those of supervisors of color or different ages. More participants with diverse race/ethnicities, gender, and ages may have provided a fuller perceptions and experiences of participants in using creative/expressive arts with diverse ethnicities, gender, and ages.

**Convenience Sample**

To recruit potential participants, I employed a convenience sample with reputational and snowball sampling methods. This involved advertising to individuals who provided connections with potential participants and counseling related organizations such as Association for Counselors and Educators & Supervision (ACES), the American Counseling Association (ACA), the American Art Therapy Association (AATA), and the Association for Play Therapy (APT). Then I individually contacted prospective supervisors who expressed their interest in this research to set an interview schedule. As a result, five of seven were members of APT. These
five participants may have had similar clinical and educational experiences and perceptions of using creative/expressive arts in practicum supervision. Another limitation associated with the convenience sample was that two participants graduated from the same doctoral. It might be more possible to share similar perceptions of using creative/expressive arts in counselor education than people who graduated from different counseling institution.

Implications

This research explored practicum supervisors’ perspectives about and experiences in using creative/expressive arts in practicum supervision. I offer implications based on the findings, analysis, and conclusions of this study. The implications that follow are for a) counselor educators, b) clinical supervisors, c) counselors-in-training, d) and counselor education.

Counselor Educators

The participants shared considerations gained through their clinical, research, and teaching experiences, providing suggestions and tips for using creative/expressive arts in practicum supervision that included choosing easily accessible art techniques, giving supervisees options, creating an atmosphere in which supervisees feel safe to express themselves, not looking for artistic talent in supervisees’ drawing skills, not having right or wrong ideas about how supervisees express themselves artistically, selecting materials from most- to least-controlled, being willing to try any interventions themselves first before asking supervisees to do so, giving supervisees the right to pass on any artistic interventions, always thinking about why
they are doing an intervention, maintaining flexibility and productivity, reflecting on multiculturalism in selecting appropriate interventions, not caring more than supervisees about the supervisees’ interpretations of the artistic interventions, and linking symbolic expressions from artistic interventions to their real life applications with clients.

**Give Supervisees Options**

When using creative/expressive arts in practicum, the supervisors need to give supervisees choices as to what kinds of materials they use and how much supervisees share or disclose through their artistic expressions and giving permission for supervisees to participate at the rate with which they feel most comfortable. In the first session, the supervisors can set the ground rules about working with and processing creative/expressive art interventions. Allowing supervisees an option to pass is also important. In this respectful manner, the supervisors can establish a safe and non-judgmental environment, which is crucial for supervisee growth.

**Ask Yourself Why**

Everyone has a need. As a person, a supervisor can have a need and unintentionally try to meet his/her needs in practicum class by using creative/expressive arts and sharing their art work without a purpose of helping the supervisees. Therefore, when counselor educators choose creative/expressive art techniques and plan class activities for practicum supervisee, they have to make sure they have a rationale for what to do and how to do in class. Using creative/expressive arts is not for fun, but for the supervisees’ professional growth.
Feeling Safe to Express

The supervisory relationship itself is key in using creative and expressive arts with practicum supervisees. Sometimes unexpected ideas and feelings can emerge when using creative interventions in supervision. Also, supervisees may find themselves uncomfortable with expressive interventions, as Mike noted in the interview. Supervisors need to allow appropriate amounts of time to get to know and build rapport with the supervisees for creative/expressive arts interventions to be effective. According to the participants, helping the supervisees feel safe authentically expressing themselves is more important than focusing on which art materials or techniques to use. To facilitate the reflective process, establishing a safe and non-judgmental environment is vital in using creative/expressive arts. For instance, Jenny tried to create a balance between being vulnerable to them as a person who makes mistakes and being reliable and credible as an instructor and a supervisor. Jenny believed this helps supervisees feel safe if they make mistakes in the practicum class and in sessions with their clients.

Be Flexible and Use Limited Time Productively

Practicum supervision requires covering a plethora of topics; supervisors cannot spend the whole time doing creative/expressive art work despite its numerous benefits for the supervisees. Mike and Alex noted the importance of flexibility in balancing creative/expressive arts interventions with the multitude of other practicum supervision demands and looking for ways to use creative interventions to address needs of the moment as they arise. In addition, Alex stressed the importance of flexibility when supervisors have creative interventions planned but
other issues and needs take precedence. In other words, supervisors need to be both prepared and willing to work with what was unexpected, similar to counselors working with clients.

**Every Supervisee Is Multicultural**

In practicum, every supervisee is multicultural, regardless of their race and ethnicity, because all have different cultural backgrounds and unique personal histories. Supervisors need to understand multicultural competencies in clinical supervision and be aware that art and culture are closely intertwined. Supervisees may feel differently expressing themselves through artistic means than they would through talk-oriented supervision. Supervisors need to consider supervisees’ cultures and be sensitive to differences from their own. For example, in the first class, the supervisors may have time to openly share their own cultural/ethnic background using creative/expressive arts such as photos and/or music videos showing traditional songs and dances. Through these times, the supervisees may share their cultural values, gender roles, and perspectives of counseling or being a counselor. They can greet others with the own way or in their primary language if it is different than the majority language. This gives supervisees a valuable opportunity to understand their peers and clients who have a different culture from them. This experience teaches them being different is not something bad or weird. If the class is not diverse enough, this time is still valuable because everyone is multicultural.

**Be Creative in Using Resources**

Although the time and space are limited, counselor educators’ creativity in using resources can be unlimited. Speaking of resources, everything around them in class and out of
class can be resources. Counselor educators can bring the students outside and learn from nature. Counselor educators themselves can be resources through their knowledge about counseling and supervision, teaching experience, clinical experience, and personal experience. In addition, their instinct, humor, and creativity can be great resources in practicum supervision. Counselor educators should be able to effectively and creatively use themselves as resources as well as materials and environmental resources.

**Gatekeeper vs. Supervisor**

Practicum supervisors need to balance between being a gatekeeper and a supervisor. A counseling practicum is required for master’s counseling students, which means, to graduate and to be a professional counselor, supervisees have to pass the practicum course. If not, the students cannot move to the next step in the professional journey. In this process, the practicum supervisors take on the gatekeeper role in that they evaluate the practicum supervisees and their evaluation is critical for their success. If practicum supervisees perceive the practicum supervisor as a gatekeeper rather than as a supervisor, it can be hard to grow. Because they feel unsafe and that they are constantly being judged by the supervisor, students need to understand the main purpose of the evaluation: It is to help students grow professionally rather than focus their weakness and fail them.
Be Brave Enough to Process

When supervisors see some issues in the supervisees’ art work, supervisors cannot counsel supervisees. The supervisors’ creativity and willingness to take risks can transform dry abstract ideas in any subject into memorable and engaging experiences (McAuliffe & Eriksen, 2010). Sarah, for example, suggested supervisors be prepared for intense supervisee emotions when using expressive arts interventions in supervision and be “brave enough” to process where those emotions are coming from, providing a growth opportunity for supervisees to deal with how unresolved personal issues are affecting their professional work. If needed, supervisors may need to refer supervisees to seek professional help if the personal issues continue to interfere with professional work with clients.

Not Looking for Artistic Talent

To alleviate pressure about supervisees needing artistic skills, the participants assured supervisees they were not looking for artistic talent by disclosing their own artistic shortcomings. Sarah, for example, disclosed to supervisees she “is the worst artist” and has difficulty drawing even stick figures. Alex also used himself as an example of a “horrible artist” by saying to supervisees, “I can’t draw anything, but I still try. The idea is not that you create the perfect drawing, it’s that you try to express what it is, and you’ll get a chance to talk about it.” As Lisa noted, supervisees tend to think there are right or wrong ways supervisors are wanting.
Therefore, supervisors need to reassure supervisees that creative/expressive art supervision is not related to artistic abilities but instead is a tool for communicating with self and others.

**Practice Interventions on Self Prior to Using with Supervisees**

Supervisors should try new techniques themselves to practice and experience the whole process first-hand prior to implementing the art process with the supervisees. In doing this, supervisors can figure out how to most effectively use new approaches for the supervisees. Alex stressed that supervisors should not use supervisees for practice, paralleled by supervisees not using clients for practice, saying “do the thing yourself first.”

**Self-Reflection on Motivation**

When using creative/expressive arts interventions in practicum supervision, the supervisors should reflect on and question their motivation for doing so. Ann, for example, emphasized supervisors should not use creative/expressive arts to meet their own needs and should always go back to reflecting on motivation for the interventions being used. Just as supervisors asked the supervisees to describe their plan for clients and challenge supervisees to explain why they chose an intervention, the participants encouraged supervisors to prepare a “plan B” in case supervisees are not ready or willing to engage in interventions. Mike said, “Regardless of what type of intervention we employ, we need to have a very clear intention and rationale for why we are deciding to introduce this intervention.” In other words, supervisors need to consider intended and unintended outcomes in their decision-making processes for selecting creative arts interventions in supervision.
Continuing Professional Growth

Maintaining professionalism is the supervisors’ responsibility. Clinical supervisors need to make efforts to grow professionally. Using creative/expressive arts looks fun and easy but choosing best art techniques for the supervisees and using them most effectively is necessary to optimize the supervisees’ growth. Supervisors should be highly encouraged to actively seek learning opportunities, to update their current and new skills, and to apply them in their clinical supervision. For instance, clinical supervisors can attend annual conferences workshops or webinars provided by counselor education and creative/expressive art-related professional organizations such as the Association for Counselors and Educators and Supervision (ACES), the American Counseling Association (ACA), the American Art Therapy Association (AATA), and the Association for Play Therapy (APT).

Counselors-In-Training

The participants seriously considered the practicum supervisees’ vulnerability and their unique needs. However, they stressed that challenging themselves to get out of their comfort zone and try something new to see themselves is critical to grow professionally and personally. Counselors-in-training need to accept themselves as they are, but at the same time, they still have choices about whether they make a change or not. The practicum supervisors in the study respected the supervisees’ readiness to express and see themselves. For instance, Sarah allows her students to come to her office and create sand trays anytime she is in the office.

In addition, the participants asked their practicum supervisees no to be afraid of making mistakes in sessions with clients and in supervision with supervisor. If they do not share their
mistakes and difficulties, the supervisor cannot help them. As a result, the counselors-in-training will lose the chance to fix it. Rather, counselors-in-training need to actively use creative/expressive arts to reflect and share their mistakes and weaknesses as well as their strengths. Furthermore, they do not need to be a great artist. They can be themselves.

**Counselor Education Program**

Considering the results about the benefits of using creative/expressive arts in practicum supervision, counselor education programs need to prepare supervisors/counselors-in-training to effectively use creative/expressive arts for their supervisees and clients by placing stronger emphasis on reflective and experiential learning processes. In addition, counselor education programs need to set standards and objectives specific to using creative expressive arts in supervision and/or counseling. Counselor educators need to have discussions with program coordinators and colleagues to raise awareness about the need to use creative/expressive arts and art work to create plans to overcome identified barriers, such as time to prepare and space and materials to use as well as curricula.

Counselor education programs need to provide creative/expressive materials as needed and encourage supervisors to be more creative and expressive when working with their diverse supervisees. To optimize the students’ growth, supervisors need time before practicum class to prepare for and after practicum supervision to process and evaluate the quality of the supervision. Counselor education programs need encouragement to work collaboratively with colleagues and provide peer supervision among practicum supervisors. Furthermore, counselor educators who are aware of the needs of using creative/expressive arts in supervision can provide
some guidance to inclusion by sharing how they incorporate creative/expressive arts in their counseling and/or supervision courses. The supervisors who are using expressive arts in their supervision need to be competent in facilitating expressive arts activities; thus, counselor education programs need to provide more chance to learn how to use creative/expressive resources as a tool of counselor education.

Future Research Recommendation

While working on this study, several future research topics emerged: a) creative/expressive arts for 16-week semester practicum supervision, b) creative/expressive arts for supervisees with different cultures and language, c) creative/expressive arts for self-supervision, d) creative/expressive art techniques for different level of development, and e) neuroscience in clinical supervision.

Creative/Expressive Arts for 16-Week Semester Practicum Supervision

First, the participants in this study demonstrated various creative/expressive arts for their practicum supervisees as well as how to choose art techniques and how to utilize them effectively and appropriately based on the purpose and the supervisees’ needs and readiness. However, the participants reported they face some challenges to use creative/expressive arts in in a 16-week semester, which is a limited time frame with many required objectives to cover, even if using creative/expressive arts is beneficial for practicum supervisees’ professional growth. Qualitative investigation of possible art techniques that practicum supervisors can utilize throughout the semester (at the beginning, the middle, and the end) may provide practical
information for counselor educators and supervisors. Gathering all the useful creative/expressive art techniques can allow practicum supervisors to use creative/expressive arts effectively as the semester goes by. Adding directions and materials with example activities for each technique can provide practical guidance.

Creative/Expressive Arts for Supervisees with Different Cultures

Research about using creative/expressive arts for supervisees with different cultures and language from supervisors may provide meaningful and practical information about multicultural counseling and supervision. The field of counselor education and counseling in the US is becoming more diverse in recent decades and exploring the supervisees’ experiences and perceptions of using creative/expressive arts in supervision may be helpful to understand the benefits and meanings of using creative/expressive arts for supervisees who have different culture and language from their supervisors. For instance, Lisa said, “Using creative/expressive arts is much than better than talk supervision,” and Sarah disclosed her lived experience of using creative/expressive arts as an international student. Considering the effect of creative/expressive art in a multicultural context of supervision, this research will be meaningful to supervisors and counseling institutions who want to recruit supervisees from different countries.

Creative/Expressive Arts for Self-Supervision

Experienced counselors or supervisors can use creative/expressive arts for themselves to reflect on their clinical and supervisory work and freely and safely express their experiences and perspectives. In this study, the participants revealed that counselor educators can grow personally
and professionally by using creative/expressive arts with students and/or by themselves. Ann reported that she personally uses a lot of creative/expressive arts to process her clients. She said, “I can't imagine my life not having the art in it. I love all things creative, all things art. It's what I'm very passionate about. I find it fun. It's what I like to do for my own. I recharge myself.” Lisa also shared that “if we really believe that to be healthy, joyful and important, then why not do that in supervision and why not do that for ourselves? Whenever I do training for example, I always do experience experiential work.” Therefore, qualitative research about how to use creative/expressive arts for self-supervision may allow professionals, who are not required to have supervision, to use creative/expressive arts to express, reflect, and care for themselves. They can express whatever they feel and think about their clients, supervisors, and themselves in their own work.

Creative/expressive Arts Techniques and Supervisees’ Developmental Level

The developmental model is closely related to what constitutes the best supervisor (Maunuson, Wilcoxon, & Norem, 2000). Creative/expressive arts can be used regardless of the professional developmental level of the supervisees, but the art techniques and materials need to be chosen based on the supervisees’ developmental level from the beginning student phase (Eriksen & McAuliffe, 2011) through retirement. As Purswell (2015) emphasized, considering the supervisee’s developmental level is essential for developing reliable supervisory relationships and to provide responsible and effective supervision. Qualitative research about investigating the use of creative/expressive arts for supervisees in different developmental stages may help to
determine the major factors of developmentally appropriate supervision intervention using creative/expressive arts and the best practices for supervisees’ optimal growth.

**Creative/Expressive Arts for Supervisees with Different Culture and Language**

As the field of counseling and counselor education is becoming more diverse, multicultural supervision has become a focus. Lee (2008) discussed the distinct experiences and challenges of international counseling students, including acculturation and cultural differences, language barriers, cultural perceptions, and transferability.

I would like to recommend a qualitative study exploring the experiences and perceptions of supervisees with cultures and languages different from the supervisors and/or peers through creative/expressive arts in supervision. The study may provide better understanding of what supervisees experience and how they perceive expressing themselves through creative/expressive arts. They may have different meanings and values of the art or play, levels of comfort using the art materials, and attitudes toward creative/expressive arts due to their cultural backgrounds and personal experiences – particularly, if the supervisee and supervisor have different primary languages. The creative/expressive arts can be another tool to communicate.

**Researcher Reflection**

I vividly remember my advanced practicum class in my doctorate. One day in the practicum class, I unintentionally drew a little girl in a small box without any window or door. She was alone and crying. When I saw the picture, my heart broke because I heard an inner voice that had been ignored for a long time. I suddenly teared up, and my tears started rolling down. I
realized the trapped girl was me. Through the drawing, I expressed an international student’s feelings of fear, frustrated, and isolation due to cultural difference, language barrier, and social isolation. Most practicum supervisees cannot express these types of feelings verbally because of fear of being judged and evaluated by their peers and supervisors. Supervisees need the ability to always be authentic, especially in the important growth experience of practicum. It took me a long time to realize that language is not the only way to communicate and become connected with someone, and we can learn from each other from being difference. Creative/expressive arts helped me express myself and reflect my barriers to overcome. Through those insights and aha-moments, I could grow as a counselor and as a person.

One day, when I stopped by my supervisor’s office to discuss something, he was on the phone, so I looked around his office and picked a miniature from his sand tray, a crying little girl. I did not need to verbally explain to him my situation at that moment. A little crying girl showed him almost everything he needed to know about me as his supervisee. Through this research, I have realized once again that creative expressive art is a powerful tool to communicate, teach, learn, and grow in counselor education and supervision as well as counseling and therapy.

Additionally, this study was meaningful because my American dream came true, which was being a counselor educator. I decided to be a counselor educator 10 years ago in 2008. After two years, in 2010, I crossed the Pacific Ocean, from South Korea. When I finished my course work, I was passionate to figure out the best practice of practicum supervision using creative/expressive arts in a limited 16-week time frame. The interviews with the counselor educators and practicum supervisors were very rich and detailed, and I felt honored by how
much each participant was willing to share with me about their personal and professional experiences. They were eager to encourage and support me not only as a participant, but as a senior researcher and counselor educator. At the same time, I felt responsibility to convey their voice to the field of counseling and counselor education accurately and meaningfully.

Reflecting on the whole research project, I should say qualitative research is all about relationships. Since the time the invitation email was sent, the initial conversations among researcher and potential participants started. Following the many emails I sent to individual potential participants, some people replied, but most did not, so it was just one-way communication. Many respondents showed interest in my research, and some of them cheered me up by offering good wishes for my long journey, even though they did not meet inclusion criteria. The participants who took part in this study were humble, humanistic, and respectful, which framed the largest part of what I have learned from these participants and this project. When I sent emails to set the interview schedule, our relationship was already developing as we talked about my research topic, available times and dates, consent forms and demographic forms, and a thank you card. Those are all components of the process of rapport building and relationships, which are also what I found to be the most important aspects of practicum supervision. I have learned that the quality of a researcher’s relationship with the participants is closely related to the depth of interview, which is crucial for the quality of research. Relationships informed how open and how comfortable the participants would be with me. I am sincerely grateful to each participant for the time they spent from the very beginning of this study to the end. I also deeply appreciate them for their passion for encouraging a young researcher
and contributing to the field of counselor education by actively participating in this study. They all are great role models.

Conclusion

In this chapter, the findings were interpreted and compared with prior research. Data analysis generated four categories of themes and 18 sub-themes. Findings of this study indicate a) various creative/expressive art techniques used in practicum supervision, b) considerations practicum supervisors use to choose art techniques, c) supervisory processes engaged in when using creative/expressive arts, and d) supervisees’ professional growth promoted by using creative/expressive arts. Based on the findings from this study, implications were provided for counselor educators, clinical supervisors, counselors-in-training, and counselor education. Research recommendations were also provided. Future research topics include a) creative/expressive arts in 16-week semester practicum supervision, b) creative/expressive arts for supervisees with different cultures and languages, c) creative/expressive arts for self-supervision, d) creative/expressive art techniques for different levels of development, and e) neuroscience in clinical supervision.

This grounded theory research explored seven supervisors’ experiences and perceptions of using creative/expressive art in their practicum supervision. This qualitative study contributes literature about using creative/expressive arts for practicum supervision. Especially, this study contributed connecting neuroscience to creative/expressive supervision. Counseling and supervision effectiveness requires the integration of both right- and left-brain processing. According to Shipton (1997), the right hemisphere is concerned with unconscious information-
processing and, especially, emotional information-processing, and that it apprehends the world in a holistic, intuitive, and non-linear manner. Using creative/expressive arts can promote supervisees to use the right hemisphere and help them learn how to explore their feelings and thoughts about clients and themselves at the consciousness level, such as through countertransference, empathy, rapport, and supervisory relationship. Whereas the left hemisphere processes information sequentially, verbally, and rationally, such as case conceptualization. Also, this study identified new ways to communicate, perceive, and express as well as options and tools for teaching and supervision, and the process of learning from working in alliance with the supervisees and growing together. This study described enhancing relationships among the practicum supervisees and supervisors using creative/expressive arts, which is the key to successful supervision, and achieving supervisees’ personal and professional growth through the supervisory process.
REFERENCES


I agree to participate in a research project titled, Addressing Creative/Expressive Arts in Practicum Supervision: Experience and Perceptions of Counselor Educators, being conducted by Oksoon Lee, a doctoral candidate at Northern Illinois University. I have been informed that the purpose of the study is to explore counselor educators’ experience and perceptions of using creative/expressive arts in practicum supervision. Specifically, the researcher will first examine how counselor educators facilitate practicum counselors’ professional growth using creative/expressive arts. Second, the researcher will identify their processes of practicum supervision when utilizing creative/expressive arts. Third, the researcher will explore potential factors of creative/expressive arts attributed to the facilitation of practicum counselors’ growth by analyzing counselor educators’ experiences. Finally, the researcher will investigate counselor educators’ perceptions of using creative/expressive arts for practicum counselors’ personal and professional growth.

I understand that if I agree to participate in this study, I will be asked to provide brief demographic and professional information such as my education, years of experience, and expertise working with and teaching practicum students. I am aware that an individual interview will last for 60-90 minutes. I also understand that there may be an additional interview request for clarification and elaboration from the first interview for no longer than 20 minutes. Interview(s) will be recorded and transcribed for review and analysis.

I am aware that participation is voluntary and may be withdrawn at any time without penalty or prejudice, and that if I have any additional questions concerning this study, I may contact Oksoon Lee at los0118@gmail.com or (630) 360-7010 or Dr. Scott Wickman at wickman@niu.edu or (815) 753-9324. I understand that if I wish to gather further information
regarding my rights as a research subject, I may contact the Office of Research Compliance at Northern Illinois University at (815) 753-8588. I understand that the intended benefits of this study include the opportunity to provide valuable references for training, educating, and preparing practicum students by using creative/expressive arts.

I have been informed that potential risks of participation are minimal and are related to potential limits of confidentiality. I understand that all information gathered during this study will be kept confidential. I also understand that steps will be taken to protect my identity. I have been informed that I will have an option to use a pseudonym. However, my extensive knowledge and experience using creative/expressive arts in practicum supervision will be described.

All transcripts and associated records will be maintained on a password-protected computer. However, I understand that another researcher who will help with data analysis may access the transcript of my account. In this case, my identification will be removed from the transcript. Finally, I understand that my consent to participation in this project does not constitute a waiver of any legal rights or redress I might have as result of my participation, and I acknowledge that I have received a copy of this consent form.

Participant’s Name (please print): ____________________ Date: ____________________

Participant’s Signature for Research Participation: ______________________________________

Participant’s Signature for Consent for Audio Recording: ________________________________

Contact Number & Email Address: ____________________________________________________
APPENDIX B

DEMOGRAPHIC FORM
Please complete this form and send back to me via [email protected] prior to participating in the interview.

Age: _____35-44   _____45-54   _____55-64   _____65+
Gender: _____ Female   _____ Male   _____ Other (Please specify: _______________ )
Race/Ethnicity: ________________________________

What is your highest degree? Ph.D.  Ed.D.  PsyD.  Other ______________________________
What field is your degree in? ______________________________________________________
Number of years in the counselor education and supervision field: ______________________
Number of years in practicum supervision using creative/expressive arts: __________________
How many years have you taught in CACREP-accredited-counseling programs: ____________
Do you currently teach a counseling practicum class? _____ Yes   _____ No
If yes, are you teaching: _____ Full-time   _____ Part-time   _____ Adjunct   _____ Other
What department are you currently working in? _________________________________________
Which state do you currently work in? ______________________________________________
How many articles about creative/expressive art supervision have you published? (if available)
______________________________________________________________________________
What journals do you have creative/expressive art related publications in? (if available)
______________________________________________________________________________
What conferences have you presented on creative/expressive at and what was the title of your
presentations (if available)?
______________________________________________________________________________
How many years have you used expressive arts, playful interventions, or any creative methods in
practicum supervision? ____________________________________________________________
What counseling-related licenses or certificates do you hold?
______________________________________________________________________________
APPENDIX C

INTERVIEW QUESTIONS
Interview Questions

1. Tell me about your practicum memory?

1-1 How did you become counselor educator and get into creative/expressive art supervision since then? History & background?

1-2 Practicum students’ unique needs that counselor educators need to know?

1-3 What do you think the most important role of counselor educator when using creative/expressive arts in practicum supervision for students’ optimal growth is?

2. What is your supervision model besides creative/expressive art techniques? How did you incorporate your supervision model into creative/expressive art supervision? Did it fit well?


4. Semester Design? Over the course of a semester do your techniques change? If so, how do they change? And why?

5. What are some considerations when using creative/expressive arts in practicum supervision?

Multicultural Supervision? what about culture or race/ethnicity?

6. What is your goal for practicum by using creative/expressive arts? Anything else?
7. How do you think practicum students experience creative/expressive arts in supervision?

8. What forms of supervision (e.g., individual, triadic, and group) do you use to optimize the effectiveness of using creative/expressive arts in practicum supervision? Why?

9. What creative/expressive art techniques do you think have the best student results in practicum supervision? Anything else?

10. When you think about supervising practicum students using creative/expressive arts, what is an example that stands out to you as something that worked well? What did that look like?

11. Can you think of an example when creative/expressive arts didn’t work as well as hoped? What did that look like? Have you faced any other challenges? Anything else?

12. What did you learn from this experience? Anything else?

13. Finally, what would like to say to counselor educators, who newly try creative/expressive arts for practicum students? Anything else?
APPENDIX D

LETTER OF INFORMATION
Dear Counselor Educator:

My name is Oksoon Lee and I am a doctoral candidate at Northern Illinois University in the Counselor Education and Supervision program. For my dissertation requirement, I am conducting a qualitative research study under the supervision of my dissertation chair, Dr. Scott A. Wickman. My study is titled, Creative/Expressive Arts in Practicum Supervision: Experience and Perceptions of Counselor Educators. This study seeks to explore counselor educators’ experience and perceptions of using creative/expressive arts in practicum supervision. This study has been approved by the Institutional Review Board of Northern Illinois University (IRB Protocol #: HS16-0269; IRB Approval Date: 08/25/2016).

I am seeking participants with extensive knowledge of and experience with using creative/expressive arts in practicum students. If you meet the following criteria and would be willing to participate in this research study, please contact me directly. I can be reached at artsupervision0811@gmail.com or via phone at [phone number].

**Participant criteria:**
1. Have a recognized terminal degree in counselor education or a highly related field.
2. Have at least three years of experience teaching in counseling programs.
3. Have used active professional clinical supervision using creative/expressive arts, creative methods, or playful interventions in practicum supervision for at least two years.
4. Have accomplished at least one of the following:
   a. Peer-reviewed articles in a national journal on using creative/expressive arts, creative methods, or playful interventions in clinical supervision for practicum students.
   b. National or regional presentations about using creative/expressive arts, creative methods, or playful interventions in clinical supervision for practicum students.

Research participants will be asked an interview and to provide some available artifacts for data analysis. The interview will take about 60-90 minutes and will be conducted either in-person or through Skype depending on the location and availability of each participant.

**There are several potential benefits to participation:**

- You will contribute to the understanding of counselor education, specifically how practicum supervision is conducted.
- You will help to identify effective ways to use creative/expressive arts for practicum students who have unique needs.
• You will be asked to reflect on your own experiences as a counselor educator and your perceptions of using creative/expressive arts in practicum supervision; thus, expanding self-awareness.

Please consider forwarding this email to prospective counselor educators who may be interested in participating in this study. Questions regarding the study can be directed to the researcher at artsupervision0811@gmail.com or to my dissertation chair, Dr. Scott A. Wickman at swickman@niu.edu. Thank you so much for your time and your interest in this research!

Sincerely,

Oksoon, LPC, NCC, ACS
Doctoral Candidate, Counselor Education & Supervision
Northern Illinois University
Exempt Determination

25-Aug-2016
Oksoon Lee
Counseling, Adult and Higher Education

RE: Protocol # HS16-0269 “Creative and expressive arts in practicum supervision: Perceptions and experience of counselor educators”

Dear Oksoon Lee,

Your application for institutional review of research involving human subjects was reviewed by Institutional Review Board #1 on 25-Aug-2016 and it was determined that it meets the criteria for exemption, as defined by the U. S. Department of Health and Human Services Regulations for the Protection of Human Subjects, 45 CFR 46.101(b), 2.

Although this research is exempt, you have responsibilities for the ethical conduct of the research and must comply with the following:

Amendments: You are responsible for reporting any amendments or changes to your research protocol that may affect the determination of exemption and/or the specific category. This may result in your research no longer being eligible for the exemption that has been granted.

Record Keeping: You are responsible for maintaining a copy of all research related records in a secure location, in the event future verification is necessary. At a minimum these documents include: the research protocol, all questionnaires, survey instruments, interview questions and/or data collection instruments associated with this research protocol, recruiting or advertising materials, any consent forms or information sheets given to participants, all correspondence to or from the IRB, and any other pertinent documents.

Please include the protocol number (HS16-0269) on any documents or correspondence sent to the IRB about this study.

If you have questions or need additional information, please contact the Office of Research Compliance and Integrity at 815-753-8588.